LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS

By
Sarwat Nauman

Supervisor
Dr. Nasreen Hussain

Department of Education
College of Economics & Social Development

INSTITUTE OF BUSINESS MANAGEMENT

2018
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS

By
Sarwat Nauman

Supervisor
Dr. Nasreen Hussain

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of PhD in Education

Department of Education
College of Economics & Social Development

INSTITUTE OF BUSINESS MANAGEMENT

2018
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to thank a number of people whose consistent support made the completion of this dissertation possible.

First, I would like to thank Dr. Nasreen Hussain, who helped me to think out of the box and showed confidence in my abilities. She had the patience to listen to my ideas and assisted me to shape and execute those ideas in the most efficient manner. It was through her constant mentoring and monitoring that this research took shape of thesis.

I would like to next thank Dr. Irfan Hyder, Dean CBM and CES, who explained to me the background and requirements of AACSB in order to conduct this research.

I also want to extent my thanks to Mr. Khalid Amin, Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department, who provided me with the internship manual and documents as well as the essential information to conduct this research.

Finally, I want to thank my family, who were a source of unconditional and constant support for me and without their encouragement this extensive research work would not have been possible. My parents Dr. Sohail Aziz Khan and Talat Sohail were always there to pray for my success and were pillars of strength for me. My Husband, Nauman Zafar was instrumental in helping me maintain my sanity whenever I felt dispirited and low. My children, Hiba Nauman, Zouhair Nauman and Ammar Nauman had to endure my negligence at times due to the workload which came with this degree. I am also grateful to my sister Sana Waseem and brother Dr. Danish Ullah Khan for counselling and encouraging me when I needed it the most.
AUTHOR’S DECLARATION

I, Sarwat Nauman, ID # 14088 hereby state that my PhD Dissertation titled: “LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS” is my original work and has not been submitted previously by me in any version for taking any degree from anywhere else in the country/outside including IoBM and shall not in future be submitted by me for obtaining any degree/diploma from other University/Institution.

At any time if my statement is found to be incorrect even after my Graduation, the University has the right to withdraw my degree

Student’s Name: Sarwat Nauman

Signature and Date: ........................
PLAGIARISM UNDERTAKING

I solemnly declare that the research work presented in the M Phil Thesis titled “LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS” is solely my research work with no significant contribution from any other person/source. Small contribution/help whatever taken has been duly acknowledged and that complete thesis has been written by me.

I understand the zero tolerance policy of the HEC and Institute of Business Management (IoBM) towards the plagiarism. Therefore, I as an Author of the above titled thesis declare that no portion of my thesis has been plagiarized and any material used as reference is properly referred/cited.

I understand that if I am found guilty of any plagiarism in the above titled thesis even after the award of MS degree, the university reserves the right to withdraw/revoke my degree and that HEC and the University has the right to publish my name on the HEC/University Website on which names of students are placed who submitted plagiarized thesis.

Plagiarism includes copying published work without referencing, copying coursework essays/assignment/term report or submitting assignment done through hiring of ghost writer(s) for writing/solving the assignment(s) or submitting borrowed/copied or stolen assignment and claiming to be my own assignment/work including falsifying the results will be liable for penalization under the “IOBM POLICY ON PLAGIARISM”.

I confirm that I have read and understood the ‘IOBM POLICY ON PLAGIARISM’ and have fully understood what plagiarism is and equally important how to avoid it.

Student’s name in full: Sarwat Nauman

Student’s Signature and date:
FORWARDING SHEET

This is to certify that this thesis entitled as, “LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS” Submitted by Student name, ID number: 14088 towards the partial fulfillment of PhD degree in the department of Education has been completed under my supervision. I have gone through whole the thesis/dissertation and found satisfactory research work done in all aspects.

Dr. Nasreen Hussain

Supervisor/s Name: Signature: Date:

Note: Before signing this document, it is incumbent upon the supervisor to obtain a plagiarism check through plagiarism software prescribed by the IOBM. Prior to forwarding the thesis/dissertation to the External Examiner, the Supervisor must officially forward a copy of the plagiarism result (with less than 19%) and document on “IoBM Policy on Plagiarism” duly signed by the student to the relevant Dean, OGS, Examination Department and Registrar Office. The supervisor must ensure that these documents become a part of the official record in his/her Department, Library, and HEC Office. In this regard, the supervisor should make sure that s/he has gone through the whole thesis/dissertation and student has followed the IoBM guidelines and policies in all aspects including format and the language.
CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

This is to certify that research work presented in this thesis titled “LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS: A MODEL FOR GUIDED INTERNSHIPS” was conducted by Sarwat Nauman under the supervision of Dr. Nasreen Hussain.

No part of the thesis has been submitted anywhere else for any other degree as per the declaration submitted by the scholar.

This thesis is submitted to the Institute of Business Management in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of PhD in the College of Economic & Social Development.

Supervisor 1: Dr. Nasreen Hussain  Signature:

Supervisor 2 (if any) :  Signature:
NOTIFICATION

Reg No: 14088
Date:

It is notified for the information of all the concerned that Ms Sarwat Noman PhD Scholar of Economic & Social Development of Institute of Business Management, has completed all the requirements for the award of PhD degree in Education as per detail given here under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PhD in Education</th>
<th>Cumulative Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Registration No.</td>
<td>Scholar’s Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20123-14088</td>
<td>Sarwat Nauman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Research Topic: Learning Beyond Classrooms: A Model for Guided Internships

Local Supervisor-I Name:
University:
Address:

Local Supervisor-II Name:
University:
Address:

Foreign/External Examiners-I:
University:
Address:

Foreign/External Examiners-II:
University:
Address:

Detail of Research Articles Published on the basis of thesis research work:

Note: This result is declaration as notice only. Errors and omissions, if any, are subject to subsequent rectification.

Dean
Controller of Examination
Rector
OGS Office
EXAMINATION REPORT

Title of Thesis: Learning Beyond Classrooms: A Model for Guided Internships
   By
   Sarwat Nauman

This thesis is submitted to the Institute of Business Management in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of PhD in the College of Economics & Social Development

Examiners:

a. Name of External Evaluator -I ..............................................
   Designation: ................. ....
   University: ......................
   Address: .........................

b. Name of External Evaluator -II..................................................
   Designation: ......................
   University: ......................
   Address: .........................

c. Name of the Defense Examiner: ..............................................
   Designation: ......................
   University: ......................
   Address: .........................

d. Supervisor (as an observer) Name: ......................
   Designation: ......................
   University: ......................
   Address: .........................

Note: This result is declaration as notice only. Errors and Omissions, if any, are subject to subsequent rectification.

Signed and Stamped:

Dean

Controller of Examination

Office of Graduate Studies
ABSTRACT

In order to generate sufficient amount of human capital, the Pakistani business schools need to use internships as an experiential learning project but internships in Pakistan, in most cases, are not well structured. Therefore, the students, industry and the academia are unable to get maximum benefit out of this experience. Research conducted worldwide and world recognized accreditation companies such as AACSB and HEC Pakistan show that an internship will only be fruitful, if it is well structured and is designed according to the objectives and as an experiential learning activity. Research in this field in Pakistan needs to be conducted in order to assess how the internship programs can be made more productive and generate more human capital. Therefore, to give structure to the current business internship programs, the RFGHCI (Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships) model was developed and used in this research.

The RFGHCI model is based upon the models of systematic internship cycle, Kolb’s experiential learning cycle and DEAL model for critical reflection. The RFGHCI model explains how systematic internship education encompasses the whole experiential learning process. Furthermore, it acknowledges the development of human capital through internships that are truly experiential in nature. Using this model the students not only constructed their internship goals but also achieve them.

The procedure of this case study was in accordance with the procedure laid down by Creswell (2007) and was conducted in two phases, where in Phase I, individual interviews to understand the scope of problem from 10 interns - two from finance, five from management and three from human resource - who had completed their internships were conducted. These interviews gave me an insight into the problems that the interns face during the internships and their perception about the fruitfulness of this pedagogy. The results of these initial interviews were also important because not only did they give me data to make an internship manual but also helped me in chalking out the next phase of my research.
Phase 2 began with identifying the cases and getting in touch with them in order to get their consent to participate in the study. I met with the interns individually who consented to be a part of the study to share the internship manual with them. This helped them to understand and recognize the institute’s expectations from the six week long internship. These students were taught how to set internship goals for themselves and how to compose their reflections. Embedded data analysis was conducted using the data analysis framework of triangulation as the purpose was to look for the answers of the research questions.

This case study which was conducted the RFGHCI model concluded that internships according to the demands of AACSB are possible. The results of Phase I where the internships were less structured were different from Phase II where the internships were more structured through RFGHCI model. In Phase I, the interns complained that no real work was given to them and that they did not think that their learning at the internship was of much use; whereas, the results of Phase II revealed that the interns were able to recognize not only their learning at the internships but also their strengths and weaknesses. Business institutes in Pakistan need to structure their internships in order to make them more productive and to provide the industry with the much needed human capital. First, the institute needs to train and appoint faculty supervisors who must be responsible to ensure that all internships provided to the interns are well structured. Second, to provide human capital for the industry, business schools must connect with industry through internships and lastly, since reflections are central to any experiential learning project they must be used as an assessment tool by the institute.

The challenge for the academic institutions and their faculty is to incorporate experiential learning into the curriculum; without the much needed support from the institution, experiential learning will only exist at educational periphery and its promise of augmented learning will not be realized.

**Keywords:** Business schools, case study, experiential learning, human capital, internships, reflective learning
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ......................................................................................................................... ii
AUTHOR’S DECLARATION ..................................................................................................................... iii
PLAGIARISM UNDERTAKING .............................................................................................................. iv
FORWARDING SHEET .......................................................................................................................... v
CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL ............................................................................................................. vi
NOTIFICATION ....................................................................................................................................... vii
EXAMINATION REPORT ...................................................................................................................... viii
ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................................... ix
TABLE OF CONTENTS .......................................................................................................................... xi
LIST OF TABLES ..................................................................................................................................... xvi
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................................... xvii

1. CHAPTER ONE: Introduction ........................................................................................................ 1
   1.1. Background .................................................................................................................................. 1
   1.2. Experiential Learning .................................................................................................................. 4
   1.3. Internships: HEC Pakistan and AACSB .................................................................................... 7
   1.4. Purpose ....................................................................................................................................... 8
   1.5. Research Problem ....................................................................................................................... 10
   1.6. Operational Definitions ............................................................................................................. 11
   1.7. Research Method and Data Collection ..................................................................................... 11
   1.8. Rationale .................................................................................................................................... 13
   1.9. Summary .................................................................................................................................... 14

2. CHAPTER TWO: Literature Review ............................................................................................. 15
   2.1. Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 15
   2.2. Human Capital Theory ............................................................................................................. 15
       2.2.1. Economic Development Through Human Capital ............................................................... 17
       2.2.2. Education as an Important Variable of Human Capital ..................................................... 18
       2.2.3  Human capital in Pakistan .................................................................................................. 20
   2.3. Experiential Learning Theory ................................................................................................... 23
   2.4. Reflective Learning .................................................................................................................... 28
   2.5. Internships ................................................................................................................................ 32
4.3.1. Sub Question One: First Main Question ............................................. 81
4.3.2. Sub Question Two: First Main Question ............................................. 87
  4.3.2.1. The case of Mana and Beena: Finance interns ............................. 88
  4.3.2.2. The case of Anum and Maria: Marketing interns ......................... 89
  4.3.2.3. Missing links: The casees of Shoib, Waqar, Taha, Hina and Taniya ...... 90
  4.3.2.4. Reports according to reflections: Almas, Asim and Aqib .................. 92
  4.3.2.5. Intern evaluation form ............................................................. 93
4.3.3. Sub Question Three: First Main Question ......................................... 95
  4.3.3.1. Direct supervision ..................................................................... 96
  4.3.3.2. Democratic supervision ............................................................. 98
  4.3.3.3. Autocratic supervision ............................................................. 103
  4.3.3.4. No supervisor allotment ............................................................ 104
  4.3.3.5. Disagreement with the Supervisor ............................................. 105
  4.3.3.6. Communication gap ............................................................... 105
  4.3.3.7. Difference in the goals of the supervisor ..................................... 107
4.3.4. Sub Question Four: First Main Question .......................................... 107
  4.3.4.1. Task based internship ............................................................... 108
  4.3.4.2. Project based internship ............................................................ 109
  4.3.4.3. Rotation based internships ....................................................... 110
  4.3.4.4. Unplanned internship ............................................................... 111
  4.3.4.5. Internship period ................................................................. 112
4.3.5. The First Main Question ................................................................. 114
4.3.6. Sub Question One: Second Main Question .................................... 117
4.3.7 Sub Question Two: Second Main Question .................................... 119
4.3.8 Sub Question Three: Second Main Question .................................... 120
  4.3.8.1 HR Interns ............................................................................. 121
  4.3.8.2 Finance Interns ....................................................................... 122
  4.3.8.3 Marketing Interns ................................................................... 124
  4.3.8.4 Improvement in the Internships .................................................. 127
4.3.9 The Second Main Question .............................................................. 130
4.3.10 Summary ....................................................................................... 131

5. CHAPTER FIVE: Discussion ................................................................. 133
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Semi-Structured Focus Group Interview Questions (Phase II of the Research)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Introduction to the Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Internship Commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Faculty Supervision Guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Guidelines for On-Job Supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Reflective Writing Guiding Questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>Reflective Writing Rubrics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**LIST OF TABLES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Learner types and their characteristics</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Types of case studies and their characteristics</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Sample size and distribution</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Pseudonyms, Major and Interning Organization of Interns</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Goal Setting and Concrete Experience of the Finance Interns</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Goal Setting and Concrete Experience of the Human Resource</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Goal Setting and Concrete Experience of the Marketing Interns</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>The Relationship of Grades with the Report Written</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Interns and the Type of Supervision and Internships</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Jobs Offered to the Interns</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Kolb’s (1984) experiential learning cycle .......................................................... 5
Figure 2. The systematic internship cycle ............................................................................. 222
Figure 3. Relationship between Kolb’s experiential learning and learning style ........ 266
Figure 4. DEAL Model for Critical Reflection ..................................................................... 311
Figure 5. The Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships ......................................................................................................................... 3939
Figure 6. The five phases of conducting a case study laid by Creswell (2007) .......... 43
Figure 7. Data collection matrix .......................................................................................... 511
Figure 8. Data analysis framework through triangulation for case studies ............. 588
Figure 9a. Disconnect among stakeholders in internships in Pakistan ................. 1733
Figure 9b. Suggested intersect among stakeholders in internships ....................... 1733
1. CHAPTER ONE: Introduction

Internships in Pakistan are sought after by BBA and MBA regular students since Higher Education Commission (HEC) has made it fundamental for students to be a part of a six week internship program in order to receive their degree. HEC has recognized the importance of these internship programs and their direct contribution in human capital generation; nevertheless, HEC has not given any guidelines according to which the higher education institutes (HEIs) are to conduct their internships. This area is one of the least researched upon areas to-date and the usefulness of business internships in Pakistan have not been seriously taken and researched upon.

1.1. Background

Growth in human capital is what nations want to achieve worldwide and education is one of the indicators of human capital growth. “Human capital refers to the stock of educated adult people, which is the result of past education flows for younger adults in the more recent past and for older ones quite some decades ago” (Lutz & Samir, 2011, p. 588). Becker in 1960s gave a new concept of human capital, according to which, stressed that the sum of skills, knowledge, information, ideas as well as the health of individuals is human capital. Thus, the concept of human resources in form of capital shifted from tangible to intangible assets (Matchlup, 1982). This new concept at the time considered humans as assets, which forced governments worldwide to spend more on the welfare of its people in order to harvest human capital. Thus, government spending on individuals’ skills, knowledge and health benefited the individuals and their standard of living rose over a period of time.

Nyberg and Wright (2015) conducted a detailed analysis upon how the concept of human capital has changed over the years and the direction this concept is now taking. They concluded that research in this field is still vibrant and recently research is taking place to understand the aggregate effect of human capital (Nyberg & Wright, 2015). Previously, the research was conducted to understand how to build upon an individual as capital that would in turn be able to build a nation’s human capital; whereas, in recent years the focus has shifted to how organizations can use human capital that they receive (Nyberg & Wright, 2015). The aim of human capital research now is on how the organizations
benefit from human capital rather than how it benefits the individual (Nyberg & Wright, 2015). It is a fact that in order for nations to progress, they need to build their human capital. This requires nations to invest more in its people and to train them to become knowledgeable, skilled and healthy physically and mentally. Knowledge and skill, the two most important points discussed in human capital theory can be achieved through the provision of education to people.

The main contribution of human capital that a country gets through investment in people is their high performance leading to higher economic returns at the organizational level that benefits the society as a whole (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006). Human capital combines improvement in peoples’ intelligence, their attitude, reliability, learnability, commitment and their imagination and creativity. A country’s human development can have a direct impact on their human resource development; therefore, it is important that human capital theory should be very well understood (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006).

In today’s day and age, any product produced can easily be imitated, thus companies need to rely on their differentiated human capital which is an intangible asset and cannot be copied (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006). The human capital may be unique to a firm as it is specifically developed to achieve the aim of that particular firm or an organization. A firm’s performance is measured using two markers: financial performance and non-financial performance where the non-financial performance is the employee contribution in a firm (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006; Sardo & Serrasqueiro, 2017). It is composed of employee commitment, customer loyalty, employee turnover and recruiting rate and their ability to respond to the market changes (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006; Sardo & Serrasqueiro, 2017). Thus, human capital produces a competitive advantage in companies and firms if the firms are able to use the knowledge of the employees effectively. Knowledge in the firms should flow between employees and the management where this flow should be continuous and smooth keeping in mind that the main source of knowledge construction is human interaction. This knowledge creation can improve drastically if it is transferred from outside the firm through investment in employee training which will be responsible for promoting performance.

In this knowledge based industry, the role of senior management is of extreme importance (Jaw, Wang & Chen, 2006; Sardo & Serrasqueiro, 2017) where they assume the responsibilities of a mentor and a leader in an open-minded and trustworthy
environment so that the employees complete their tasks efficiently and effectively. Even though human capital theory asserts that investment in training and education has a positive influence on both the company and the employee; yet, only obtaining knowledge is not important but also it is required that the employees know the effective use of this knowledge (Jaw, Wang, & Chen, 2006). Human capital changes the whole environment of an organization whereby changing the behaviours of people involved. These behaviours add economic value to the organization and the market (Smart, 1999).

Thus the most common and the easiest way to develop human capital are through the provision of education. As argued by Baptiste (2001), no matter what the circumstances, worker productivity is positively related to their education. Even though Matchlup in his 1982 study showed that in some developing countries the return of investment in education in some fields was more than in other fields. He gave an example of Latin America where young women who were secretaries earned more than university graduates. But here he stressed that those university graduates who went to other countries to work were not accounted for and also he pointed out that the countries being economically behind had lesser opportunities for more educated people. Therefore, he recommended that such results should not be believed in and that if return in investment on education really needs to be calculated in true sense, then one must also calculate the amount of sent back home by the university graduates who are working in other countries. Hence, the generation of human capital is just one side of the coin, the other side and a very important side is how this human capital is being used. It can be summed up that countries should be well aware of how their human capital will be used because as suggested by Baptiste, the return on education investment will not be sufficient and the economy of the country will not be affected by the rise in human capital if its usage is inefficient. But then he points out towards another misconception regarding the human capital theory.

Baptiste (2001) elaborated that human capital theory was initially understood as being very simplistic and that education provides opportunities for economic development of countries. With such a shallow definition, the results did not seem to be so confident and there was a distrust in the human capital theory. Until according to him it was made clear that the education and the training that the employees receive should be job related and “that education, through its screening function, streamlines the available pool of flexible
and adaptable workers and consequently enhances the efficiency of both the recruitment and production processes” (Marginson, 1993 as cited in Baptiste, 2001, p. 188). The researches above point out towards educational programs that train individuals to work in particular work environments. Hence, the human capital that is developed should have a target and a focus. If the needs of the industry are not kept in mind before human capital generation then again the purpose of generating human capital will not be achieved. The nations which involve themselves in harvesting human capital must know exactly what type of human capital is needed. It also must be kept in mind, that the world is moving towards the attainment of more specialized workforce; thus, Antosova and Csikosova (2001) put forward that in order to achieve effective human capital, it is fundamental to combine academic education with training programs which may harbor conditions for individuals to easily be a part of the industry. Therefore, the government, the academia and the corporate sector should be aligned to get fruitful results.

1.2. Experiential Learning

Simply put, experiential learning is learning by doing. Hoover and Whitehead (1975, p. 25) as cited by Gentry (1990) defined experiential learning in business teaching and learning as, “Experiential learning exists when a personally responsible participant cognitively, affectively, and behaviorally processes knowledge, skills, and attitudes in a learning situation characterized by a high level of active involvement.” Internships as a pedagogical tool sets fit in experiential learning. According to Kolb and Kolb (2008) the experiential learning approach is constructive in nature where those involved in experiential learning construct knowledge continuously. Experiential learning is different as it integrates many disciplines and harbors constructive learning. Kolb and Kolb (2008) have therefore given a learning model which explains how those immersed in experiential learning go through the following stages: Concrete Experience (CE), Reflective Observation (RO), Abstract Conceptualization (AC) and Active Experimentation (AE). Figure 1 shows Kolb’s experiential learning model.
Taking the concept of four stage model from Kolb, Ash and Clayton (2004) explained that no true experiential learning can take place unless the students are taught to reflect upon the experience they had undergone. It therefore becomes fundamental that not only should a student be provided with an experience but should also be taught to reflect upon that experience to make the internships more productive.

Chapman, McPhee, and Proudman (1995) explain what the fundamentals of an experiential activity are. According to them, in order for an activity to be experiential in nature, it must fulfill following conditions: Firstly, the experiential activities must be related linked with theory; secondly, the students should be provided with enough autonomy to make their own decisions; thirdly, the activities that students are involved in should lead them to discover their full potential; and fourthly, the students should be able to link between the experiential activities and the greater world view. They continued to say that the students then should be able to reflect on their own learning so that they may be able to make connection between experience and theory; it is also crucial that the students are fully immersed in what they are doing. Lastly, the students should come out of their comfort zone to experience a world which is beyond their common knowledge. Thus, for an activity to be called experiential; it has to fulfill the criteria given by Chapman, McPhee, and Proudman. The philosophical underpinning of experiential learning is constructivism which acknowledges that there are multiple truths that are coexisting through the construction of different versions of reality. Hence, there is no ultimate knowledge, in fact knowledge is being continually constructed (Yardley, Teunissen, & Dornan, 2012).
Experiential projects are not restricted to a certain age or a certain grade level; in fact, they are useful for all ages and disciplines. Yet, according to Yardley, Teunissen, and Dorman, (2012) there is a difference between how children and adults learn. Even though both have a latent tendency to learn from their experience; yet, andragogic learners prefer their learning to be self-directed where they want to take charge of their experiential learning. For example, in the fields of engineering and medicine, in business education too, these projects are helpful and desirable as the students through their immersive experience are able to construct their own learning experiences and give birth to new knowledge every day (Chapman, McPhee, & Proudman, 1995).

Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, and Sharma (2014) are of the view that, “experiential education is a complex relational process that involves balancing attention to the learner and to the subject matter while also balancing reflection on the deep meaning of ideas with the skill of applying them” (p. 204). Hence, an experiential activity is holistic in nature. It completes a full circle where there is activity, the learner and the instructor and the focus is upon the knowledge that the learner constructs through the given activity, linking the activity to the theory that he/she learns under the guidance of an instructor.

Cannon and Feinstein (2005) point out that even though there are business courses that require students to go through work experience so as to provide them with a more holistic experience; however, they argue that these experiences fail to provide students with the insight of what they will encounter while on-job. The reason they pointed out is that they are usually overshadowed by the on-job supervisor where he/she is taking all the decisions and have very little time to train individuals under the supervision. Therefore, Cannon and Feinstein suggest that some rubrics should be followed to assess experiential learning of students. There should be a proper process through which students should enter into the experiential setting where the goals and objectives of the experiential activity should be clear not only to the students but also to the on-job supervisor. Also, what exactly will be the responsibilities of the students and what exactly will the student learn out of these responsibilities should be chalked out before the commencement of the experiential learning activity in the business study setting. Keeping in view the importance of learning through experience, the business schools worldwide use internships to engage their students in the immersive experience of business setting. Thus, various accreditation bodies worldwide have taken steps to implement internships in their business schools.
1.3. Internships: HEC Pakistan and AACSB

The Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan has made it mandatory for all business undergraduate and MBA regular students to go through an internship program in order to earn their degrees. The institute understudy has a separate department known as the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation Department that is responsible to provide students with relevant internships so that the criteria laid down by HEC is fulfilled. HEC has reinforced internships for youth to become an effective member of the society by providing them with quality education along with training and skills. One of the indicators for the effectiveness of an educational institute is considered to be the number of internship programs that are offered by industry to their students and the number of students availing internship opportunities (Research & Development Division, 2012).

HEC report by the Research and Development Division (2012) expresses the importance of internships by saying that industry should offer internships to students as these will bring direct exposure of the industry to the students. One of the objectives of the internships is to make sure that the academic programs offered are aligned with the needs of the industry (Research & Development Division, 2012). Internships therefore are not implemented by various institutes according to their own whims and wishes; rather it is in accordance with the HEC policy. HEC desires to provide students with quality education that is very much aligned with the business needs outside the university campus; therefore, HEC wants business schools to be a part of human capital industry where humans are trained as an asset for the nation.

Internships are more than just a pedagogy that is to be fulfilled as per the requirements of HEC. Internships conducted using Kolb’s experiential learning cycle and proper strategies for reflective writing help students to become more capable and competent managers and citizens. It is a journey towards developing human asset; an asset that is fundamental for any nation to grow, progress and compete in this highly competitive world. It becomes fundamental for all Pakistani business schools to offer internship programs to their students so that this human asset takes the shape of human capital for the country.

The institute understudy is currently working to acquire ‘The Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business’ (AACSB) accreditation. As such there are some
bench marks that the institute must meet in order for it to achieve this milestone. One of the most fundamental areas that AACSB focuses upon in its Eligibility Procedures and Accreditation Standards for Business Accreditation (2017) is to connect theory with practice making it fundamental for all business schools to make it a part of their mission. In this regard, it stresses that teaching and learning activities fostered by degree program curricula should highlight the importance of student engagement with the corporate world using experiential learning methodologies the outcomes of which are measurable. AACSB further elaborates that it is through internships that student academic and professional engagement occurs. Thus, in an internship setting, students are actively involved in their educational experiences, in both academic and professional settings, and are able to connect these experiences in meaningful ways. The document also makes it clear that in order to make meaningful connection of their experiences with the theory in a corporate setting; the students must be reflective thinkers and must be able to apply the learnt knowledge. The ultimate aim of AACSB is the generation of human capital that would add to the economic progress of a country.

Keeping in view the requirements of AACSB, the institute understudy needs to first detect the loop holes (if any) in its internship program and then needs to work for its betterment for it to achieve the benchmark set out by AACSB. The experiential learning cycle is the heart of an internship. The institute understudy needs to formulate protocols through which the essence of an internship that AACSB highlights is captured.

To achieve this aim and to align its internship program with the requirements of AACSB, the institute used a case study method where the experiential learning model which is focused upon by AACSB will be put into play. This model will guide the institute in formulating protocols that will bring forth the fruitfulness of internships by measuring the actual learning of students during and after an internship.

1.4. Purpose

The accreditation organizations such as the HEC Pakistan and the AACSB have recognized internships as an important part of business education that needs to be implemented by all business schools. The literature on internships tells us that in order for internships to generate the much needed human capital, they should be focused, goal oriented, well-structured and have measurable outcomes, where students using their previous knowledge are continuously constructing knowledge by reflecting upon their
experiences. It is also important to note that no experience can be considered meaningful unless it is reflected upon. Therefore, the internships, which are a bridge between theory and experience, should be well-constructed activities fulfilling all domains of experiential learning.

The subject became of interest to me when during my MPhil research, while I was interviewing bank managers and newly inducted bank employees, who had graduated from top five business schools of Karachi to gauge the business communication skills of new inductees. It was revealed through that study that even though internships were a fundamental part of business school education as per HEC requirements; yet, they were not taken seriously neither by the interns nor by their host organizations (Nauman & Nasreen, 2017). If this is so, then the whole concept of internships is futile and just a criteria to be fulfilled in order to acquire a degree from a business school. Therefore, there was want for further investigation and to understand the usefulness and limitations of internship programs. It was also important for the institute understudy to recognize its weaknesses and shape their internship program according to the requirements of AACSB.

There were two objectives of this research: Firstly, I wanted to see what experiences interns had at their internships and why were the internships being considered useless and secondly, to align the internships with the requirements laid down by AACSB. Through this study, I in depth viewed the internship pedagogy, which is a form of experiential learning, to comprehend what effects the internships had on human capital generation if they were conducted keeping in mind the experiential learning theory as proposed by AACSB.

Keeping the AACSB recommended model of experiential learning for human capital generation through internships, there were three main purposes of this research: (a) to understand how Kolb’s learning model came into play in an internship setting in Pakistan; (b) to recognize how internships were adding to the human capital in Pakistan and (c) to give recommendation to improve business internships in Pakistan.

To study the above mentioned aspects of internships, a case study approach was used, which focused upon the internships that were conducted at the institute according to the HEC policy. The focus was to conduct internships using the criterion set by AACSB. Through this research I have recommended the institute on how to make their internship program more effective. Even though the findings of a case study are relevant to a particular
case only, but for this research it is envisioned that the findings of the research would be
generalizable to other Pakistani business institutes where internship programs are
conducted as per the HEC policy. This is due to the similarity that exists in the internship
business internship programs across Pakistan.

1.5. Research Problem

In order to generate sufficient amount of human capital, the Pakistani business
schools need to use internships as an experiential learning project but because internships
in Pakistan, in most cases, are not well structured; therefore, the students are unable to get
maximum benefit out of this experience. Research conducted worldwide shows that an
internship will only be fruitful, if it is well structured and is designed according to the
objectives and essentials of the internship (Beck & Halim, 2008; Canon & Feinstein, 2005;
Chauhan, Zhao & Heskamp, 2004; Gault, Redington & Schlager, 2000; Silva, et al., 2016;
Weible, 2010). This research sought to understand the link, if there is any, between the
theory and practice as “a research problem can be derived from a theory by questioning
whether a particular theory can be sustained in practice” (Merriam, 2009, p. 57). Research
in this field in Pakistan needs to be conducted in order to assess how the internship
programs can be made more productive for the interns, the industry and the academic
institutions. Thus, this research looked into two main research question and four sub
research questions for the first main question and three sub questions for the second main
question as given below.

1. How can Kolb’s experiential learning model be applied in an internship setting in
Pakistan?
   i. How is goal setting useful in an internship setting in order to fully understand a
      concrete experience?
   ii. How can reflections be used as a tool for continuous assessment in an internship
       setting?
   iii. How does constant intern supervision in the internship program setting impact
        the overall program effectiveness?
   iv. What internship program structure does the employer use for intern placement?

2. To what extent are the internships adding to Pakistan’s human capital development?
i. What is the understanding of the institution’s internship department regarding the success of an internship program?

ii. What roles do internships play in gaining employment for the interns and potential employees for companies?

iii. To what extent are the needs of the industry aligned with the courses delivered at the institution?

1.6. Operational Definitions

**Business schools**: Educational institutions that offer a variety of different business programs, that students choose based on the area that they would like to specialize in.

**Case study**: It is an empirical inquiry of a unit as a whole or parts of a unit that investigates a phenomenon within its real-life context.

**Experiential learning**: The process of learning through experience, and is more specifically defined as ‘learning through reflection on doing’.

**Firm’s education**: Education and training that meets the needs of a business.

**Human capital**: Stock of knowledge, habits, social and personality attributes, including creativity, embodied in the ability to perform labor so as to produce economic value.

**Internships**: A temporary position in an organization as a part of academic requirement with an emphasis on on-the-job training.

**Reflective learning**: A process of internally examining and exploring events triggered by an experience, resulting in a changed conceptual perspective.

1.7. Research Method and Data Collection

The research was a case study where the unit of analysis was an internship program at a Pakistani top tier business school. Case study method of investigation is used when a researcher wants to study a phenomenon using a unit of analysis. A case study deals with people as objects in their natural setting where the phenomenon that needs to be investigated is contemporary in nature and must be studied holistically keeping in mind the contextual reference; (Grunbaum , 2007) thereby using more than one method of data collection (Grünbaum ,2007; Merriam, 2009). The purpose of a case study can be descriptive, exploratory, explanatory (Grünbaum , 2007) or experimental (Merriam,
Finally, the researcher has no control over the events that happen during a case study research and in result; rich contextual accounts are produced as the result of a case study.

For this research, the internship program at a top tier business school was taken as the unit of analysis and the research was divided into two parts. In the Phase I, I wanted to understand the problems that the interns face during the internships and their perception about the fruitfulness of this pedagogy. For this purpose interviews were conducted from 10 interns - two from finance, five from management and three from human resource - who had completed their internships. The results of these initial interviews were also important because not only did they give me data to add on to the current internship manual but also helped me in chalking out the next phase of my research.

Phase II of 12 interns – 3 from human resource management, four from finance and five belonging to marketing. This group was given an internship manual that had all the procedures require for an internship and I acted as their faculty supervisor. As explained earlier, the internship manual was developed by using the data collected from the initial intern interviews and the literature provided on best internship practices (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009; Bandow, 2015; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Boyatzis, 2002; NSEE, 2013; Eyler, 2009; Hoyle & Goffnett, 2013; Judkins, Morris, & Molocznik, 2011; True, n.d; Warren, 1997). It also had reflective rubrics that were used by interns understudy to write down their reflections.

The data were collected through multiple sources.

(i) Reflections: Reflective writing had two purposes. First, it helped me in understanding what exactly was happening at the internships, what struggles were the interns going through and how were they handling all issues that came their way. Second, the students could gauge their learning through this practice.

(ii) Semi structure interviews: In Phase I of the research semi-structure interviews were conducted from interns who had done their internship to learn about their experiences and the internship process at the institute. In Phase II of the research, semi-structured interviews were conducted from the on-job supervisors of the 12 interns and Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation Department.
(iii) Report and intern evaluation forms: At the end of the internship intern evaluation forms submitted by the on-job supervisors along with the end of the project report that the interns submitted to Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation Department were looked into.

(iv) Focus groups: Three focus group (management, finance and human resource interns) interviews from experimental groups were conducted at the end of the study.

Thus, multiple methods of collecting data were used and triangulated in order to holistically understand the phenomenon of internships in a business school setting in Pakistan.

1.8. Rationale

There seems to be a global need to study internships as an experiential learning pedagogy and a source of career skills development (Bell & Federman, 2010; Eyler, 1992, 2009; Gault, Redington, & Schlager, 2000; Silva, et al., 2016). This research fulfilled this gap that existed pertaining to the two queries laid down by various researches.

The study undertaken can be used as a benchmark research in Pakistan in the field of experiential learning encompassing internships for the following reasons. First, this study will contribute towards the body of knowledge based on the developed internship manual through which future internships can be carried out. Second, through this research, internships have been looked into by using the lens of experiential learning making them more productive. The fruitfulness of internships has become a matter of concern as my previous research indicated that students and industry were not reaping the benefits that internships were to provide to them. It is important that internships should not be handled just as a formality to obtain a BBA or an MBA degree. There was a need for a research to be conducted in order to understand how internships can become more useful and fulfill their purpose of knowledge construction.

Finally, this research should be profitable for all the stakeholders: The students, business schools and the industry in generating the much needed human capital for the country. The results of this research should help business schools move in the right direction and help them chalk out a plan for their future courses. It should seek to make clear for the academicians how to help students make connections between real life
situations at their workplace and the theory that they have studied at their universities. Since this research gives recommendations on how to make internships more profitable, the HEC can use the findings of this research to further align the process of internship and to adumbrate the process of internship for the universities and the industry offering internships to the students. The internship manual can also be adapted by other Pakistani universities according to their requirement.

The review of the literature suggests that the experiential learning activity is not subject specific; hence, experiential learning model sets fit in all areas of management, finance and human resource of business studies.

1.9. Summary

Growth in human capital is fundamental for the economic progress of a country and education is a way through which this goal can be achieved. Education sector in general and the business schools in particular play a great role in producing the much required human capital. Business schools are responsible for producing human capital that would directly and positively affect the economic markers of a country. But for these business schools to be fully successful, it is important for them to be dynamic and offer education to their students using the latest pedagogies. To monitor the efficiency of these business schools, Pakistan has its own higher education governing body the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan. The HEC Pakistan has made it essential for all business schools to offer internships in order to create fruitful human capital that is able to make a connection between their coursework and on-job issues faced by the managers on day to day basis.

It has been observed that internships that are fundamentally an experiential learning activity are not dealt so. This creates two problems: Firstly, there is no measurement available to show how much the interns have learnt. Secondly, when all experiential learning steps are not followed then it makes the whole learning process of internships questionable. Through this research, business schools will be provided with a tool to measure the effectiveness of internships by making them fully aligned with an experiential learning activity. This will help business institutes measure the effectiveness of their programs and thus point out a gap that may exist in delivering fruitful human capital to the country.
2. CHAPTER TWO: Literature Review

2.1. Introduction

This chapter deals with the theories and the researches that are relevant to understand the underpinnings of this study. It elaborates upon the human capital and the experiential learning theories and connects the two theories through internships. The substratum of these two theories help researchers and readers build upon them and take them further to test them in the Pakistani scenario. The chapter begins by defining human capital theory and then stretches to give a comprehensive detail about it whereby explaining how this theory comes into play in an economic development of a country. Then the experiential learning theory is explained in detail where reflective practices are highlighted as one of the most important aspects of experiential learning. Finally, the chapter highlights the importance of internships through citing the HEC Pakistan’s and AACSB’s policy that makes internships compulsory for business school students.

The literature review section is divided into four sections for the convenience of its readers. It begins with expanding upon the two theories: Human Capital Theory and Experiential Learning Theory and then moves on to Reflective Practices and then combines all three in the Internships. At the end it conceptualizes the whole process of internships using the experiential learning theory, thereby adding to the human capital. The framework that is presented as the result of this conceptualization is named as the Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships (RFGHCI) which shows the connection between the Human Capital Theory and the Experiential Learning Theory. Thus, the framework visually represents how experiential learning can add to the human capital if all the steps of the experiential learning cycle are properly addressed.

2.2. Human Capital Theory

Human capital theory has played a vital role in the economic development of the western world. Based on this theory, the western educationists and economists were able to design their education and economic policies. This theory demonstrates the effects of education on the economy of a country. Hence according to Camilleri (2016), “There are win win opportunities for big businesses and policy-makers as they nurture human capital with the right knowledge, skills and competences” (p. 1).
There have been economists who have spoken about human stock of skill and knowledge as an asset, yet due the negative connotation of the term ‘human capital’, it was first used as late as in 1954 by Arthur Lewis in his work ‘Economic Development with Unlimited Supply of Labour’. Human Capital was further explained and emphasized upon by Jacob Mincer and Theodore Schultz. Chiswick (2003) explains the history of human capital theory by presenting Mincer’s groundbreaking work ‘Investment in Human Capital and Personal Income Distribution’ (1958) which promulgated the effects of on-job training on the determination and distribution of earning. His work exclusively enunciated how on-job training affects differences in earnings and inequality in earnings. He further declared that there was more inequality in occupational earnings on jobs where more skills were required. Whereas, Schultz in his research ‘Investment in Human Beings’ (1964) further explained the power of human capital for understanding the theory of investment (Chiswick, 2003). It was Machlup, who as late as in 1982 explained, that the term human capital in no way carried a negative connotation to it and the word capital in terms of human beings is used as human beings being “intangible assets yielding tangible or intangible services” (p. 4). Therefore, there were researchers and economists ‘for and against’ the idea of ‘humans being measured in form of capital’.

Draskovic, Jovovic, Draskovic and Jereb (2013) showed the difference between the new and the old economy. They emphasized that the new economy is based is a knowledge based economy where the rules of doing business are dependent on knowledge; whereas, the old economy was a resultant of inputs such as ‘land, labour and capital’. It does not mean that these traditional inputs are not of any use today, but simply that knowledge is now the most important factor in business development (Draskovic, Jovovic, Draskovic, & Jereb, 2013). This knowledge directly contributes in the development of human capital (Draskovic, Jovovic, Draskovic, & Jereb, 2013; Nyberg & Wright, 2015).

Harvey, Novicevic and Garrison (2005) argue that human capital has become fundamental for global organization which has made it essential for human resource managers to be able to measure the human capital of a company by focusing on the benefit of human capital rather the cost of developing it. Secondly, they claim that human resource managers must realize that historic means of measuring human capital are flawed as they focus more on input nature rather than the output effects of human capital, this will have an impact on the way a firm’s profit are judged; hence, “In sum, human capital is no longer
a simple task of ‘counting’ the number of employees and their backgrounds” (p. 1588). In fact, human capital has now become a management tool that is strategic in nature which directly effects the global performance of an organization (Harvey, Novicevic, & Garrison, 2005).

2.2.1. Economic Development Through Human Capital

A country’s development, economically as well as socially is dependent on the knowledge and the skill its people possess. How well a country is able to develop its human resource will affect the national wellbeing of a country. There are countries around the world that are solely reliant on their human capital for their sustenance such as Japan and Singapore, which have no or very little natural resources. No matter what the case is, it is always challenging for nations to develop their human capital. Thus, there is a strong positive correlation between the human capital of a country and a country’s economic development. This human capital is achieved through investing in people’s skills and knowledge by investing in their education. Thus, if a country is able to streamline its human capital with its demand, the economy is sure to give a positive response.

Weckroth and Kemppainen (2016) conducted a study to investigate the special interplay between regional cultural characteristics and value based human capital where value based human capital was defined as human capital that added to the economy of a country. They found out that high levels of economic performances were positively correlated with cultural values. They concluded that Western European and the Nordic countries have moved to the post-modern phase where they have high levels of human performance leading to modest regional disparities and self-expression values. On the other hand, the Eastern Europe still is going through the process of building their human capital which is responsible for regional inequalities and low value climate. Value based climate was measured using three indicators of power, that is social status; achievement which is personal success and self-direction that is independence of thought and action (Weckroth & Kemppainen, 2016).

The concept of human capital development is connected with the concept of human resource development and when human resource is developed at the national level; it becomes the property of a country (Verkhohlyad & McLean, 2011). It must be noted that each country will have its own specialized human capital; therefore the human capital of
each country will be different from the human capital of another country depending upon what skill set does a country require for its people (Verkhohlyad & McLean, 2011). Thus, the first thing that a country must do is to identify its human capital and work to improve upon it, where it must also try to invest to build skills and knowledge that its people lack (Verkhohlyad & McLean, 2011). This idea of diversity in human capital from country to country can help multinational firms to seek the right potential for their business across countries. Verkhohlyad and McLean (2011) were of the view that to fixate human capital into the years of schooling and college degree is not the true definition of human capital; rather, human capital is also the knowledge and the skills combined that add to a country’s economy. This does not mean that education is unimportant; in fact it points towards the fact the education is one important variable in human capital development which has to be accompanied by other important variables such as learning by doing, on-job training, learning by interacting which are all important variables to achieve human capital (Verkhohlyad & McLean, 2011). To maintain regional firm competitions these forms of learning must be a part of the training of the skilled human capital as knowledge may come from various sources and methodologies (Verkhohlyad & McLean, 2011).

### 2.2.2. Education as an Important Variable of Human Capital

Hansen and Winther (2015) conducted a survey on the relationship of human capital with education and concluded that the basic schooling has a negative effect on employment as such labour capabilities are not required by the firms. Whereas, vocational and university education at all levels has a positive impact on employment. It can be concluded that employment opportunities are directly proportional to the higher education degree as well as vocational training; stressing that human capital has the ability to be encapsulated in the regions where there are more opportunities for these degrees and trainings, creating a geographical uneven divide in human capital (Hansen & Winther, 2015). This leads to the fact that governments should make sure that the human capital is equally distributed within a country. This can be achieved through looking at human capital as more than just a university degree which is inclusive of skills learnt on-job and within a working environment (Hansen & Winther, 2015).

Nevertheless, education is one of the major forms of human resource as education does not only add to the stock of one’s knowledge but it is also a main factor in improving
ones skills and work efficacy (Machlup, 1982). The human capital theory stresses that higher education is fundamental in order to improve productivity and efficiency of a population as education increases the cognitive stock of a population (Olaniyan & Okemakinde, 2008). This capital is responsible for optimizing the efficiency of an organization because an organization with qualified people at all levels can make handful of profits (Antosova & Csikosova, 2011).

Keeping the same notion in mind, Eriksson and Forslund (2014) hypothesized that if academic qualification is taken as the only marker of human capital, then the employment growth must be faster in regions having universities; therefore, they investigated Sweden’s university regions. Human capital assimilates differentiated knowledge and innovation systems which is more than systematic transfer of knowledge. Such differentiated knowledge does not generate in isolation but is generated and created through interaction of individuals and firms in different learning processes (Eriksson & Forslund, 2014). They provide three types of knowledges required for human capital: the analytic knowledge which is related to the combination of various theories for innovating something new, the production knowledge which exist with people such as engineers and manufactures, and lastly, the symbolic knowledge which deals with branding, promoting, packaging etc. They explain that research output may be important for a firm or an organization but in order to take innovation to the next level so that it can be capitalized upon; such ventures require a theoretical knowledge base to begin with - the analytic knowledge; which leads to production knowledge and moving on to a more symbolic knowledge.

Lee, Florida and Gates (2010) proved through their research that, the engineers and the scientists were contributed greatly in development of human capital through industrial research and development (R&D). But once this highly specialized human resource is taken away then the general human capital has little effect on industrial innovation. This is true as innovation at industrial level requires highly specialized human capital, whereas the general human capital in the industry setting is not responsible for innovation, rather they are responsible for other tasks that need to be carried out like assembly, production and delivery in an industrial setting (Lee, Florida, & Gates, 2010). They emphasize that research and development (R&D) is the embryo of all economies hence it becomes essential to develop universities with R&D departments and to develop R&D institutions as well. It will be crucial to understand what type of R&D is required by the industry and also, where
should these R&D institutions be placed in order to deliver maximum benefit to the industry. As different knowledges cater to different industries and sometimes being overlapped, it may be that they may dominate a particular region due to its place in history.

The creation of analytic knowledge need specialized spaces such as libraries and books and can only happen in universities and R&D specialized institutes. On the other hand, it is elaborated that these universities and R&D institutions must be linked with industry. They will fail to generate human capital if they are not linked with the mainstream industry. The paper concluded that by establishing that human capital was generally high in areas near universities as long as the university caters to various knowledge bases important for growth of human capital (Eriksson & Forslund, 2014).

Citing the case of the mainland European countries Andrews and Higson, (2010) explained that there was a growing awareness there of the importance that the higher education holds in today's knowledge-based economy. Thus, they argue that the European universities are geared at producing highly competent and mobile individuals who possess problem solving skills and be responsive to the ever-changing requirements of the contemporary workplace. Interns play a vital role in equipping organizations with the latest knowledge in all fields including technology, finance and management and thus increasing the overall efficiency of an organization (Donovan & Garnett, 2006). Hence, globalization is one of the major factors that have led to need of production of human capital as globalization has internationalized the job market (Griffin et al., 2011). The internationalization of the job market has paved way for the developing countries to take their share from the global economy by providing it with skilled workers (Griffin, Annulis, McCearley, Green, Kirby, & Gaudet, 2011).

2.2.3 Human capital in Pakistan

The Human Capital Report, 2016 shows Pakistan, India and Bangladesh to be at the bottom of the human capital index “due to poor performances on educational outcomes throughout all the age group pillars, and despite a comparatively high tertiary attainment rate among the former’s older population” (Schwab, 2016, p. 7). The report elaborates that the reasons also include poor primary level education where the youth literacy in the three countries is far below the emerging markets. Even when these countries exhibit better performance at the tertiary level; there is a low level of skill diversity which means that the
specialization is offered only in limited academic fields (Schwab, 2016). Rehman (2016) compared the R&D activities in India’s and Pakistan’s small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). He revealed that Indian SME’s were dominant in taking up R&D and generating product as well as process innovations. He suggested that Pakistan needs to give such incentives as R&D grants, tax credits and subsidies to its SME’s in order for them to develop their R&D capacity.

The indicators of human capital in Pakistan are not satisfactory because the governments have not paid serious attention to build it; therefore, we see a low enrolment rates at schools and high dropout rate from school, low literacy rate and in turn high unemployment, high poverty level, and high illiteracy (Ali, Chaudhry, & Farooq, 2012). Even when governments tried to implement various educational programs to achieve a certain literacy rate, they could not achieve the benefits of higher human capital with it as Abbasa and Foreman-Peckb, (2007) elaborated that poor quality of schooling as well as low quality syllabus were responsible for a poor human capital build up in Pakistan. They also explained that there was an immense difference between the Pakistani private schools and Pakistani public schools such that the efficiency of Pakistani private school students was twelve times of that of Pakistani public school students. Therefore, we can sum up that there is an inconsistency in the human capital produced in Pakistan.

The problems faced by Pakistan in human capital development can be compared with of Puerto Rico. Griffin, Annulis, McCearley, Green, Kirby and Gaudet (2011) point out that the human capital there cannot be efficiently developed unless the workforce there is reskilled to meet today’s needs. They observed disconnect between the skill development and skill in demand. They proposed that there should me a monitoring body to monitor key outcomes of the implemented human development programs. Lastly, they proposed that there should be collaboration between all stake holders. Other barriers in human capital development include the cost of energy, bureaucratic systems, and the accessibility to those who need to be skilled.

Throughout the literature review, education along with skill was taken as major contributors of human capital (Ali, Chaudhry & Farooq, 2012; Draskovic, Jovovic, Draskovic, & Jereb, 2013; Lutz & Samir, 2011; Machlup, 1982). On the other hand it was noted that one of the main causes of unemployment and low human capital was due to absence of association between the higher education institutes and the industry (Ali,
Chaudhry, & Farooq, 2012). Like elsewhere, in Pakistan as well there was disconnect between what the market demands and what the higher education institutes are producing (Ali, Chaudhry & Farooq, 2012). Education process that would harbour human capital keeping in mind employers’ expectation is given by Antosova and Csikosova, (2011) in Figure 2. The importance of this model comes into play when firms want to create a knowledge resource through trainings and education; thus harboring human capital.

Even though, the main focus of firm’s education is to build human capital within the firm itself, yet the same model can be successfully implemented by the business schools in order to create a liaison with the business sector and known as ‘systematic internship cycle’. It then becomes fundamental for higher education institutes to stay connected and well informed about the employers’ demands so that they can invest in education that would not only increase the stock of knowledge but also would increase human capital. This connectedness will help institutes provide up-to-date knowledge, information and skills which are most appreciated and needed by the industry (Antosova & Csikosova, 2011).

The employers thus take the advantage of this skilled labour that is produced by the higher education institutes as they expect that upon graduation, graduates from these institutes would be ready to resume employment responsibility without much supervision (Andrews & Higson, 2010). Business schools worldwide face a new challenge of equipping their students with skills to cope with ever changing environment in this knowledge based...

Figure 2. The systematic internship cycle, adapted from the systematic firm’s education cycle (Antosova & Csikosova, 2011)
economy (Hasbullah & Sulaiman, 2002). Nevertheless, if a country fails to develop its human capital, the results can be devastating. It can lead to illiteracy, unemployment and poverty, which will lead to other social ills in the society (Griffin et al., 2011).

People who are able to update themselves and not only produce new knowledge but also use it effectively and continuously, are most desired by the employers. To produce such individuals is the duty of educational institutions. As explained earlier that it is not only knowledge but useful knowledge that adds to human capital and in turn brings economic gains for a country. Thus, the skills required for industry can only be inculcated in an individual, if that individual becomes a part of the industry itself and learns to use the knowledge provided to him/her by the academia. This is where experiential learning comes in.

2.3. Experiential Learning Theory

Experiential learning theory focuses upon how individuals learn and how individuals perceive situations differently and hence react to them accordingly (Yardley, Teunissen, & Dornan, 2012). The concept of learning in the experiential learning theory is explained by Yardley, Teunissen and Dornan (2012) through the following points. Firstly, learning is considered as situated, which means that it is associated with its context in a social setting. To develop transferable learning, it is important to fully grasp the understanding of the context where the learning is to happen. Secondly, learning can either be individual or collective. They stress that even when the learning is individual; it nevertheless is derived from its context. Thirdly, the learning is triggered by ‘authentic practice based experience’ where people gain experiences in real world settings.

The theory of experiential learning is not new; in fact, this concept is known from the times of Aristotle when he negated Plato’s idea of reaching towards the truth by pure thought alone. Aristotle was of the view that experience plays a great role in learning and that, “men of experience succeed even better than those who have theory without experience” (Ross, 1958, p. 2). Aristotle observed more than once, that men of knowledge were considered better than men of experience because men of knowledge know why, and the cause of why, but men who only have experience do not know the answer to the ‘why’ (Ross, 1958). So we deem men of knowledge wiser by the virtue of theory; therefore, what
made men of knowledge greater than men of experience was their knowledge, and the element lacking in the men of experience was the knowledge.

Kurt Zadek Lewin (1890-1947) in his various works laid great importance on one’s experience. He reached the conclusion, that personal involvement and subjective experience was of utmost importance; he believed in learning through action, since according to him impulse was an internal needs (Cook, 2007). He was also of the view that it is only through being involved in an action that individuals could have the opportunity to create the reality of their liking (Cook, 2007); therefore, Lewin’s research supported learning through action. On the other hand, John Dewey (1859 – 1952) showed the relationship between experience and reflection. According to him, actions that are non-reflective are dominant form of experiences, known as habits (Miettinen, 2000). Dewey considered it a necessity to reflect as it helps to solve problems; yet he elaborated that culture plays an important role in the way one reflects (Miettinen, 2000).

Kolb proposed experiential learning theory which he called different from traditional learning and behavioral theories (Kolb, 1984). According to Kolb’s (1984) experiential learning theory, “learning is a continuous process grounded in experience” (such that) “all learning is relearning” (p. 12). Kolb (1984) defines experiential as, “the process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience. Knowledge results from the combination of grasping and transforming experience” (p.41). One of the main aspects of experiential learning is ‘the creation of knowledge’ whereby knowledge is continuously created as long as one is involved in the experiential learning process. Kolb further explains that ideas are not a fixed entity; rather, they are formed and reformed through ones experience, thereby making learning a process that is renewed and modified through experience. Hence Kolb proposed that any new skill, new knowledge or new attitudes are achieved through four different abilities: Concrete experience (CE), reflective observation (RO), abstract conceptualization (AC) and active experimentation (AE). Kolb came to the conclusion that learning is a process filled with tension and conflict such that the learning activities are polar opposite where concrete experience and abstract conceptualization are opposite and reflective observation and active experimentation are opposite to one another (Kolb, 1994). Even though this cycle begins with concrete experience; in reality the learners and educators may choose to begin their cycle from another point in the cycle (Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, & Sharma, 2014).
Kolb (1984) described experiential learning as a molar concept where human learning is affected by his/her social and physical environment. The learners should devise a goal for themselves and then through experience and experimentation to achieve concrete thinking about an experience. Ross (2016) explains that things in environment can easily be understood and ideas become more and more concrete when intimate connections are made with them in everyday life experiences. Ross gives an example of the term ‘government’, that even if a term is a complex one, but is a part of one’s social fabric, it becomes very concrete in mind. He further explains that concrete thinking helps us solve the issues that we face and confront every day; concrete thinking is not only a form of thinking, but rather a form of understanding and applying for problem solving. Thus when an individual sets a goal for oneself, which can be defined as, an “object or aim of an action, for example, to attain a specific standard of proficiency, usually within a specified time limit,” (Locke & Latham, 2002, p. 705) and works to attain that goal in a particular setting or a particular social environment, then concrete learning from that experience is inevitable and bound to happen. It is fundamental that the participants of an experiential learning activity “must also focus from the earliest stages of the experience/program on the identified intentions, adhering to them as goals, objectives and activities are defined. The resulting plan should include those intentions and be referred to on a regular basis by all parties” (Experiential education: Internships and Work-Based Learning - A Handbook for Practitioners & Administrators, 2017, p. 13).

Kolb’s experiential learning theory is directly related to Kolb’s learning styles. He proposed that individuals learn in unique ways and that such learning experiences should be designed that take into consideration the unique learning style of the individuals (Kozub, 2010). The learners were divided into four categories according to their style: Assimilators, divergers, convergers, and accommodators (Kolb, 1984). Kozub (2010) further explains these learners as given in Table 1.
Table 1

*Learner types and their characteristics*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learner Types</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accommodators</td>
<td>They focus on doing tasks, making plans, and having new experiences. When a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>theory does not seem to fit, this type of learner quickly discards it and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rely on people for information rather than their own analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divergers</td>
<td>They possess a strong imaginative ability and awareness of meaning and values.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>These learners view concrete situations from many perspectives, emphasizing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>adaptation through observation rather than action.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convergers</td>
<td>They employ strategies of problem solving, decision making, and the practical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>application of ideas. They move quickly to find the one correct answer, and thus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>are best in situations where there is one correct solution. These learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>organize their knowledge in a way such that it can focus on specific problems,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and they prefer technical tasks rather than dealing with the social or personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>side of things.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assimilators</td>
<td>The individuals are more concerned with abstract concepts and ideas and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>process their observations into an integrated explanation. They are interested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in taking the learning experience and seeing it in the context of a larger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>framework of ideas and experiences.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The relationship of these learning styles with the experiential learning is given in Figure 3, which shows how an experiential learning project covers the learning style of all types of learners.

*Figure 3.* Relationship between Kolb’s experiential learning and learning styles (Kozub, 2010).

It can be understood from Figure 3 that the experiential learning model addresses the needs of all types of learning styles. It can be seen that when one is involved in an experiential learning cycle, one not only improves his/her inherent learning style but one
also gets an opportunity to improve on other learning styles. It has been proved time and again that the experiential methods, through development of skills and testing alternatives, more than the didactic methods lead to change in behavior or an attitude (Koponen, Pyörälä, & Isotalus, 2012). Also, experiential learning has a positive effect on student attitude keeping in mind the use of reasonable amount of time in performing an experiential activity (Koponen, Pyörälä, & Isotalus, 2012). The emphasis of the experiential learning theory is not upon the outcome; rather, it emphasizes upon the process (Kolb, 1984).

McCarthy (2010) is of the view that even though experiential learning optimizes the learning practice, yet, to incorporate experiential learning theory into practice is a daunting task for teachers. Kolb (1984) also explains that it becomes difficult to chalk down a course that is reliant upon the experiential learning theory since the theory does not consider people’s minds to be a blank slate; as is considered in traditional teaching and learning. The experiential learning theory is based on the fact that when students enter their classes, they are to some extent aware of the topic under discussion. Being continuously involved in experiences inside and outside the school, they have some knowledge of the topic at hand. Kolb stresses that as educators, the duty of a teacher is not to implant new ideas in students, and rather it is to modify the existing ones.

The higher education curriculum consists of many courses that cover various topics in a very factual and superficial manner (Kolb & Kolb, 2005). The matter of fact is that education does not mean the learning of factual knowledge but it demands the ability to not only retrieve knowledge for application in various contexts but also the organization of the learnt facts and ideas in conceptual frameworks (Kolb & Kolb, 2005). This type of learning is deep learning which is recursive in nature and can be achieved if it is directly linked with learners’ own goals (Kolb & Kolb, 2005). This recursive process is visible in experiential learning cycle where the center of learning is learners own goals that the learner develops. “Experiential education is a complex relational process that involves balancing attention to the learner and the subject matter while also balancing reflections on the deep meaning of ideas with the skill of applying them” (Kolb, 2014, p. 300). Therefore, it is important to begin an experiential learning project with a goal formation activity.

Andresen, Bound and Cohen, (1999) argue that experiential learning theory works at both, personal and societal level. At the personal level one brings in his/her experiences while being engaged in a new experience and reflect on it and continue learning; whereas,
at a societal level it checks socio-economic and moral responsibility (Andresen, Bound & Cohen, 1999). Nevertheless, experiential learning theory has its roots in classical as well as modern philosophy (Andresen, Bound & Cohen, 1999), which means that experience was always considered essential, regardless of the time period. On the other hand, learning according to Kolb (1984) is a holistic process which involves all human faculties – feeling, perceiving, thinking and behaving. He says that when learning is described as a holistic adaptive process, then the learning itself involves all aspects of human life and becomes life long process. If an experiential activity is to be fruitful, then care must be given to planning the activity carefully such that reflective learning must be embedded in the activity from start to end (Eyler, 2009). This research paper will further focus upon reflective observation – an important aspect of learning according to Kolb’s learning cycle.

2.4. Reflective Learning

Mezirow (1990), defined learning as “the process of making a new or revised interpretation of the meaning of an experience, which guides subsequent understanding, appreciation and action” (p.1). He further elaborated that how we perceive things, how we think and how we interpret experiences and make meaning of these experiences are dependent upon our frame of reference and the habits that we have developed over time. Very often people are unaware of how they learnt to do things (Schon, 1983). One might have been once aware of the process of doing something, but as the process internalized, having learnt to do these things; one simply finds himself/herself doing them without contemplating the process (Schon, 1983).

Schon (1995) explains the process of reflection and distinguishes between ‘knowing-in- action’ and that ‘knowing-in-action’ is a non-reflective process that takes in our day to day working that is when people automatically know what to do in an action to get the required results (Schon, 1995). He explains that if anyone wants to learn from an expert who knows how to do an action, then merely asking that person may not solve the problem as the person may not exactly be able to explain how he does something. He further explains that in order to learn an act from someone, one must observe that person carefully. On the other hand, he explains if we want to explain how we do an action, we must observe ourselves carefully. Then we must reflect on what we observe, then describe it, and lastly, reflect on our description. He elaborates that, “The process of reflection-in-
action begins when a spontaneous performance……is interrupted by surprise” (p.6). In such a scenario, the performer stops to understand the situation, and tries to figure out how he should change his strategy to overcome the hurdle. After figuring out the answers to the questions that he lay before himself, he invents a new strategy to put into action. The new strategy applied will either lead to success or will call for more reflection and then experimentation (Schon, 1995). Thus ‘reflection in action’ has taken place to resolve the problem. Schon further explains that we not only have an ability to reflect in action but, “we also have the ability to reflect on such a process, reflecting on reflection-in-action” (Schon, 1995, p.7).

Hickson (2011) point out the difference between reflecting and critically reflecting and explains that critical reflection is to understand our experiences and develop the knowledge to use these experiences in future fruitfully. He explained that to understand a situation critically, one needs to understand the role of knowledge, reflexivity and power in a particular social structure; thus involving both – theory and practice. He shares his own experience and stresses that in order to reflect critically he had to learn the techniques to analyze his beliefs and assumptions to understand them beyond the surface level. To do so, one needs to re-visit his/her writings and consciously understand what decisions were taken and why; what problems were solved, which were left unresolved and why. Thus self-questioning is the key to reflect critically.

Reflective learning or reflective observation is an important aspect of experiential learning cycle, yet reflection is difficult to implement by educators. Dewey divided experience into two types, the primary and the secondary experiences. The primary experience is acquired through one’s interaction with one’s environment (Miettinen, 2000) and then later forms into what Dewey called habits. He elaborated the secondary experience as reflective in nature. When there is an obstruction in a primary experience, then the environment and one’s relationship with the environment becomes the source of reflection (Miettinen, 2000). Miettinen (2000) explained in detail Dewey’s five step process of reflective learning.

Reflective learning according to Dewey starts with the indeterminate situation, when the normal course of activity is broken and a state of uncertainty is taken over. The second step now is intellectualization, when one tries to define the obstacle in the way of action and conceptualizes the difficulty. Formation of a working hypothesis is the next step
towards successful reflection, where one forms some sort of a guiding plan to get out of a particular situation. The fourth step is reasoning where one elaborates on the initial idea that he formed in the previous step. The last step given by Dewey for successful reflective learning is testing of the hypothesis. When the hypothesis is tested, then the hypothesis may or may not work. Dewey therefore, gives a complete procedure of how reflective learning takes place.

According to Boud (2001), reflection caters to making sense of experiences that have occurred. It happens when one looks back at the events took place and the feelings, the emotions and the thoughts that accompanied these events. He stressed that to reflect must be learned such that it becomes a part of one’s daily routine. Thus, a deeper understanding of one’s action is obtained through returning to the lived experience and to recapture its full impact on the learner; and one way to do it is through writing a journal. He is of the view that a written account helps one to revisit one’s experience and to retrieve events. He adds that feelings must be given due importance where the negative feelings coming with an experience must be checked and made sense of, whereas the positive ones must be rejoiced. This lays the ground to examine an experience. This examination further involves, “relating new information to that which is already known, seeking relationships between new and old ideas, determining the authenticity for ourselves of the ideas and feelings that have resulted, and making the resulting knowledge one’s own, that is, a part of one’s normal ways of operating (Boud, 2001, p. 14). Nevertheless, it is important that ‘how to reflect’ is a quality that must be taught in order to obtain fruitful results from an experience.

Ash and Clayton, (2004) point out that implementation of reflective learning becomes difficult for teachers as there are no structures in place through which the faculty may guide their students through reflective learning. They explained that students’ self-report and testimonials cannot be trusted unless and until the students are taught to reflect. By learning how to reflect the students can better associate their experiential learning with academics, with better and deeper understanding of the subject matter (Ash & Clayton, 2004). The learners are open to new ideas, they look at problems through a different lenses and apply critical thinking skills to problem solving (Ash & Clayton, 2004). The product of reflective learning is known as Articulated Learning (AL) which is structured in light of four guiding questions (Ash & Clayton, 2004, p. 142): (a) What did I learn? (b) How,
specifically, did I learn it? (c) Why does this learning matter, or why is it significant? (d) In what ways will I use this learning; or what goals shall I set in accordance with what I have learned in order to improve myself, the quality of my learning, or the quality of my future experiences or service?

These questions are the guiding questions for students and by reflecting upon them, they will get a better insight of their learning. Even though it is known that feedback and reflection are important in order to get maximum benefit from the experiential learning program (Eyler, 2009). It is best for facilitators and teachers to choose a reflective learning facilitation tool as any work experience can be changed into a learning experience through context based reflection (Eyler, 2009). Through using these tools of reflection students are able to connect concrete with abstract and reflection with action and thus they began to understand and make sense out of their experience (Eyler, 2009). To measure reflective learning, Ash and Clayton (2009) have produced the DEAL model for critical reflection. This model consists of three important steps: Describe an experience, examine the experience and articulate learning. Figure 3 shows the DEAL model for Critical reflection.

![DEAL Model for Critical Reflection](image)

*Figure 4. DEAL Model for Critical Reflection*

The first step in the DEAL model is to describe an experience. The reason for this exercise given by Ash and Clayton (2009) is that this description is the backbone of
meaning making of an experience. According to them this step is not as easy as students often jump straight to interpretation, therefore instructor should be careful that the activities are described properly (Ash & Clayton, 2009). The next step is the examination of that experience. DEAL model makes sure that students do not just summarize their experience since the examination activity is linked with the goal of the activity. The last step in the DEAL Model helps students to articulate their experience through the data generated in the previous two steps. According to Ash and Clayton, “It helps them capture their learning in such a way as to be able to act on it and thereby improve the quality of their learning and their future actions” (p. 43).

Ash and Clayton have given rubrics to measure each of the reflective practices so that the teachers as well as the students who are engaged in experiential learning do not lose track of their goals. It becomes important that when teachers develop an experiential learning activity, they are well equipped with the DEAL model for critical reflection in order for that activity to take place successfully. Without introducing the students with reflective practice, the experiential learning will be incomplete and lose all its essence.

2.5. Internships

Internships can be defined as, “any carefully monitored piece of work or service experience in which an individual has intentional learning goals and reflects actively on what she or he is learning throughout the experience or duration of attachment” (Bukaliya, 2012, p. 120). The definition points out towards some very important points: Firstly, the task in order for it to be called an internship should be an experience in a particular service for a fixed duration of time; secondly, the piece of work or the task at hand should be monitored carefully; thirdly, the intern should have some learning goals that he/she wants to achieve through internship; and finally, the intern should continuously participate in reflection. Internships are an integral part of good business education where students experience a taste of real world within a guided and structured program. But the problem arises when the internship programs are not well structured and lack either one or two, or in some cases, all the integral points for an internship mentioned above.
2.5.1. The Internship Structure

More than often, educational institutions come under attack for not providing students with fruitful supervision and work activities at the internship (McHugh, 2016). The purpose of an internship is to let students shape their experiences freely; yet, this experience should be well structured (Bandow, 2015; Eyler, 2009; Warren, 1997). By ‘well structured’ Warren (1997) means that the tasks given to the interns should be meaningful and goal oriented where their progress is monitored and they are provided with instant feedback.

There are three people who are very important for an internship program to be well structured and fruitful for the intern: The program director, the on-job supervisor and the faculty supervisor. Warren (1997) points out that it is crucial for institutes to appoint an internship program director - a very committed person and there to help students throughout their internship - from establishing their goals to whenever a query or a hurdle arises during the internship. Moore and Plugge, (2008) also endorse the point made by Warren by adding that the program director should make a continuous effort to add companies to their pool of companies offering internships. They highlight the role of the program coordinator or in some cases the program director by stressing that it is important for the program coordinator to have knowledge about what the industry is hoping to gain from the internship programs that they are offering and also about what expectations do the interns have from the internship program. They stressed that more information that the program director will have about the needs and demands of the industry and the skills of the interns, he/she will be able to align the program in a better way with their needs. It is not only the university that is responsible to give a diligent program coordinators to the interns, it is also the organization that should provide interns with an on-job supervisor.

According to McHugh, (2016) internship on-job supervisors play a very important role in an internship setting. It is important that an on-job supervisor realizes his/her duties towards the interns who has multiple responsibilities; where the first and the foremost is to make sure that an intern very well understands his/her duties and scope of work in the host organization and is provided with the background information about the organization (Bandow, 2015; NSEE, 2013; Eyler, 2009). Numerous researches (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009; Bandow, 2015; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Eyler, 2009; Hoyle & Goffnett, 2013; Warren, 1997) have highlighted the importance of formulating goals before stepping into
the arena of internships; thus, it is recommended that like in any experiential learning project, students must formulate their objectives and goals beforehand so that they do not lose their focus in the day-to-day office working environment. The on-job supervisor must explain the task goals to the interns as well, which are the work products that an intern is supposed to be involved in, and the standards that measure these work products (McHugh, 2016). Unexplained task goals can lead to frustration at work which can negatively hamper interns’ work, attitude and learning at the internship setting (Locke & Latham, 2002; McHugh, 2016). It is the responsibility of the on-job supervisor and the faculty supervisor to help interns formulate goals that are achievable, realistic and within the domain of their internship and the progression of interns towards these goals are continuously monitored (Bandow, 2015; Boyatzis, 2002; NSEE, 2013; Eyler, 2009). Lastly, the on-job supervisor must see to it that appropriate physical arrangements are made beforehand regarding the work space and equipment, and provide other appropriate materials for the intern to work efficiently (Judkins, Morris, & Moloczniak, 2011; True, n.d).

As stated earlier that the role of a faculty-supervisor is to help interns chalk down their goals and then make sure that all internship activities are leading towards the goals (Bandow, 2015; Boyatzis, 2002; NSEE, 2013; Eyler, 2009). It is also important for faculty supervisor to be in continuous contact with the on-job supervisor and the intern so that the intern’s progress is continuously being evaluated (Bandow, 2015; Eyler, 2009; True, n.d). The faculty supervisor is also responsible for making sure that the interns are regularly submitting their reflections and submit the internship report at the end of the internship (Bandow, 2015; Eyler, 2009; Parilla & Hasser, 1998; True, n.d).

On-job and faculty supervisors should be aware of the needs of an intern and should have the ability to be a supportive. As the definition of the internship points out, the internships should be closely monitored, therefore it also becomes the responsibility of the educational institutes to make sure that supervision is provided to the interns by their institute as well as the company where they are interning.

2.5.2. Internships and Job Opportunities

The literature points out towards many benefits of an internship program, where a liaison is created between business schools and industry through internship programs (Gault, Redington, & Schlager, 2000). The students get the opportunity to link their
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

classroom knowledge with the real life experience through enriching their work experiences; this helps students to form a more rounded personality (Beck & Halim, 2008). When students get involved in learning-through-doing and have some independence in making decisions, such learning experience increases their motivation and self-efficacy making them life-long learners (Beck & Halim, 2008). It creates an opportunity for business schools to place their graduates in good positions with good packages within the job market, thus increasing the ranking of their university. On the other hand, students are able to find a job for themselves as soon as they leave their university and the employers get their return on investment through skilled workforce (Gault, Redington, & Schlager, 2000). McCollum and Schoening, (2004) expand upon intern employability and add that even though the main purpose of internships across all disciplines is same; yet, business internships are minutely different from the rest. They give the example of internships conducted in the medical and administration fields and point out their difference from the business internships. They elaborate that in medical or administrative internships, the intern’s only purpose is to learn from his/her senior. On the contrary, in a business internship along with learning from their seniors, the interns are also able to find a permanent job, as for companies, this is one way of recruiting talent (McCollum & Schoening, 2004).

According to McCollum and Schoening, (2004) the job applicants who have internships added to their resume are not only offered better positions but are called more often to the job interviews and also get more job offers than those job applicants who do not have an internship experience added to their resume. An intern may want to take up a number of internship projects which allows interns to grasp a wide range of experience before he/she finally decides where he/she wants to be placed (Donovan and Garnett, 2006. Staniewski and Awruk, (2015) have given another advantage of an internship. Since their research concluded that young entrepreneurs lack in experience, appropriate knowledge and funding; therefore, they are of the view that there should be more investment in business internships as these give young entrepreneurs the exposure they need in terms of business and financial management to start their own business. Through internships, the students are able to experience what it is to work in a company (Hurst & Good, 2009). Moreover, internships help students to develop and strengthen core marketable skills that
are now required by the industry; such as, time management, self-confidence, communication and self-motivation (Hurst & Good, 2009).

Similarly, companies by inducting interns are able to judge whether an intern’s potentials are in accordance with the company’s culture and requirements before they extend a job offer to them (Hurst & Good, 2009) as it is much easier to judge a one’s interpersonal and technical skills when one is working in the company environment than in an interview (Beck & Halim, 2008). Also, the company is at gain as the intern is contributing to the company by either relieving a full time employee of everyday task or by helping them to complete a project; yet, the intern is either not being paid at all or is being paid unsubstantial amount of money (Beck & Halim, 2008). Thus Camilleri (2016) goes to the extent to say that companies should collaborate with the educational institutions and plan such educational courses and programs that are tailor made according to the company’s needs. Such programs will be helpful to minimize the gap that exists in the labour market (Camilleri, 2016).

Hurst and Good (2009) conducted a review of the internship literature of the past 20 years and they discovered that the general outlook of the employers and the academicians have been positive towards internships; nevertheless, there are five areas where a change was observed. They point out that the companies when recruiting interns are looking for a future employee. In this manner, companies are saving their recruitment cost and are putting more time and effort in choosing the right intern. Also, they elaborated that companies mark the schools that they feel would satiate their requirement for an intern as it further reduces their effort and time. Secondly, Hurst and Good noted that there was an increased endorsement of internships by the educators and the employers in the last two decades. Hurst and Good cited Paulins (2008) and established the importance of internships as these programs helped students to apply their classroom knowledge in real life situations; made them lifelong learners by teaching them to reflect on their situation; familiarized them with on-job setting; helped them in assessing the workplace environment and chalk down their own career goals; and lastly provided them with networking opportunities. Hence, “College students can be extremely valuable contributors to the organization’s mission if the internship programme is well-organized and executed” (Hurst & Good, 2009, p. 178). It again comes down to making the internship experience a fruitful one for the students by planning it so well that it becomes purposeful and effectual for them.
Thirdly, Hurst and Good (2009) point out that in the last 20 years there have been issues regarding paid and unpaid internships as there are a few internships that are paid and the unpaid ones are in bulk. But internships have been seen as in favour of students and as a learning activity where payment for the job that the interns do is not necessary. Hurst and Good explained this by quoting the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA). According to FLSA the internship training should be considered like the vocational training; the main beneficiaries of internships are the students themselves; the interns do not replace employees, in fact they work under close supervision of these employees; the employer does not get any immediate benefit from the internships; the interns do not have any written commitment of a job offer from the employer and lastly, the interns must have an understanding of internships being unpaid. Fourthly, Hurst and Good explain that the companies nowadays are making a conscious effort to socialize the interns in the company’s culture. And lastly according to Hurst and Good, the internships are becoming more project oriented. Two decades before, the students were sent to different departments of a company and the internships were rotational based. The current scenario is different and the students are a part of some team or a project where they are given a responsibility or a task.

Whatever the nature of an internship may be, one thing is very clear, that the academia, the industry as well as the interns know and understand the importance of the internship programs (Moore & Plugge, 2008). In the research conducted by Moore and Plugge (2008), the internship sponsors or the industry viewed internships to be a major provider of the workforce to them whereas the interns viewed internships as a practical learning experience.

Pakistani business schools are no exception as business schools across Pakistan are trying to train their students to face the dynamic business world. Ume-Amen (2014) conducted a survey to gauge the satisfaction level of employers with the Pakistani business school graduates. She observed that the employers were not much satisfied with the knowledge, skills and the attitude of the business school graduates. Amongst other recommendations, she recommended that the corporate sector should offer internship programs where they can harness business graduates according to their need.

To bring the Pakistani educational standards at par with the international education standards, Federal Government of Pakistan established Higher Education Commission or
generally known as HEC (Sohail & Delin, 2013) therefore, while developing quality indicators for academia and educational institutes, national and international trends were also looked into by HEC so that there was a growth in socioeconomics of the country (Memon, Sajid, & Qureshi, 2008). Thus, HEC has made it mandatory for all business schools to ensure internship programs for their students so as to achieve the required international standards. On the other hand AACSB considers industry engagement of business school students of utmost importance. Standard 13 of AACSB talks about student academic and professional engagement which, “occurs when students are actively involved in their educational experiences, in both academic and professional settings, and when they are able to connect these experiences in meaningful ways (AACSB International, 2016, p.37).” Thus it becomes essential to “document experiential learning activities that provide business students with knowledge of and experience in the local and global practice of business and management across program types and teaching/learning models employed (AACSB International, 2016, p. 38).”

More than any other factor, the human resource was pronounced in generating not only financial profits but also for sustaining comparative strategic advantage (Janjua & Sobia, 2010). Therefore, the managers considered human capital as the most valuable assets of firms. For the same reason making related internship placements was made mandatory which would generate the solution required for the Pakistani industry (Memon, Sajid, & Qureshi, 2008) in terms of providing the industry with skilled manpower. By implementing internships as a fundamental pedagogical tool, HEC Pakistan aims at building Pakistani human capital which can accept the challenge of the ever-changing environment and which is directly proportional to the economic growth of a country.

Donovan and Garnett’s (2006) conclusion that they give for state internship program is apt for all internship programs, “For internships to realize their full potential for channeling the brightest and best and helping equip interns with the knowledge and skills to serve competently, internships need to be taken seriously by governments, national commissions, and educators (p. 715)”.

2.6. Conceptual Framework

For this study I utilized the DEAL model for critical reflection as it comfortably fits in Kolb’s experiential learning cycle. I also saw what difference the implementation of DEAL model brought in the effectiveness of students’ experiential learning practice. The
focus on DEAL model for critical reflection would be crucial to gauge both: The quality of internships as a form of experiential learning and its effect on human capital through the process of systematic firm’s education cycle.

Based upon previously discussed models of systematic internship cycle, Kolb’s experiential learning cycle and DEAL model for critical reflection, I propose a self-developed ‘Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships’ which will guide educators in business schools to conduct successful business internship programs. This model will also form the basis to conduct the research at hand. Figure 4 shows the visual representation of Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships (RFGHCI)

![Diagram of Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships (RFGHCI)](image)

*Figure 5. The Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships*

The RFGHCI model focuses upon the generation of human capital through internships using Kolb’s experiential learning model exclusively using the DEAL model for reflections. It explains how systematic internship education encompasses the whole experiential learning process. Furthermore, it acknowledges the development of human capital through internships that are truly experiential in nature. The model is the visual representation of using the DEAL model for reflection in Kolb’s experiential learning model; that further becomes a part of systematic internship education thus generating human capital. This model will help students not only construct their internship goals but
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

also achieve them. As elaborated by Hurst and Good (2009), “Although internship programmes serve many purposes and have potentially positive outcomes for corporate stakeholders, the needs and objectives of the college interns must be satisfied for such programmes to persist” (p.196).

2.7. Summary

Since internship programs are an integral part of a business education and play a vital role in preparing future managers and leaders, therefore, it is vital for universities and the industry to continuously evaluate these programs so that they can get the type of workforce that the industry requires (Hurst & Good, 2009). It is also of immense importance that the students take internship opportunities to connect their classwork knowledge with the practical work environment. If properly mentored during their internships with clear objectives in mind and by composing thought provoking reflections, the students become lifelong learners and human capital for a country.
3. CHAPTER THREE: Methodology

3.1. Introduction

Two aspects of this research needed to be considered before choosing the appropriate methodology for this research: First, it should cater to the RFGHCI model and second, it should be able to answer the research questions. The intent of the methodology chosen was to put the RFGHCI model into practice and to see whether or not using this model improves internship practice and how it affects human capital generation. Such a methodology had to be chosen that would give a clear picture of the internships currently taking place and the changes observed in the internships after using the RFGHCI model.

3.2. Research Methodology

This research was conducted using the case study approach. Merriam (2009) defined case study as “A case study is an in-depth description and analysis of a bounded system” (p. 40); whereas, Woodside (2010) defined it as “an inquiry that focuses on describing, understanding, predicting, and/or controlling the individual (i.e., process, animal, person, household, organization, group, industry, culture, or nationality)”. Bryman, (2012) says that the case study approach is one that emphasizes upon an intensive examination of the setting. Merriam further elaborates that the major characteristic of a case study is its defining nature such that in order for it to be a case study, one particular set up that is a single unit, a classroom, a school, an institute or a program should be investigated. She points out the technique to understand if the research under investigation is case study or not. She says that if the data collected is finite, that is, if the interviews, observations, surveys are finite then the study will be a case study. Woodside (2010) added that a case study uses multiple methods of data collection which are triangulated to achieve in-depth analysis.

On the basis of criteria laid down by Marriam (2009) and Woodside (2010), the purpose of this research can only be achieved through the usage of case study technique because not only the unit of analysis in this research was the internship program at a renowned private business school but also, the data collected was finite as it pertained to the institute only. Finally, multiple sources of data collection were used, which included: individual semi-structured interviews, intern reflections, focus group interviews, document
analysis of the intern evaluation forms and the reports submitted by the interns. Leavy, (2015) divided the case study approach into five categories as explained in Table 2.

Table 2
*Types of case studies and their characteristics*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Case study</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic case study</td>
<td>One that is studied to learn about a particular case itself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental case study</td>
<td>A case is chosen to gain insight into a particular issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collective case study</td>
<td>An extension of the instrumental case study to several cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory-led or theory-generated case study</td>
<td>i) First it starts from a specific theory that is tested through the case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) Second, a theory is constructed through interpretation of data generated in the case.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation case study</td>
<td>It has three essential features:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i) To determine the value of the case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) To include and balance different interests and values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iii) To report findings to a range of stakeholders in ways that they can use</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The case study that was carried out in the present research had the characteristics of two types of case studies: instrumental case study and theory led/theory generated case study. It is an instrumental case study as it studied the issue of internships in a bounded system and it is a theory-led or theory-generated case study as it studied two theories, human capital theory and experiential learning theory, and two models experiential learning model and reflective writing model. Using these theories and models, not only, a new model, the RFGHCI model was generated but also its workability was tested.

The critics of the case study approach point towards it being non-generalizable and that a case study is unable to extract deeper understanding of a phenomenon due to a small sample size. Creswll (2007) pointed out that the word generalizability has very little meaning for qualitative researchers, whereas Woodside (2010) confronts these claims by saying that the triangulation method is used to get a deeper understanding of a phenomenon as the data is gathered using multiple sources. Also, it must be kept in mind that the purpose of a case study is not to generalize findings but to either build a theory or to test a theory; in this case, the RFGHCI model showing the connection between the human capital and the experiential learning theories are being tested. Thus, in a case study, a researcher prefers depth over breath (Hollway & Jefferson, 2000). Nevertheless, “the individual case can be
used as a starting point in the process of analytic induction, affording an opportunity for working from the ground up by drawing together additional cases to move towards more general claims” (Frost, 2011, p. 47).

Due to the above mentioned qualities of a case study, the purpose of this research was fulfilled using the case study technique of inquiry.

3.3. Procedure

The procedure of this case study was in accordance with the procedure laid down by Creswell (2007) which consists of five phases which were all followed in order to get the required results. Figure 8 shows the visual representation of these phases:

*Figure 6. The five phases of conducting a case study laid by Creswell (2007)*

Phase I: The researcher sees if his research is fit to be a case study. To do this, the researcher identifies the unit of analysis that has boundaries and will help researcher understand the case in-depth. For this study, the internship program of a business institute was chosen as the unit of analysis.

Phase II: This phase includes understanding the type of case study that will be conducted. This case study was identified as instrumental case study and theory led/theory generated case study.

Phase III: The data is collected using multiple sources and is extensive. The data in this case study was obtained by using semi-structured individual interviews (on-job supervisors and the Head, International Cooperation, Placement and Alumni Department), focus group interviews (three sets of interns) and document analysis (reflections, reports
and intern evaluation). The data collection process which was done in two phases is described below:

a) Phase I: In a case study, it is a common practice that a researcher may start his/her research by conducting individual interviews to understand the scope of problem. For this purpose interviews were conducted from 10 interns - two from finance, five from management and three from human resource - who had completed their internships. These interviews gave me an insight into the problems that the interns face during the internships and their perception about the fruitfulness of this pedagogy. The results of these initial interviews were also important because not only did they give me data to make an internship manual but also helped me in chalking out the next phase of my research.

b) Using the data collected from the interviews and after obtaining the internship documents from the internship and placement office of the institute, I developed a manual (Appendix A) which composed of three parts. Part A catered to the needs of the interns and chalked out the purpose and the process of internships for them. Part B helped the job-supervisors to look through the purpose and the process of internships; whereas, Part C catered to the needs of the faculty in charge of the internships. Also, after reviewing the related literature, the RFGHCI model was developed to further the experimentation.

c) Phase II began with identifying the cases and getting in touch with them in order to get their consent to participate in the study. I met with the interns individually who consented to be a part of the study to share the internship manual with them. This helped them to understand and recognize the institute’s expectations from the six week long internship. These students were taught how to set internship goals for themselves. They were further taught how to compose their reflections using Ash and Clayton (2004,2009) goal setting and reflective practice model. They were shown the usage of reflective rubrics given by Ash and Clayton (2009) to assess their reflections. The cases in the experimental group sat down with their respective supervisors and chalked out the internship goals for themselves and sent these goals to me.

d) I coordinated with the interns throughout the internship and they met me in person or conversed with me on the phone at least twice during the internship period.
Through their reflective writing which was submitted twice a week and continuous contact, I knew exactly what was going on at the internship.

e) At the end of the internship I interviewed the on-job supervisors of these 12 cases under study and three focus group interviews were carried out where each group was representing a specialty.

f) One interview from the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department was conducted.

g) Document analysis of intern reports, their reflections and their evaluation report was conducted

Phase IV: The data analysis can either be holistic (analysis of the entire case) or embedded (analysis of the specific aspect of the case). Embedded analysis was conducted using the data analysis framework through triangulation for case studies, adapted from Woodside (2010) as the object was to look for the answers of the research questions.

Phase V: This is the final phase known as interpretive phase. In this phase, the researcher tends to give meaning to the findings and lesson learnt from the cases are reported. The final phase of this research also sought to interpret the findings and the lessons learnt from the findings.

3.4. Unit of Investigation

The internship program run by the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation Department of one of the leading private institutes in the field of business education was the unit of investigation which has been ranked as one of the top universities by not only Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan but also by the Provincial Government of Sindh. It is well known in providing the students with academic resources and up to mark campus facilities by continuously investing in campus infrastructure.

The institute offers programs from Bachelors to PhD level and boasts of their highly competent faculty that exposes students to various challenges, inside and outside the institute, which the students may face in the industry. The website of this institute also claims that the students involved in BBA and MBA programs are taught functional subjects in the field of business management such as accounting, finance, marketing, entrepreneurship and management, along with MIS. All the above subjects are taught emphasizing upon social awareness, leadership, creativity and innovation. The students of
this institute are taught through the latest teaching methodology using experiential learning so as to develop students in critical thinking, and to apply the academic knowledge in real world situations and challenges.

This business institute is currently working under the FRUCE model of HEC and requires its undergrad and graduate students to be a part of six weeks internship program in order for them to secure a degree. The institute also wants to acquire the AACSB accreditation. As such, there are some benchmark marks that the institute should meet in order for it to achieve this milestone. One of the most fundamental areas that AACSB focuses upon is to connect theory with practice making it fundamental for all business schools to make it a part of their mission. In this regard, it stresses that teaching and learning activities fostered by degree program curricula should highlight the importance of student engagement with the corporate world using experiential learning methodologies the outcomes of which are measurable. AACSB further elaborates that it is through internships that student academic and professional engagement occurs. Thus, students are actively involved in their educational experiences, in both academic and professional settings, and are able to connect these experiences in meaningful ways. The AACSB document also makes it clear that in order to make meaningful connection of their experiences with the theory in a corporate setting; the students must be reflective thinkers and must be able to apply the learnt knowledge.

This means that the internship should be a focused, goal oriented, well-structured and have measurable outcomes, where students using their previous knowledge are continuously constructing knowledge by reflecting upon their experiences. It is also important to note that no experience can be considered meaningful unless it is reflected upon. Therefore, the internships, which are a bridge between theory and experience, should be a well-constructed activity fulfilling all domains of experiential learning.

To achieve this aim and to align its internship program with the requirements of AACSB, the institute has used the case study method where the RFGHCI model will be put into play. This model will guide the institute in making protocols that will bring forth the fruitfulness of internships by measuring the actual learning of students during and after an internship.

3.5. The Sample
The sample was chosen keeping in mind theoretically driven research questions. Sample selection in qualitative research is mostly purposeful as the underlying assumption is that the researcher wants to gain insight or understand an issue; consequently, such cases should be selected that are information rich, that is, these cases can provide the researcher with optimum information regarding the issue at hand (Creswell, 2007; Merriam, 2009; Yin, 2011). Creswell (2007) points out that it is challenging for a researcher to select only a few cases within a bounded system and analyze these cases in depth in order to achieve an in-depth analysis of the question at hand. He further stated that a researcher may choose many cases within a bounded system to compare and contrast the experiences of the cases at hand.

As discussed above, critics of case study are of the view that research conducted on a single case is not generalizable as in the case of a survey research; this argument is the major source of polarization between the qualitative and quantitative research (Hollway & Jefferson, 2000). The quantitative researchers are more interested in breadth evidence (generalizable to population) in a research, whereas qualitative researchers are interested in the depth evidence (theoretically driven research questions) that they want to obtain from their research findings (Hollway & Jefferson, 2000). The depth in a case study can also be explained by the claim made by the case study researchers that they interest themselves in “intensive examination of a single case” the results of which are then understood in light of a concept or a theory (Bryman, 2012). The central issue in a case study is the quality of the theoretical reasoning where case studies are used for both, theory generation and theory testing (Bryman, 2012). Thus analogy of generalization through sample size does not cater for case studies because the case study does not rely upon statistical generalization (Bryman, 2012; Creswell, 2007; Hollway & Jefferson, 2000; Woodside, 2010; Yin, 1994); rather, it focuses upon analytic generalization (Woodside, 2010; Yin, 1994). Yin further explains that case study research does not generalize to a population, instead the “study should seek to develop and then discuss how its findings might have implications for an improved understanding of particular concepts (p. 100).”

### 3.5.1. Sample Size

The sample for this research were undergrad students of a business school in Karachi who either had completed their internship, as in the case of Phase I of this research
or were students who were being studied as cases in the internship setting during their internship, as in the case of Phase II of the research. The Phase II of the research also included 12 on-job supervisors of the interns and the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department.

Table 3  
*Sample size and distribution*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
<th>On-job supervisors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-job supervisors</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first phase consisted of individual semi-structured interviews of interns who had completed their internship to understand the problems and successes they faced during the internship and also to get a clear insight into the whole internship experience and process. The sample size for these interviews was 10 – three interns were from human resource, five from marketing and two from finance. For the semi-structured individual interviews for Phase 1 of the study I reached out to 13 interns, out of which 10 agreed to share their internship experience. Two interns had found a job and said that they were very busy to find time for the interview and excused themselves; whereas, one intern was very ill and was in no shape to give interview.

The second phase of the research was to select cases that were to begin their six week internship and guide them through the internship using the RFGHCI model. The sample consisted of 12 students that applied for internships in the spring 2017 semester and their respective job-supervisors (12 in number) and the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department. This group was further divided into three groups that are according to the majors in business studies offered by their institute, which are Finance, Human Resource and Management. Table 3 provides the breakdown of the sample.
For the experimental study, 16 interns were approached but only 12 consented to take part in the study. One intern said she was out of town; I was unable reach one as his phone was continuously shut off and he did not reply to my emails. The other two said that they will do their internship in the summer 2017 semester and wanted to take a break. All 12 interns did their internship in varied organizations and pseudonyms were used to address them throughout the study. Table 4 shows the interns known by their pseudonyms, their field of major and their interning organization.

Table 4

Pseudonyms, Major and Interning Organization of Interns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Intern pseudonym</th>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Internship organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Almas</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>A private services firm dealing in Immigration to Canada and USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Anum</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>A multinational IT firm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Maria</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>A private oil retail firm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Aqib</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>A private pharmaceutical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Asim</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>A privately owned paint manufacturing company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hina</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>HR department of a hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Taha</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Pakistani private bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Taniya</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>HR department of a local TV channel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Shoaib</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>A private Sharia compliance firm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Beena</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Pakistani private bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Mana</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Pakistani private bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Waqar</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>The taxation department of a textile company</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 shows the distribution of the 12 cases understudy into various organizations. It is important to note that all accept one were a part of local organizations and only one was a part of a multinational organization.

3.6. Data Collection

The data in the first phase of the research was collected using semi-structured interviews. Ritchie and Lewis (2003) are of the view that there are two key data generation methodologies in a qualitative research, semi-structured individual interviews and focus groups. They elaborate that both these methodologies are often if not always, used in a same research study such that a researcher may first use open-ended interviews to generate data in accordance to individual understanding and then through focus groups may try to discuss the issues at hand at a more strategic level. In this research, I used the semi-
structured individual interviews to view business internships from the interns’ perspective and to understand the whole internship process.

The data in the second phase was collected using three sources – interns’ reflections, on-job supervisors’ and Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department’s semi-structured individual interviews, focus group interviews and project reports - that were then triangulated to produce the results. The best way to collect data in a case study is through using dissimilar and multiple research methods as this increases the value of the study through increasing accuracy of its results (Merriam, 2009; Woodside, 2010; Yin, 2011).

According to Merriam (2009), case study does not follow any particular method for data collection, or data analysis. Any method that sheds light on the topic under investigation and answers the research questions are acceptable; therefore, multiple methods of investigation were used to collect the data for this investigation. Keeping in mind that a case study research requires the sample and the data collection techniques to be able answer the research questions at hand; Creswell (2007) suggested a data collection matrix that would help the researcher keep boundaries of the study at hand. Figure 5 shows the data collection matrix of this research that helped the researcher focus exclusively on the research questions under study.
The very fact that a researcher has decided to perform a case study shows that the researcher is interested in the insight, the discovery and the interpretation of a certain phenomenon (Leavy, 2015) and is known as “interpretation in context” (Chronbach, 1975 as cited in Leavy, 2015). Alternative methods help researchers confirm or disconfirm the information gathered by the participants during the interviews (Woodside, 2010). Willig and Wendy (2008) cited Creswell (2002) and explained that data collection was fundamentally of any of the three Es:

a) Experiencing: Data collected through story-telling, self-reflection and intentional conversations
b) Enquiring: Data collected using interviews that may be unstructured and informal, semi-structured, structured and formal or focus groups

c) Examining: Data collected using texts and field notes

The researchers of case study research uses multiple methods of data collection to extend general existing knowledge and theory; therefore, even when researchers are focusing on a single case, they are in no way using a single genre of qualitative research to collect data (Wertz et al., 2011). Thus a case study research is not defined by its method of data collection and is not constrained by methodology; rather, it is bounded by the boundary of the case that it uses for data collection (Leavy, 2015).

Keeping in mind, the essentials of data collection in a case study, I used multiple methods to generate the required data which include: Individual semi-structure interviews, face-to-face/ telephonic conversations with interns, focus group interviews and document analysis.

3.6.1. Individual Interviews

This study had individual semi-structured individual interviews which were used first in Phase 1 to understand the process, working and nature of internships so that further modus operandi could be formulated for the case study to be conducted effectively. These interviews given in Appendix A were conducted from 10 interns who had undergone the internship experience. Based on these interviews, I was able to have a more clear idea of the scope of the problem, the internship process of the institute and the pros and cons of this procedure. These interviews helped in adding the missing sections in the internship manual. The questions asked were aligned with the RFGHCI model.

Semi-structured individual interviews were also used in phase 2 of this study where the interviewees were 12 on- job supervisors (Appendix B) and the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department (Appendix C). Out of the 12 on-job supervisors, nine face-to-face interviews were conducted whereas three telephonic interviews were conducted. Face-to-face interview was conducted with the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department. A rich data were collected using semi-structured individual interviews. The time duration of each of these interviews (conducted in phase 1 and phase 2 of the research) was 30 minutes approximately.
Individual interviews “provide an opportunity for detailed investigation of each person's personal perspective for in-depth understanding of the personal context within which the research phenomenon is located, and for very detailed subject coverage” (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003, p. 58). This method of data collection is used where it is important for the researcher to understand an issue in detail or where the researcher needs to relate different issues to individual personal circumstances (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Hence a researcher tries to extract as much information from the interviewee as possible by asking questions that focus upon interviewees’ behavior, attitudes, beliefs and values (Bryman, 2012). Bryman (2012) gives the following benefits of such interviews:

- Respondents can answer in their own terms. They are not forced to answer in the same terms as those foisted on them by the response choices.
- They allow unusual responses to be derived. Replies that the survey researcher may not have contemplated (and that would therefore not form the basis for fixed choice alternatives) are possible.
- The questions do not suggest certain kinds of answer to respondents. Therefore, respondents’ levels of knowledge and understanding of issues can be tapped. The salience of issues for respondents can also be explored.
- They are useful for exploring new areas or ones in which the researcher has limited knowledge.
- They are useful for generating fixed-choice format answers. This is a point that will be returned to below. If an open or open-ended question is asked, the interviewer may not write down everything said, may embellish what is said, or may misinterpret what is said (Bryman, 2012).

Semi-structured interviews sit between the two extremes of open-ended interviews and closed ended interviews; whereby a researcher develops a set of questions related to the phenomenon under investigation, which is used as a guide and not as a dictate (Willig & Wendy, 2008). Thus if the participant brings in a novel idea or an understanding of the issue at hand, this new perception is pursued (Willig & Wendy, 2008).

In a case study a researcher may want to use the face to face individual interview before a focus group interview as individual interviews can provide guidance into the issues that the researcher further wants to investigate through the focus group interviews (Verschuren & Doorewaard, 2010). Face-to-face individual interviews are, nevertheless,
most common method to extract the required information from individuals regarding their experiences and the meanings a context holds for them (Hollway & Jefferson, 2000). Hollway and Jefferson (2000) explain that even though the traditional interview formats required for the researchers to assume that question that will be asked is the question that will be understood. Yet, this may not be the case in recent times. It is not necessary and not guaranteed that every individual takes the same meaning of a question asked. This is where the role of an interviewer comes in; the interviewer must make meaning of the interviewee with reference to the interviewee’s context.

3.6.2. Focus Groups

The focus group method is a form of group interview in which: there are several participants (in addition to the moderator/facilitator); there is an emphasis in the questioning on a particular fairly tightly defined topic; and the accent is upon interaction within the group and the joint construction of meaning” (Bryman, 2012, p.502). This method is used to bring light to the research issue at hand and provide researcher an opportunity to understand why the participants hold certain beliefs about a phenomenon (Bryman, 2012; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Focus groups also provide opportunity to the participants to listen to one another and reflect on their own assumptions; they may then question each other or modify their own point of view (Bryman, 2012; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Thus, it helps participants in exploring other people’s beliefs and ideas and also how these beliefs and ideas are shaped. Such a methodology also highlights the differences that exist within the perceptions of individuals and the reasons behind these differences (Bryman, 2012; Leavy, 2015; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Leavy (2015) suggests that the results obtained from focus groups are more realistic as they mimic everyday experience of people such as experiences of talking to peers, colleagues, family and others in their social network and then making a decision or reaching a conclusion.

The number of participants in a focus group has been a matter of dispute amongst researchers where it was previously suggested that there must be eight to nine participants in a focus group; the latest literature suggests that the number of focus group participants can vary from three to ten (Bryman, 2012; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003; Wertz et al., 2011). In fact Bryman (2012) and Ritchie and Lewis (2003) support the idea of small focus as they claim that groups of three to five participants are very fruitful source of data generation as
the discussion remains under control of the moderator and all participants get an equal chance to have their say. Data in this research was also generated using three small focus groups, which were formed according to the interns’ majors. The smallest focus group consisted of three people and was of interns specializing in human resource development; whereas the largest focus group had five marketing interns and the third focus group had four finance interns. The duration of each focus group interview was 1 hour 30 minutes approximately where semi-structured interview questions were used to extract the required data. The questions were aligned with the research objectives and in accordance with the research questions (see Appendix D).

Bryman (2012), Leavy (2015), Ritchie and Lewis, (2003) and Yin (2011) have all pointed out towards the importance of the mediator of a focus group which is the researcher himself/herself. They are of the view that successful focus groups can generate the relevant data when the researcher knows where to cut the discussion in a focus group and where to let the participants continue. Also, it is crucial for the moderator to give everyone a chance to speak and if someone is sitting silently then the moderator must ask for that participants’ opinion. According to Yin (2011), if moderated properly, even one focus group generates sufficient data.

As the mediator of these groups, I made sure that the relevant data were extracted from them and that each participant had a chance to share his/her experiences.

3.6.3. Document Analysis

Any text (words) or images that have been recorded without the intervention of the researcher are known to be documents (Bowen, 2009). Document analysis is a systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents—both printed and electronic (computer-based and Internet-transmitted) material (Bowen, 2009, p. 27). Bowen (2009) and Leavy (2015) explain that document analysis is no different from any other qualitative data and requires that should be first examined and then interpreted for it to elicit meaning in order to gain understanding and for the development of empirical knowledge.

Merrium (2009) calls data analysis as one of the most important research methodologies in education research, whereas, Bowen (2009) and Leavy (2015) state that it is of great value in a case study research as data analysis contributes in giving rigor to a case study. Documents are used in a research to verify findings and to corroborate findings.
from other data collection sources (Bowen, 2009; Leavy, 2015; Merriam, 2009; Yin, 2011). If the evidence from the data analysis does not match the results from other sources, then the researcher must continue to look for more evidence until a satisfactory answer is found for the existing dichotomy (Bowen, 2009). Leavy (2015) is of the view that interviews are the heart of qualitative research but document analysis is used for augmentation and support of interview data. Thus, Yin (2011) has given the following four guiding questions for a researcher to consider while conducting a document analysis and comparing it with the results yielded from interviews:

1. If there are any discrepancies in the results of the document analysis and the interview, then what these discrepancies are and why might they exist?
2. If there are no discrepancies, then how was it that none at all discrepancy arose?
3. How does the person’s depth of understanding of the underlying issues compare to what is presented in the documentation?
4. In what ways does the person agree or disagree with the issues that are stated in the analyzed document?

In this case study, the data collected through the document analysis of the reports written by the interns and the evaluation forms filled by the job supervisors was used to confirm the data collected through their individual interviews as well as the reflections submitted by the interns. All of the four points given by Yin (2011) were looked into and the data collected was assessed accordingly. In this particular case, the reports were triangulated with the interns’ reflections and the supervisors’ interviews to see if the reports submitted to the internship department original or not. Also, the job-supervisors’ evaluation forms were triangulated with their interviews to see how much justified they were in giving the grades that they gave to the interns.

Even though most researchers are of the viewpoint that data analysis is mostly used in researches as a means of triangulation of data (Merriam, 2009; Yin, 2011); yet, Bowen (2009) and Leavy (2015) are of the view that document analysis can also be used as the main research methodology if the purpose of the research requires it. Nevertheless, it is mostly used as a source of triangulation and is combined with other qualitative methodologies to yield results (Bowen, 2009; Leavy, 2015; Merriam, 2009; Yin, 2011).
3.7. Data Analysis

Verschuren and Doorewaard (2010) are of the view that the characteristics of a case study must be kept in mind in order to successfully analyze its data. Thus, according to them, since the cases in a case study are small in number, therefore, the emphasis will not be on numbers but on the comparison of the results generated from these cases which will give the much needed depth to the study. Multiple sources for data collection and analysis are used as “Using multiple investigators, sources of data or data collection methods to confirm emerging findings. (Merriam, 2009, p. 229). This is known as triangulation of data which must also be carried out in order to gain a much talked about the holistic picture of a case (Verschuren & Doorewaard, 2010).

The data analysis was conducted using two different techniques for the two phases of the research. Since the purpose of Phase I was to understand the internship process and intern experiences, therefore holistic data analysis was conducted where the data collected from semi-structure interviews of the 10 interns were looked through to generate themes. This was done using manual thematic analysis, where the data is first coded and then the themes are generated. For Phase II of this research, an embedded analysis technique was used, where the purpose was to filter the data in such a way that the answers to the research questions can be extracted. This technique focuses upon the analysis of data, keeping specific aspects of the case in mind. For this purpose NVivo 11 was used. The analysis of data in a qualitative research takes place continuously during and after the research which leads to a continuous triangulation of data.

The triangulation of data according to Merriam (2009) is the basic strategy to obtain reliability and validity in a case study. Since reliability, validity and ethics are the major concerns in a research, therefore, triangulation involves the usage of more than one data collection method to study a phenomenon (Bryman, 2012). It is used to crosscheck the results obtained by one method with that of another method resulting in thick descriptions (Bryman, 2012). The researcher is able to obtain results that are trustworthy through employing different criteria to assess qualitative research data (Merriam, 2009). The internal validity – the extent to which research findings are credible- is obtained through the method of triangulation which involves cross-checking the interpretation of data achieved from one type of research method with data collected from another type of research method (Merriam, 2009). On the other hand, reliability – consistency in findings
– is obtained through explaining the underlying theories, explanation in detail of how the study was conducted and how the researcher was able to derive the findings from the data (Merriam, 2009).

“Triangulation could also be seen as an effective instrument for gaining an overall and holistic picture of the research object,” (Verschuren & Doorewaard, 2010, p. 179). Therefore, the framework for data analysis for this study consisted of triangulation technique of data analysis as is shown in figure 7.

Figure 7 has been adapted using the triangulation demonstration given by Woodside (2010). The figure shows seven categories of data where categories 1, 2, and 3 represent explicit as well as implicit information from all these three data collection sources separately. Categories 4, 5 and 6 reveal information from combination of two of these sources; whereas, category 7 represents information from all the three sources. Same data analysis framework was used to analyze and triangulate data between cases and then between specialties (human resource development, finance and management) in order to get a holistic view of the case at hand, as mentioned by Creswell (2007).
3.8. Ethical Consideration

Ethical considerations were taken into consideration for this research project. Written permission was taken from the then rector of the business institute. The Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department was explained how the research will be conducted and all documents were taken from their website and with their consent. The sample set was taken with the help of Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department of the institute under study. The department provided me with the names and phone numbers of interns who could be contacted at the time. Throughout the study, the beneficence of the research participant was kept in mind and no action was taken which would in any way overlook the welfare of the research participants. It was also kept in mind that the language used is in no way defamatory or maleficence in any way.

The interns were asked verbally via telephone to take part in the study and only those were included in the research who agreed. The interns were asked to share the internship manual with their on-job supervisors and form their internship goals in four domains: academic development goals (Eyler, 2009), career development goal (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008), skill development goal (Bell & Federman, 2010) and personal development goals (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). They were also told to tell their supervisors of the study and arrange an individual interview with them. So the on-job supervisors were well informed of this project and verbal consent via telephone was taken from them for the interviews. Pseudonyms for interns were used to define results of the study and the names of the organizations, the on-job supervisors were concealed and the business institute were concealed.

3.9. Role of the Researcher

As the researcher, my role was only to record interns’ reflections and to help them in understanding the reason behind the usefulness of goal formation and reflection writing and to continuously be in touch with them during the six week internship. I did not in any way intervene in the working of the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation Department. I was in no way in charge of the following:

- Checking their reports (the reports went to specialist faculty of their major)
• Grading their internships (the internship and placement office grades the internships after receiving their graded reports from the specialist faculty)

• In providing interns with the internship placement (this was done by the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department)

Even though I was not fully engaged as a faculty supervisor due to my limited role in as a researcher, my presence for the interns was a positive contribution. They called me whenever they felt stressed, over worked, happy or unhappy with their work. Even though I could not provide to them the academic support, I did, to some extent provide them with emotional support and helped them understand their reflections. A faculty supervisor is needed for academic and emotional support of the intern so that they may be able to understand and gauge their learning.

3.10. Summary

Case study method was found to be suitable for this research where a renowned business school in Pakistan was the unit of investigation and 12 cases were in depth studied using the RFGHCI model. Multiple methods of data collection were used which included semi-structured individual interviews from the on-job supervisors and the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department; three focus groups were conducted, one of marketing, one of HR and one of finance; whereas, document analysis of reflection, end of the project report and intern evaluation form was done. The results were obtained after triangulation of the data.
4. CHAPTER FOUR: Results

4.1. Introduction

This section is divided into two parts, in the first part the results of Phase I of the research are shared and in the second part the results of Phase II of the research are shared. Phase I of this research consists of the semi-structured individual interviews that were conducted in order to understand the problems faced by interns when they go for an internship. Based on the results of Phase I, an internship manual and the way forward for Phase II were developed. This section will answer the following two main research question and four sub research questions for the first main question and three sub questions for the second main question as given below:

1. How can Kolb’s experiential learning model be applied in an internship setting in Pakistan?
   i. How is goal setting useful in an internship setting in order to fully understand a concrete experience?
   ii. How can reflections be used as a tool for continuous assessment in an internship setting?
   iii. How does constant intern supervision in the internship program setting impact the overall program effectiveness?
   iv. What internship program structure does the employer use for intern placement?

2. To what extent are the internships adding to Pakistan’s human capital development?
   i. What is the understanding of the institution’s internship department regarding the success of an internship program?
   ii. What roles do internships play in gaining employment for the interns and potential employees for companies?
   iii. To what extent are the needs of the industry aligned with the courses delivered at the institution?

4.2. Results of Phase I

Phase 1 consisted of semi-structured interviews that were conducted from the 10 interns (two finance, five marketing, three HR) who already had gone through the internship experience. Even though the interviewees were initially divided into three
groups, yet the data analysis showed that there was no difference in their internship experience. This lead me to conduct the data analysis holistically and themes were generated were from all ten interviews. These interviews were transcribed using the transcribe software https://transcribe.wreally.com/. Then manual thematic analysis was conducted to generate themes, which helped in the construction of the internship manual and paved way forward for Phase II of the research.

4.2.1. The Internship Manual

The internship manual being used by the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department was taken and the missing sections were added to it. The manual used by the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation composed of the following documents: internship eligibility criteria, internship contract, instructions for students, intern evaluation form, front page of internship report, guidelines for internship report, HEC survey form and a sample report. After going through the individual semi-structured interview data and the relevant literature (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009; Bandow, 2015; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Boyatzis, 2002; NSEE, 2013; Eyler, 2009; Hoyle & Goffnett, 2013; Judkins, Morris, & Molocznik, 2011; True, n.d; Warren, 1997) describing the best internship practices, the following sections were added to the manual: (a) Introduction (see Appendix E), (b) the internship commitment (see Appendix F), (c) guidelines for faculty supervisors(see Appendix G), (d) guidelines for on-job supervisors (see Appendix H), (e) reflective writing guiding questions (see Appendix I), and (f) reflective writing rubrics (see Appendix J). The sample report was excluded from the manual because it was not relevant for the business students because it was engineering report and would have been a cause for confusion.

4.2.1.1. Introduction and internship commitment

These introduction sections in the manual were added in order for students to understand the purpose and the usage of the manual. The introduction and the internship commitment sections were written exclusively for the students so that they would be able to comprehend what the larger goal of internship is and how the internship will help them in their career and life. These sections are mandatory in all internship manuals as they help students in valuing their internships and the expectations that their institute and their
internship organization holds from them and can be considered as the prologue of an internship manual that need to be read and understood before moving on to the next step. These sections were considered to be important, as some if not all interns have the tendency to forge internship reports in order to get their degree because they do not want to put in the required effort and view internships as a futile activity. The interviewees suggested this thought in the following remarks:

“I know students who really do not do much in the internship but they just submit the internship report to the institution……so it is not taken seriously by the students.”

“Whether it is that we are learning or not, our aim is to submit the internship report.”

“Interns sometimes forge internship reports, but it is difficult for them to forge the supervisor evaluation sheet.”

Statements like the above showed that some interns were not aware of the importance that an internship has, but they were just interested in getting the certificate so that they could get their degree. It seemed important that these sections were added so that they realize the expectations that their alma mater and their internship organization have from them but also for them to value it because of the gains it will bring for them.

4.2.1.2. Guidelines for faculty supervisors

The business institute does not at the moment appoint a faculty supervisors for the interns. The need for faculty supervisors came out very clearly from the interviews conducted. It was apparent that all interns thought that there should be constant support from the university in the form of a faculty supervisor. The following statements from the semi-structure individual interviews makes the need for the supervisors very clear:

“(We need a faculty supervisor) from the beginning if she is there then it is going to help us out and she is going to help us as well, but from the start if she is there,” This intern further added, “there should be someone to guide us, because we have no idea what we are doing.”

Another intern added:

“One teacher should have like 5-6 students under him whom he can guide and monitor. Just like the capstone project the institute will also get to know if the student is doing the internship properly.”
The following idea was put forward by another intern:

“I think the institute can assign for example 7 students/teacher and there can be regular feedback sessions with teachers and supervisors. This way the students also have an idea where do they stand by the end of the internship.”

When the intern was probed further and asked, “How would have it (faculty supervision) helped you in your case?” the intern replied, “In writing assignments/tasks assigned to me. Instead of asking my job supervisor every little thing, I could have simply asked my faculty supervisor.”

On the other hand, another intern’s reply to the same point was:

“(If I had a faculty supervisor) I would have gotten some information about how to go about my work because the first week is very confusing. You have no idea what to do and the people over there, the employees, they think that we know everything which we don’t so we need to learn about it, how to go about it. Sometimes, you do not know what to do like in certain cases, so asking the supervisor again and again it seems like you are clinging to them. But in order to do the work so obviously you have to ask them so if the faculty advisor would have been there he would have actually told us how to do those things because we had no idea what to do.”

These statements make it clear that the interns during their internship they need support and reassurance of a faculty supervisor that they steered in the right direction. The statements also highlight the interns’ discomfort in going to the on-job supervisor again and again to enquire about their work, but it seemed that they had no other option. They would have felt at much more ease if a faculty supervisor was provided to them.

It also emerged from the interviews that students were taking help from their teachers even though faculty supervisors were not officially allotted to them. So even when teachers were not given credit for their supervision, they were supervising the students when needed. The statements below explain how and when the interns took advantage of their teachers.

“I- uhh... go myself. They never- they never refuse. If we go to our teachers, they never refuse. So, I did went to my teacher before the internship-internship period started, for suggestions whether I should go for it or not. What is better for me, because they have been in this field. So, they can
guide us well and there is no other guidance for us, because I being the eldest sister at home, I did not know much about wh-whether the step is right or not or whether I should wait to find some-something better for myself.”

Another intern shared his experience by saying:

“But I- I had one faculty member, I mean not- umm, the University did not give me a supervisor, but I trusted that faculty member and I consider her as a mentor, so that’s why- uh… you know, if there was any issue, I knew I had someone in the University to help me out.”

It was stated by an intern:

“It always happens you always need a teacher I have done four internships and I have always taken help from the teacher and I was at multinational FMCG, I took help from my sales teacher, and once I took help from Pakistan policy teacher, in this case also there were two times that I wanted to take help from the teacher...... I wanted to reach out to my brand manager teacher; he had taught us very well and I wanted to contact him, but I could not.”

Even though the institute did not provide interns with a faculty supervisor, yet, students in their desperation turned to their faculty for guidance, help and support. The students were comfortable with their teachers and found them to be supportive. A faculty supervisor was also needed by the interns for unseen circumstances, such as the following incidents quoted by the interns:

“They were two partners in the company, in dono ka conflict ho gaya tha toh woh bhi effect hua tha hum logo ki kaam per (they had a conflict which affected our work)...... It was difficult to understand kiske paas jaayen, (to whom we should go). So then there were two heads. Iski baat mane ya uski baat mane ek koi kuch aur keh raha tha dusra kuch aur kehta tha bahut haphazard ho gaya tha (should we listen to this head or that one, one used to say do this, the other said do that, the whole situation was a haphazard one).”

Another issue highlighted by an intern was: “They don’t let you go home in time, when you are done with one task and they give you another and at the end of the day you get very frustrated. And then when my internship was completed they were not giving me
the certificate. But if the institute is involved as a mediator then the company will be liable to give the certificate and to release the students.”

Also, a female intern narrated an incident, “There was a guy, an employee, who had a weird body language, means that he used to stare a lot. But what could you do, so I decided to handle it, so I thought that I should ignore it as I could not complain it to anyone. I thought such type of people must be in all organizations but I did not like it, because I was not used to of such behavior.”

These are some very serious issues that the interns were left to tackle on their own. Issues such as late hour sittings and unassigned job-supervisors were creating a problem for the interns but they had no idea who to turn to. A more serious problem was when a female intern complained that she felt uncomfortable because a male colleague kept on staring at her. Similar issues should have been properly handled; yet, the intern just kept sitting late as he was told, the intern with unassigned supervisor kept juggling with the work and the only thing the girl who was being stared at could do was to ignore the man and let him continue staring. From the above statements of the interns, it was obvious that they were in need of a faculty supervisor.

Instructions for supervisors were taken from the literature review conducted to understand the fundamentals of an internship. Keeping in mind that the Phase II of the case study the guidelines for the supervisors after being chalked out were added to the internship manual.

4.2.1.3. Guidelines for on-job supervisors

The review of the relevant literature suggested clearly chalked down guidelines for the on-job supervisors to follow; whereas, the individual semi-structured interviews from the interns revealed that the on-job supervisors were not fully aware of their facilitation role. This portion in the internship manual was important to help on-job supervisors understand their scope of work. The following statements from the interns show that the internship supervisors were not too clear about their scope of work.

“I was dealing with the whole digital marketing but koi learning nahi hui kyon keh koi seekhanay wala nahi tha agar koi head hoti aur uske neeche kaam kar rahi hoti toh shayad kuch sikhati (I did not get to learn anything because there was no one to teach, if there would have been a head, then maybe I would have gotten something to learn) ......
the head was the owner herself and she was looking after other stuff so she was unable to focus on us."

There were two interns who complained that they were not assigned proper supervisors and in fact each one of them was working under two supervisors. Thus, it was a source of confusion for the interns as to whom should they take instructions from. As one of the intern complained:

"I guess teamwork was main drawback since we had two heads and they both had conflicts….three weeks we worked as a team, designing marketing plan, attending meetings to implement our plans and strategies but later we were split it into two groups and conflicts arose among heads so in the last week we just completed our tasks and left."

Another intern complained that her work used to go unchecked due to work overload,

"They have a lot of work to do and the staff is very short so a lot of people have a multiple responsibilities which is you know my supervisor used to go crazy with all the responsibility and she used to give some to me and I used to do it for her because she had a lot of work. Most of the time we were doing work about which they had no idea for example converting the literature into lay man language into Urdu so these were the task about which they had no idea how to do so we were doing it for them."

In all the three cases, the interns were left on their own as the on-job supervisors were over loaded with work and did not have the time to follow up on the interns’ work. The interns were using their knowledge and skills according to the best of their abilities but whether the work they were doing was up to the standard or not and where it was lacking, about this, they had no clue. Thus, the interns were frustrated and felt that they were left in a limbo without the much needed support from the on job supervisors.

One intern highlighted the difference between good and bad supervisors by saying,

"A-a good supervisor makes you feel comfortable and you tend to ask all the questions- uhh, whichever it comes in mind. But if you don’t have a good supervisor then... L-l-like when I was interning at a bank, so there were different teams. Some team supervisors were very friendly, but some were very- umm... they- you could not approach them. So, if I had a problem I wouldn’t go to them."
An intern thought that it was a great blessing to have a good supervisor, as he said about his supervisor,

“She’s helpful. … I’m a fresh graduate and I don’t know much about the work place and stuff like that, so, she does look into my work, and if I need anything- she has given me an open space, so, you know, if I have any issues of any sort, I just go to her, and I tell her. So… she will not, like, uh, you know, some- there are some people who will just like, yell at you for doing a mistake or something. She’d laugh it out first, and then she, you know, resolves it.”

On the other hand, an intern complained, “to be very honest, you know, the behavior of the management there… they’re very strict, in terms of their working. Like in the interview, they did not talk about any late sittings etc, and, you know, the manager needs us to do late sittings.” Another intern complained that even though her on-job supervisor was nice and cooperative but when she got over worked, she used to shout. When the intern was asked, how she handled the shouting of her on-job supervisor, she said that she could not complain to anyone so she just ignored it.

It was revealed by an intern that his on-job supervisor and his colleagues at the organization where he was interning demotivated him by saying things such as, “Tum bahut kitabi baatein karte ho, tum log burger bacche ho tum log yaha adjust nahi kar sakte (You are talking bookish, you are too westernized and cannot adjust in this environment). They used to say that I am a liability and did not help me because they thought I could not adjust in their environment.”

Such behaviors of some of the on-job supervisors need to be checked. There are supervisors who use interns as their scape goats and take out all their frustration and anxiety on them. Shouting at interns and to make them sit late is unjustified, the interns should be respected and the rules of engagement with the interns should be made clear to the on-job supervisors.

Another HR intern who was given the task of handling trainee feedbacks and contacting them via phone calls had an on-job supervisor who only responded to the questions asked and was not pro-active in training the interns. As she commented, “I had one supervisor, she was really nice and answered all my questions whenever I asked something; however apart from my work or whatever I asked, I didn’t get to learn anything.
else…….The supervisors didn’t share her experience with the interns so in that way you can say mentoring wasn’t present.”

This particular on-job supervisor maintained her distance from the intern and kept the communication level at minimal with her which led the intern to feel that she did not learn as much as she could have if she had a supervisor who was more forthcoming in sharing her own experiences with the intern.

It was very clear that the on-job supervisors had no idea about what expectations did the interns and the educational institutes have from them and how were they supposed to help and guide the interns. The on-job supervisors did not have any proper guidelines which would help them to supervise the interns either from their own organization or from the educational institute under study. They needed some rules, regulations and guidelines to help, monitor, guide and support the interns. Since they had no guiding principles for conducting an internship, therefore, each job supervisor led the intern according to his/her understanding of the internship. It seemed that the center of the internship for the on-job supervisors was not the intern, rather their own personal workload. The learning of the intern was secondary for them; they seemed more interested in getting maximum work done from the intern so that their own workload is shared.

4.2.1.4. Reflective writing guiding questions and reflective writing rubrics

It was made clear from the semi-structured interviews conducted from the interns that they were confused about what their goals were and whether or not there was any learning that took place through the internship or not. The review of the literature showed that one way to tackle this and to make students lifelong learners and reflective practitioners, reflective writing guiding questions and their rubrics were added. The literature reviewed showed that reflective writing helped interns to monitor, gauge and direct their learning, and on the other hand they help faculty supervisors keep track of interns’ learning. These reflective practices were a fundamental part of the RFGHCI model and were added in the internship manual so that the internships could be conducted according to this model.
4.2.2. Course Alignment with Industrial Needs

Even though business schools are geared towards fulfilling the needs of the industry and to provide the industry with the much needed human capital, but through the interviews, it was discovered that this was not always the case and the business education provided by the institute was at times poles apart from what actually was going on in the industry. As one of the intern remarked, “We know that the practical life is very different from what we have been taught in the books.” This intern had gone for his internship at a small entrepreneurial setting and according to him, the course books written in the west gave a very idealistic setting which did not exist in Pakistan.

Another intern said about the courses studied at the institute, “I have studied marketing in my courses but when I went there, it was completely different, it was completely different from my expectations sari cheeje opposite thi,(all things were opposite) I think it’s like that I think it’s like that when it comes to practical life wahan par seth culture hai (there is seth culture there) ...I mean not a corporate sector culture when it comes to local companies..... I learnt that the life of book and the practical life are two very different things when it comes to marketing.”

The same thought was expressed by this intern who said that whatever is written in the books is very different from what actually happens in the industry, therefore what is taught in business schools should be aligned with the ground realities that exist in the industry. Another intern thought that she entered her internship with a mindset that she had already learnt everything from her course books and she only has to now practically apply all the theories and concepts taught to her in her courses at the internship. But according to her, learning was inevitable,

“I just wanted to improve my skills, initially learning was not in my mind (because I thought that the learning part had been taken care of through the courses that I had studied) but practical experience is totally different. So yeah, learning automatically took place because of the difference in what we studied and what we were experiencing.”

When another intern was asked about how different was the internship experience was from her classroom knowledge, she replied,

“It was completely different, I don’t think I have applied any theory there because the experience was totally different so not exactly theories.... but
what we had studied, how to interact with people in HR, how to work with your subordinates, your superiors or you know how to address them and how to maintain decorum."

About the courses that need to be taught, following statements came from the internees:

“They (the companies) focus more on Excel, and our Excel is not that good, in computer. Because they don’t teach us in depth, I think that should be taught in depth.”

“Insurance is not taught here. That as a-a major drawback because no insurance was taught for accounting and finance; so they (host organization) gave me a book, for one week I had that book, then I had a test on it.”

“Sales ka humne yahan nahin parha to be very honest. Sales ka total ek hi course tha yahan pe, to customers ko convince karna kaafi mushkil factor mujhe laga,”(We haven’t read about sales. To be very honest, there was only one course of sales so convincing customers was very difficult for me).”

On the other hand, almost all interns believed that communication and writing courses did help them to a great extent. They did understand the importance of theory as one respondent said,

“When it comes to HR, so whatever I learnt in HR, it’s exactly in- you know, in theory and in practical it is implemented in the company. So, for instance, take uh-uh talk about orientation, so the process, how it is done and everything, it’s the same way how it’s taught in theory it’s implemented as well.”

The overall impression of the interns was that the courses taught in the institute do not always accommodate the needs of interns. When they were asked about how could the courses at their institute be more relevant to the real life corporate practices, all respondents were of the view that more experiential projects should be added so that the theory is connected with the real working situations. To the researcher’s surprise all respondents were familiar with the term experiential learning. The only courses they said that truly helped them were the ones that were more practical in nature, where the students had to go and either observe or be a part of real life experience. The interns also blamed their teachers and said that they did not have the required skills to teach students through ‘learning by doing.’
“Majority of the teachers are not like that only a very few teachers are like that who actually believe in field work and can connect theory with practice…. that teachers who are working or have worked (in the industry) give you more practical experience but for most teachers, for them, it is only about quizzes marks and reports.”

When asked how the courses taught at the institute could be improved, an intern commented:

“By pushing us to take more case study related to our society. Like what happened when we moved from nationalization to privatization. Bhutto to Zia, that can get us closer to our own economic and financial background instead of looking for examples from US and reading the economic crisis of 2008 which hardly effected Pakistan's economy...... project based is what we are talking about if we give our students to learn from previous conditions. And situations and how we will tackle investments if we had to live in such situations.”

Another student shared her opinion by saying,

“Well first, the ratta practice (rote learning) that some teachers adopt should be banned. Concept based learning should be inculcated. More use of relevant case studies should be adopted. .... Meet and greet with industry executives so that students can learn what practices are in line with today's world and what we are learning is adapted. I think just teaching the main concept and doing plenty of case studies based on real examples would help.”

There were two problems that were highlighted in the business school curriculum. First, the case studies, the examples and the theories must be according to what happens in the Pakistani business industry and should be aligned with the local context. Second, it was clear from the interviews that more practical approach in business teaching was needed where students should be taught to use theoretical knowledge learnt in the class room.

4.2.3. Unclear Internship Goals

An experiential learning cycle begins with a goal, that is one must have a goal in mind according to which the whole experiential learning cycle is planned and conducted.
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

Therefore, when an internship is conducted, the internees must have a clear goal in mind according to which they will be a part of the internship. One thing that was clearly revealed from the data were that the students were not sure what were their internship goals. They had no idea as to why they were involved in an internship activity. They gave vague answers to the question regarding to the goals of an internship. As an intern replied, "My goal was to have experience."

What type of experience did she want to have? Was there any particular experience that she was looking forward to having or was the idea as vague as the word itself and when she was further asked these questions, she replied, "So right now it's umm... I want to learn so my focus was, um... finance. That I get to learn something in finance."

Again the statement above reveals that the intern wants to learn something in finance, but what is that something? What does something stand for? Again the idea is insignificant and unclear. Another intern replied, "My goal was that I want to look at all the functions of their (HR) department, I did not want to restrict myself to any administrator work. So... I was like, uh... I just wanted to get into the real work, like, I'm not just the filing and all that stuff."

So, the above statement reveals two things about the interviewee. First, the intern wants to look at all the functions of the HR department, and that too in six weeks times. One wonders as to what extent is this possible. And secondly, the intern considers some works to be below standard or as menial. To consider any task as minute or menial at the internship level may hinder the process of learning. The same respondent further elaborated that, "I guess, the goals of an internship should be to facilitate- to, uhh, give a glimpse of every function of the, uhh... department." The word ‘guess’ does not help the interviewee at all. It discloses the obscurity in his thought regarding the internship goals. An interviewee repeated the phrase "learning about corporate culture" four times when he was asked about the internship goals, but when he was asked what he meant by the phrase ‘about corporate culture’, he said, "I don’t know how to explain, sumjhana mushkil hai (it’s difficult to explain)." So he was not sure what exactly his goal was.

Another marketing intern showed his disappointment on the work that he did during his internship and said,

"I was like, I thought that I will be getting marketing campaigns like we see on the television, so I was very much motivated." This intern was taken as an intern for launching
of a product by a local firm. It can be concluded from the statement above that the intern had unrealistic goals in his mind and he was also unsure of how a product is actually launched in Pakistan.

Another HR intern expressed her disappointment in the following words:

“Since I chose training, I thought I’d be working on content for trainings, be a part of training exercises and making training calendars.” When further probed regarding her goal by asking her what was different from her expectations; she replied,

“Very different from expectations. I was handling the training feedback, with is working on excel sheets and I was making calls to trainers and participants, so basically, I was doing two things: coordination of trainers and participants and training feedbacks which had nothing to do with my initial goal.”

Again, in this case, the intern did not know the scope of her work before the internship and her expectations were very different from the ground realities. Nevertheless, there was one intern who said that the goals of the internship were clear prior to the induction of the intern in the internship advertisement, but sadly those goals were never achieved as the project was abandoned. Even when this intern had a clear idea of what she will be asked to do, she could not meet those goals as the project was abandoned.

Another HR intern explained that her goal was to have a communicative supervisor at the internship, and it was actually her supervisor who told her that her goal at the internship should be to learn everything, may it be excel or may it be choosing the right candidate for the job. This intern further explained, “Because I didn’t know, I had no idea what to expect from the internship.” The job supervisor in this case defined the goals for the intern but the scope of these goals was unclear and undefined. None of the interns except one knew what the scope of their work going to be. It was only once they stepped into the internship setting, they were then told their job description. This caused frustration and disappointment in the interns as some thought that the job that they were asked to do was beyond their scope and others thought that their full capacity was not being utilized and that they were capable of doing much more than what they were given.

Having unclear goals is just the tip of the iceberg. Because of these unclear goals, the whole internship process that should be experiential in nature becomes a series of chores. An experiential learning cycle follows four stages of concrete experience, reflective
observation, abstract conceptualization and active experimentation after the formulation of goals. Even with the vague or unclear goals, the student knows what direction his/her should take. Reflective observation helps students to chalk their progress keeping in mind their goals. According to the literature review, teachers ensure reflective practices in an experiential learning project through reflective journals that help students gauge their learning.

4.2.4. Breakdown of Experiential Learning Cycle

The absence of clear goal setting causes a total breakdown of the experiential learning cycle and hence there is no real measurement of their learning. They are unable to substantiate their learning and the experience does not take the shape of experiential learning. The same can be comprehended from the following dichotomy between interns’ goals, their work and their perceived concrete experience. Below are the examples from the individual semi-structured interviews.

When an intern was asked what her goal was when entering into the internship setting, she replied, “I wanted to continue my work in the media field marketing planning and advertising and branding this is what I have learnt in my majors as well and I was interested in social media so my goal was that I want to learn more and I thought that since it's a small set up so I will get to learn more they will teach me.” When asked if she was able to learn all the things that she had in mind, she said, “Madam, koi learning nahi hui (I did not learn anything).” She was further enquired, about her work responsibilities at the company, she said, “They (the company) had started a project where the companies would outsource their marketing .... I was looking at the social media and digital strategies and there was a blogger and business developer .....aur woh pura marketing ka hum doa, teen log dekh rahe the aur bas apne own par hai sab kar rahe the ghalti kartay thay toa seekh rahe the (the whole marketing, we two, three people were looking after. We were handling all this on our own, if we made a mistake, we amended it ourselves). This was going on.”

From looking at this case, it is clear that the work that the intern was doing was according to her goals; yet, she claimed that she did not learn anything from the internship. The reason for this, she says was that there was no one to teach her. Had the experiential learning cycle being followed even by the intern herself and her faculty supervisor, this
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

internship would have been fruitful for her. She could have taken charge of her own learning, reflected upon the situations that came her way, would have formulated ways to tackle those situations and would have understood what learning has taken place and what learning needs to be more emphasized upon. She would have taken it as a challenge and would have made maximum use of the liberty that she was getting.

When another intern was asked how his internship experience was, he replied with full confidence, “it was good I liked- um... I liked the experience, um, I did not know much about the corporate world. This was my first, so yes it was a good experience. I need to learn many things, like, you know, what I have learned here.” When he was asked what his goal was when applying for the internship, he said that he wanted to make survey reports, or maybe developing a product and designing questionnaires. Then in a very dismal voice he said but, “basically, I’m a sales person there..... I know about sales, that it’s a sales procedure, and I had in my mind that sales are not my type of job.” Then after explaining to me what work he does there, he came to the point where he said the following sentences:

“To be very honest, it’s a kind of repetitive work so every day you need to make a stock list, then you need to call the Japan office, call Myanmar office, then you need to coordinate, it’s repetitive work, so you know it’s not a kind of learning job....Yahaan aap ko kuch bohot seekhnay ko nahi milta (you don’t get to learn a lot from here).”

If a comparison is made between his very first and the very last statement, it is clear that he did not know whether he had learnt anything at the internship or not. What areas were new for him, where there was maximum learning, which ones he did not probe and where he needs more help. Since, he did not have his learning documented, he seemed very confused about his internship outcomes where he started off with how beneficial his internship experience was for him and ended the interview by saying that one does not get much to learn in the company where he was interning.

Similar was the case of a finance intern who said she was doing internship at an educational institute in its education department. When I asked her, what her goal was when coming for the internship, she said that she wanted to do research and this particular department published their own research journal that she could work on. When she was
probed a little more and asked that being a finance person what was she doing in the education department, she responded,

“So I knew from the people who had done their internships previously that when they go to a company then they are usually given a task related to finance, they don't test our accounting or economics or any other side because we have done a lot of courses, it is not just finance but in the corporate sector they don't test any other side like the critical or the analytical side and they only test our finance side. They just push us towards the calculations. So I knew that they’re going to give a task like so many people in internship used to get task such as a project, where there's going to be a new opening of a plant and they had to make the feasibility of that plant so that's the type of task that they were given. So I knew that this is the sort of thing that I will be given at the internship I did anywhere else....... Feasibility, yes, because again that is the type of research, because that in that we have to see what kind of things are going to happen and we have to see the pricing, the strategies, so yes I was excited to do feasibility report or something like that where I would be given a chance to explore more options.”

She later in the interview revealed that the major reasons for choosing the internship at the education department was that,

“I am a little apprehensive after I went to the interview places where the environment seems to be very questionable....... I don't know....I just didn't like it there, you can call it my sixth sense but mostly I would say the factor of legality in Islam, that came into the whole thing was actually questionable for me.”

So she started off by saying that she wanted to do internship at the education department because she was interested in research and then she said that she did not go to the corporate sector because she wanted to use other skills taught in other courses and did not want to be pushed towards the calculations alone. She ended up saying that it was the corporate culture and the legality in Islam that hindered her from taking up a finance internship. And then when asked what she learnt, she responded,
I have learnt a lot from this internship I mean 4 years of education apart and just the internship...... I have learnt here even for the smallest task like reference tallying.... like right now I am doing multiple things, I am filing, managing various documents, I am corresponding with faculty with students, by this time I am more confident and all the tasks on hand.”

The idea that she had learnt immensely at the internship seemed overly exaggerated as the work that she was doing did not require any expertise and could have been handled by a secretary. She was not applying her knowledge she learnt during her course of time at her academic institution and the learning at the internship was not in accordance with her field of expertise, which was finance. So this experience was not as fruitful as it should have been for her but since there was no way to scrutinize her learning, thus she seemed overly satisfied with the amount of learning that had taken place. Reflections could have helped her to evaluate that learning and to have a more realistic account of her internship experience.

Then there was an intern, who opined,

“Personally, no, I don’t think so internships are that important. If- if employment is given instead of an internship that would be much better. Yeah, because the reason for that is that uhh... when you’re doing an internship, the company does not really give you that exposure, as compared to when you’re working, because when you’re working, the company knows that it will be your long term, commitment in the-the company. So they would give you that access to that information that you need. So your fundamental concepts are already being, you know, uh, developed at that point.”

This point of companies not giving the interns access of information came up again and again during these interviews. But if the experiential learning process was being followed with a faculty supervisor being in charge of providing a fruitful internship experience to the interns he/she would have ensured that the information required by the interns is provided to them and the experiential learning internship project is productive one for them.

Similarly, another intern explained that he thought that,
“I thought that it is going to be an office job, we will have a laptop and office and will work from 9 to 5. But what they did is that they made me roam around in the market because their new brand was launching; so I had to go to the printing vendors, the exporting vendors, the lead vendor..... I had thought that I will be getting marketing campaigns like we see on the television.”

He further explained,

“Ab sethth ka masla yeh bhi hai (the problem with the seth is also that) he thinks that he is everything. Aur Harvard ka graduate bhi uske samne jahil hai (and even a Harvard graduate is illiterate in front of him). Iss mentality ke sath aage chalna mushkil hota hai kyun ke humko ye sikhaya jata hai ke jahan galti hai usko point out karo (it is difficult to work with this mentality because we are taught that when you see something wrong then you must point that out). But in a seth company, if you point out the mistake then you are in direct conflict with the seth..... well, if you are in a sethya company and you are in HR, then you are not in HR, aapko jo kaam milta hai, aap ko bas wo karna hai (you will have to do what you are told to do).”

It can be concluded from the example above that the intern had flawed goals to begin with, then it seems that he had no idea which direction to take and the company was taking undue advantage of him as he elaborated that they used to ask him to work late hours and he was sent to farfetched areas for work purposes. His scope of work was not well defined and he was expected not to say ‘no’ to any task given to him and also, not to criticize the working of the company.

4.2.5. Conclusion of Phase I

To sum up the situation, the interns were left on their own at the internship without much supervision either from their institute and neither from the on-job supervisors. The internships were ill planned and the work done by the interns was not monitored. The students did not know what had they had achieved, what was lacking and what they were working to achieve. The whole internship practice was not at all experiential in nature rather it could be called a series of chores. In most cases the supervisors gave interns work
on daily basis and the internship activity was not pre-planned. There were instances where the interns were over exaggerating their learning and then there were instances where they were undermining their learning. Thus, there was no way to gauge or measure or assess what they had learnt. They started their internships with unclear and undefined goals and ended it with vague ideas about their learning. The following facts were established from the review of the relevant literature and the semi-structured individual interviews in Phase I:

1. The interns were unaware of what expectations they should have from their internship and why having an internship experience important for them. They should know that internships are not just a necessity that needs to be fulfilled in order to get a degree; rather it is a part of their study that demands their utmost attention and sincerity. Therefore, two sections, the introduction section and the internship commitment section, were added in the internship manual.

2. There was no faculty supervisor allotted the interns and hence they had no support and guidance from the institution during the internship period. To overcome this, guidelines for faculty supervisors was added to the internship manual.

3. The on-job supervisors were not informed about what expectations the educational institute did and the interns have from them, and neither did they know the fundamentals of an internship process. They used the interns for their benefit alone and as a helper. Since there was no check on them from the institute, therefore, the interns were solely left on the will of the on-job supervisor and it was just interns’ luck whether he/she got a good or a bad supervisor.

4. The on-job supervisors and the faculty supervisors should make sure that the interns are able to relate their knowledge learnt at the university with the practical work. This is the only way to move forward and produce the much needed human capital for the country.

5. In most cases, the interns had no idea what to expect from their internships and therefore their mind was a clean slate when they joined the internship. They did not have any goals in mind and were of the view that they are at the internship to learn. But they were not sure what exactly it was that they wanted to learn. The interns therefore need to establish achievable goals before the start of the internship.
6. The whole internship needs to be planned according to the experiential learning cycle where the interns are able to understand, relate and gauge their learning through reflective writing. The intern should be the center of the experiential learning cycle where the internship should benefit the student the most.

These problems were done away with by including the introduction, the internship commitment, guidelines for faculty supervisors, guidelines for on-job supervisors, reflective writing guiding questions and reflective writing rubrics in the internship manual. These results helped to take the case study further in Phase II by using it as a guiding source and formulating the research questions for the next phase.

4.3. Phase II

This phase used multiple methods of data collection from 12 cases (interns) that were studied for six weeks in their internship setting. The sample size in this phase consisted of 12 interns, their 12 respective on-job supervisors, and the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department. In this phase, the data were triangulated to answer the research questions that were put forward. First the sub questions of each main question were answered and then their conclusion was summed up to answer the main question.

4.3.1. Sub Question One: First Main Question

The first sub question was “How is goal setting useful in an internship setting in order to fully understand a concrete experience?”

It was revealed from Phase 1 of the research that the interns lacked concrete experience because they went for the internship without setting any goals for themselves. Therefore, the second phase of the internship began by asking the interns to set goals for themselves after discussing the attainability of those goals with their on-job supervisors. Tables 5, 6 and 7 show the goals that the interns had set for themselves and the concrete experiences that they gained through their internships. The students were asked to set their goals in the domains of Academic, career development, skill development and personal development.
### Table 5
*Goal Setting and Concrete Experience of the Finance Interns*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Concrete Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beena</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic development goal:</strong> to be capable enough to successfully implement the learning which she had learnt during her classes in a practical working field of general banking.</td>
<td>Beena said that she was able to achieve her goals by being a part of the various sections of the bank and was able to get a 360 degree view of the whole system. She further said that she was confident enough to work on her own in a bank without any supervision. She believed that she had contributed through her skills and was able to especially work on her interpersonal skills because she was meeting so many customers every day. Her analytical skills also developed as she tried to resolve issues that came to her effectively. Thus she said in her focus group interview, “It was very effective I used to work from 9 to 5 continuously. It was a complete practice it was like working on a job.” She realized that functions of banking system are the same as she had studied in the books but the banking system is very different.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Career development goal:</strong> to learn about banking system as a whole and learn about how general banking plays an important part in the word of finance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skill development goal:</strong> to build upon her analytical skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personal development goal:</strong> to improve her interpersonal skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mana</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic development goal:</strong> to see how the classroom learning is used in the practical setting</td>
<td>Mana said that after setting her goals, she started to recall all that she had studied regarding the hiring procedure and because she had taken Finance and not HR as her major, therefore she had to do more reading upon the subject. She was soon a part of the hiring and recruitment process of shortlisting the resumes, recording the details of shortlisted candidates, scheduling them for an interview, being there at the interviews and then making sure that their documentation process is complete before they are taken onboard. She further said that she was able to achieve her goals of improving her interpersonal skills and her confidence. Here it was surprising to note how differently her supervisor and she herself gauged her. Where her supervisor said, “We look at the communication skills of an interns when we hire them and Mana was according to our requirement,” but Mana, on the other hand, thought that her communication skills needed to be further polished. She also sums up her experience by saying that the HR field is not for her and she wants to pursue her career in supply chain management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Career development goal:</strong> to learn about the recruitment and hiring processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skill development goal:</strong> to develop her interpersonal skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personal development goal:</strong> to improve her confidence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shoaib</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic development goal:</strong> to increase understanding of ratio analysis, capital asset pricing model and securities pitching</td>
<td>He was given the task of maintaining client portfolios; therefore, he was able to achieve all the mentioned goals except his personal goals. He had the basic knowledge regarding these concepts that he had learnt in his classroom, he was given an opportunity to apply the same knowledge. Therefore, with the help of his on-job supervisor he took the concepts further and practically applied them in his internship. His work throughout the internship was logical and analytic as he writes in his reflections. The only goals that he was unable to achieve were the personal development goals and the main reason for that was that his firm size was very small and there were not many people to interact with, as he explained in his reflections, &quot;I don’t feel like my interpersonal communication is getting better.....the person I’m sitting next to is an accountant so not much to learn from him I guess. It’s a small company with like 7-8 employees.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Career development goal:</strong> to learn more about financial services whereas he wanted his personal development to be in intrapersonal communication and leadership.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skill development goal:</strong> to develop analytical and logical approach to problem solving</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal development goal:</th>
<th>interpersonal communication and leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Waqar**

- **Academic development goal:** to apply taxation, finance and accounting knowledge learnt in the classroom setting practically, whereas he wanted in personal traits he wanted to develop his confidence.
- **Career development goal:** to see if taxation would be suitable career for him or not
- **Skill development goal:** to develop his analytical skills
- **Personal development goal:** to develop confidence

Waqar said that he was able to achieve all his goals; whereas, his on-job supervisor thought vice versa. His on-job supervisor was of the view that Waqar could learn a lot more about taxation and needed to concentrate more. In this scenario, the supervisor seemed to be wanting the intern to join his choice of field which was not exactly what the intern wanted to do, as Waqar had no intention to join taxation and did not enjoy working in the field. Similarly, where Waqar was of the opinion that he had improved his analytical skills, the supervisor thought otherwise, “Waqar ko main samjhata tha aur focus karo, analytical kaam bhi kuch karna seekho, woh beech mein hi fed up ho gaya tha (I used to advise Waqar that he needs to focus more and learn to do some analytical work. But he was fed up in the middle of the internship).”

With regards to his personal skills, he said that there was a limited interaction with people therefore, he did not really get much time to work on his personal skills.

Not only were the interns satisfied with their performance and learning but were also able to pinpoint their weaknesses. Interns in banking sector had more chance to groom their interpersonal skills as compared to interns in smaller setup. It was noted that Waqar seemed to be satisfied with his performance but his supervisor was not satisfied by Waqar’s performance. Waqar was able to point out that this discrepancy existed because his supervisor wanted him to choose taxation as his field but Waqar after working in the field realized that he does not want to build his career in taxation.

Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Concrete Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hina</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic development goal:</strong> to observe what theories are being applied in the organization of her internship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Career development goal:</strong> to learn more about work processes and job descriptions <strong>Skill development goal:</strong> to improve her writing skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personal development goal:</strong></td>
<td>to become more confident.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hina said that she was able to achieve her goals and she observed that even though the organization head always talked about various HRM theories; yet, she usually followed the culture of the organization which was very autocratic. So she summed up by saying that parts of the theories were being applied, there was no theory that was applied as a whole. She fully achieved her career goals and was able to work upon work processes and job description. Her skill development goal of improving her writing skills and her personal goal of improving her confidence was a byproduct of her career development goals. Since she had jotted down these goals, she was very conscious of not letting an opportunity go by where she could work on these goals. In her reflections she reflects on her writing skills in the following words, “The skill that will be developed most in regards to preparing job description is vocabulary”, “Use of action words for various tasks and duties of employees has helped me improve
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

my English vocabulary making me more confident to communicate in the corporate world”.

She also explained how her confidence improved over the course of her internship period in her reflections, “I confidently talk to them for giving me time whenever they can and add my feedback so they know how well I am grasping the concepts.”

Taha

**Academic development goal:** to see the working of various theories and policies that he had studied in his classroom

**Career development goal:** to learn human resource recruitment and selection

**Skill development goal:** to develop his interpersonal communication skills

**Personal development goal:** to be more responsible regarding his work

Taha believed that 75% to 80% of his goals were achieved. He was able to understand how various theories were being implemented and according to him, the bank was following all HR practices. Even though he was a part of the recruitment process but he felt that his interviewing skills needed to be polished and that could only happen if he was given a chance to not only take interviews but also to be guided in the interviews. He wrote in one of his reflections, “lacking is my interviewing skills as I have not got any exposure of judging the person whether he is competent or not. I hope I get this exposure too.”

His goal also was to develop his interpersonal communication skills which he was very efficiently able to do. He had to communicate with so many people at so many levels that it became incumbent for him to develop this skill. Hence, he frequently writes sentences such as, “My goals would be to keep polishing my skills by working regularly on it”, “it also helped me to improve my interpersonal communication skill”, “I also learned to make reference calls which were quite good as you speak and talk to new people”, “This was very helpful for me because I achieved my goal of talking with new people and addressing their queries. I also guided them the address verbally which also help me improve my communication skills.”

Taniya

**Academic development goal:** to related what she had learnt in the classroom setting about the recruitment and selection process, and event planning

**Career development goal:** to make progress in the same fields as those mentioned in academic development

**Skill development goal:** to be skillful in report writing and conducting trainings

**Personal development goal:** to improve upon networking, emotional intelligence and critical thinking

According to Taniya, when she discussed these goals with her on-job supervisor, she told Tania, “report writing is Mushkil (difficult) objective to gain, kyunki yahan pe koi aisa aapko opportunity nahi milegi” (because over here you will not get any such opportunity) but Taniya wanted to improve her writing skills so when she discussed the newsletter with her on-job supervisor, she said, “our newsletter will be quite casual, it is not going to be as professional as you want your skill to be. So in writing the newsletter I had to actually break things down to make it more simple so that was also a learning experience.” The on-job supervisor also advised her to add the newsletter as one of her objectives in academic learning, which she did. According to Taniya, she was able to achieve 90% of her academic and career development goals. She could not be a part of any trainings and she felt that she could not achieve that goal. Also, she thought that since there were not many people to communicate with, therefore her goal of networking could not be achieved as much as she wanted it to be achieved. She thought that she was able to understand her shortcomings with regards to her emotional intelligence; on the other hand, her supervisor thought that she really has to work on this aspect of hers.
The HR interns seemed to be satisfied with their learning. It seemed that the goal formation in presence of the on-job supervisor was very effective as they were in the right position to tell the interns which goals would be achievable for them and which ones will not be possible. This helped the interns align their goals with the experience that they were to indulge in, which in turn helped them to achieve a concrete experience.

Table 7
Goal Setting and Concrete Experience of the Marketing Interns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Concrete Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Almas</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Academic development goal:   | She was very well able to relate her courses with the work that she was involved in. Also, she was able to build a good relationship with her colleagues and her on-job supervisor in the given time period. She learnt new skills there and was able to understand the digital marketing closely. Her experiences regarding digital marketing include, "I learnt that there is a need to understand the human psychology and that people are attracted to situations which have answers to questions and creating awareness creates a wide market through desire and knowing a solution is available allures them to use your service."
| Career development goal:     |                                                                                                                                                      |
| Skill development goal:      |                                                                                                                                                      |
| Personal development goal:   | She said that there was a lot to digital marketing and she enjoyed working in the field and may pursue her career in it.                             |
| **Anum**                    |                                                                                                                                                      |
| Academic development goal:   | She worked on the Customer relationship management (CRM) and the Service-Level Agreement (SLA) program that helped groom her sales and customer management skills and at the end of her internship, she was able to make the following decision through her learning that she acquired. She said that she felt that sales was the right job for her, "Jo basic points hotay hain sales main woh maine actually learn kiye hain aur un ko polish kiya hai (The basic, the key points of sales, those I have learnt and tried to polish)." She was also able to achieve her goal of giving presentations as she was told to give presentations to the company employees thrice during her internship. She had to deal with the customers on regular basis and she said that she knows now how to deal with the customers and their psychology in making a sales pitch. |
| Career development goal:     |                                                                                                                                                      |
| Skill development goal:      |                                                                                                                                                      |
| Personal development goal:   |                                                                                                                                                      |
| **Maria**                   |                                                                                                                                                      |
| **Academic development goal:** | Her learning from that experience that she reflected in her reflections was, “I have figured that it’s all about communication. How well you are able to put your point in front of the clients. Also, you should be open to your product weaknesses and tell your client that ok, this is the weakness but we are giving you these many benefits to overcome that weakness.”

She said that her interest was in sales, in customer dealing, customer support and she was able to learn in that direction. She said in her focus group interview that she always thought that one needs confidence to deal with customers, but she added that there was also one more ingredient required in making successful sales and that was ‘patience’. She was asked to give presentations to the customers as well and she wrote in her reflections that she had a problem in her first presentation and the words were not coming out of her mouth. But with a passage of time and practice she became confident in giving presentations. |
| **Career development goal:** | Asim

He went into the industry and experienced actual negotiations with clients. He then worked independently and brought in business for the company. This helped him to advance his interpersonal communication skills and since he was continuously reflecting on his work, he concluded by saying, “iss may short term payoff hai logon ko her waqt paint ki zaroorat rehti hai. plus agar contacts hoon toa aur aasan ho jata hai” (this business has a short term payoff, people are all the time in need of paints and if you have contacts then it becomes even easier). He planned to continue working with the company but as a shareholder. |
| **Skill development goal:** | Aqib

His task was to compile literature for company product. He used his previous knowledge of Methods of Business Research course to initiate his work and compiled the literature accordingly. Other than that he said that the working of a pharmaceutical industry was very different from what he had studied in his courses and that most of the courses were partially used in a Pakistani pharmaceutical company, other than MBR which he used in totality to write the literature. He concluded that pharma industry is not the place where he would like to work as some of their ethical values contradicted with Aqib's values. He was able to improve his written skills because he was constantly involved in writing tasks. Even though he did not get a chance to meet a lot of new people, he did use his internship to be cordial, forthcoming and helpful towards all his office colleagues. |
| **Personal development goal:** | **Academic development goal:** | to know more about sales and marketing that is beyond classroom learning

**Career development goal:** to build her career in sales and marketing

**Skill development goal:** to improve her presentation skills

**Personal development goal:** to gain more confidence |

**Academic development goal:** to link practical knowledge with the academic knowledge

**Career development goal:** to interact with a new segment of paint industry and to see if paint industry is a good field to spend time and energy in

**Skill development goal:** to improve interpersonal skills and lastly

**Personal development goal:** develop confidence to work independently |

**Academic development goal:** to relate the working of a pharmaceutical industry with the academic courses studies

**Career development goal:** to see if working in pharmaceutical industry is a good career choice

**Skill development goal:** to improve his writing skills

**Personal development goal:** to improve interpersonal skills |
The marketing interns were very well able to achieve their goals and were able to articulate their learning.

If a comparison of the 12 interns understudy in Phase II of the research is made with the interns in Phase I, it is clear that the 12 interns in Phase II were better able to describe their learning. The goal setting helped them chalk their path and to motivate themselves in that direction. They had a better control and understanding of their learning and were able to pinpoint the gaps in their learning. The goals acted as yardstick for the interns who went back to these goals to check what they had achieved and what they were unable to achieve. They were also able to give reasons for their lack of learning. They seemed to be more confident about their learning and they were able to obtain a concrete experience from their experience; unlike the interns in Phase I who could not tell what their learning was and how their experience was important.

4.3.2. Sub Question Two: First Main Question

The second sub question for the first main question was, “How can reflections be used as a tool for continuous assessment in an internship setting?”

Currently, the institute is using intern evaluation forms, that the on-job supervisor fills and submits to the internship office, and reports that the students have to submit to the institute’s Alumni, Placement and International Department. These reports are further sent by the internship office to the relevant faculty to be graded. The institute has given the report format to the students, which is also attached in the internship manual. This report format has the following sections:

i. Departments to which I was attached
ii. Functions of the department
iii. Work I did in the department
iv. Theories learnt in academics and their application
v. New theories and concepts
vi. Recommendations

Since the faculty member cannot counter check what has been written in the report, they take the accounts written in it as factual and genuine. The triangulation of the report with student reflections showed very different results. It has been a very common practice that students took reports from their friends or their seniors and changed the heading of the
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

report and submitted the same at the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department for evaluation. I told to send the soft copy of their report to me too when they send it to the internship and placement office for evaluation. Six interns sent it to me on time and six interns sent it to me after multiple reminders to them. In this study as well, four students had been involved in forgery of reports; whereas, one person had taken the report cover from another report.

4.3.2.1. The case of Mana and Beena: Finance interns

The report that Mana wrote could not give the details about the responsibilities that she had at the internship. For example, she does not mention anywhere in the report that she was also a part of the interviews, in fact she has not written anything about the interviews at all. On the other hand, in her reflections she continuously wrote about the interviews, "I called 65 candidates for screening interviews", "I got a chance to communicate with people face to face, when they came for their screening interviews", "Later on I called them for the final interviews", "I attach the form with their resumes and forwarded it to the interviewer and call the interviewees according to their turn", "I sat during the interviews." But there was nothing as such written in the report.

Beena did not write anything about reading and understanding the bank's policies and understanding the function of each department. She does not write anything about the accounts department in her report whereas she was in that department for a week according to her reflection. Also, Beena wrote in her reflections that she learnt the whole process of remittance banking at the bank which she was unaware of previously. But she does not share this in her report. Her report is very superficial and the only things that it talks about her role in customer support. But she does not say anything about KNC (know your customer) the basic rule of banking that she was taught in the very first week.

‘The theories learnt section’ of both the interns was same without any change even in the wordings. Also, statements such as “During my tenure in the operations section I was assigned multiple tasks by my supervisor.” In statements such as the previous one, the name of the on-job supervisor was changed whereas the task remained the same.

It seems that both the students got this report from a third intern who had been at an internship at the banking sector and they filled it with information pertaining to their own internships but did not alter the fourth section of the report, ‘Theories Learnt in
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

Academics and their Application’. The last section therefore was not altered by any of the two students. Also, the layout and the formatting of the report was the same. I tried to get in touch with them regarding this coincidence of similarity but could only reach Beena. She said that she had no idea how hers and Mana’s reports ended up to be same as she had written her report herself.

4.3.2.2. The case of Anum and Maria: Marketing interns

The report that Anum wrote was in accordance to her reflections and she had clearly mentioned in it all the work that she had done at her internship. She did not miss any points and did not try to give any false impressions of the work that she had done. There were two points that she did not mention under the heading "the theories learnt". She did not mention that the SLA and CRM are the two systems that were new to her and learning about these systems was new to her.

On the other hand, the source of Maria’s report seemed to be Anum’s report as the things mentioned in her report did not tally with her reflections and her focus group interview. Only the name of the company was replaced, other than that the whole report remained the same. There were numerous discrepancies in the report as the report mentions that the customers are targeted through tele sales marketing and email marketing which was true in Anum’s case but not in Maria’s. In her reflections Maria has written, "Our business, its growth is based on word of mouth on services we offer......it is through our dealers that we get to know of our potential clients." The report also said that the intern screened the CV's and interviewed potential candidates for posts like interns, sales executive, sales manager and accounts executive. But was done by Anum and not by Maria; she just went through the CVs once with her CEO. The report also says that at the company the CEO gathered her weekly report to monitor her learning curve; this information was true for Anum, as written in her reflections; whereas Maria had written in her reflections, "The CEO takes feedback on daily basis." Maria also talks about using formulas such as VLOOKUP, Hookup, If/ and, filter etc to handle the immense data; but in actuality, Maria only used Microsoft, PowerPoint and simple excel at her internship as explained in her reflections. Maria decided not to take advantage of the reflections that she had written to write down her report.
It seems that the report that Maria wrote was taken from Anum who was Maria’s friend. Maria’s report though was not in accordance to the work she had done at the internship or the reflections that she had written but it seemed very detailed. When they were asked about this coincidence of similarity, Anum said that she has lost her old computer and maybe she has sent me the wrong report, whereas when Maria was asked about this issue, she said, she had no idea how the mix up happened. These two interns sent me the report very late and after multiple reminders.

4.3.2.3. Missing links: The cases of Shoib, Waqar, Taha, Hina and Taniya

There were interns who had missing information in their reports and in one case, in her reflections. The comparison of intern reports with intern reflections revealed the following:

The report that Shoib wrote does not mention the analytical work which was done by him, for example, he wrote in his reflections, "checking the sharia compliance was difficult as it requires in depth analysis of annual report," but the word analysis was not mentioned anywhere in the report that would show that he was involved in analytical work. In his report he has elaborated upon the process of portfolio management. Also he did not mention in his report how he was taught the different functions of excel which he gave details of in his reflection. He also does not make a mention about his learning and understanding of Sharia compliant finance. According to his supervisor, "Islamic finance was something new to him," but the same thought is not mentioned anywhere in his report. Even though he mentioned in the focus group interview that if it were not for the reflections, he would have opted to take a report from someone for submission as it would have been difficult for him to recall all that he did during his internship. The reflections helped him to go back to the information that he needed to write the report.

Waqar has written a very short report where he has not given the full picture of his internship and whatever he has written in the report is quiet misleading. From the report it seems that Waqar managed to do all the work allotted to him on his own, whereas the matter of fact is that he was being continuously guided by his on-job supervisor. Secondly, he never mentioned the new concepts that he learnt in the report and were either not taught or not emphasized upon by the institute. It should be mentioned here, that Waqar felt that
writing reflections was a useless activity and it seems that he did not refer to them while writing his report.

To start off, Taha had taken the cover page of his report from another report and when asked about it, he said that he was confused about what the cover page should be like so he took it from a friend. It was easy to spot it, as he had forgotten to change the date of submission which showed to be 2016 instead of 2017. In the report Taha has highlighted the usual induction method of an employee without any reference to the Youth advisory program. On the other hand, his supervisor stated that he was exclusively inducted to help run the youth advisory program from start to finish. Also, it was noted that Taha did not say anything regarding his insufficient Excel knowledge, the graduate directory that he worked upon, the process of headhunting that he learnt, how he made IQ tests for the recruitment process and his close communication with the sales department.

Even though some portions of the report were directly taken from the reflections that Taha had written, nevertheless, the report did not sum up all that Taha had done. There was a mention of HRMS software that he had learnt in the report, but the report did not mention how often was it used and how he improved his skill in the software and from creating an entry in 25 minutes, he came down to 10 minutes per entry.

Hina in her report described the functions and roles of each department in detail but when she was asked to explain what job she performed in these departments, she described her work in only five sentences. This belittled the work that she did there and made it sound insignificant. Hina in her report also does not talk about the presentations that she gave to the HR staff at her host organization. Even though she mentions that she gave two presentations to the HR staff, one about the work presses flow and the other about job descriptions, in which she was praised by her on-job supervisor. It must also be noted that she has mentioned the use of excel and Microsoft word again and again in her reflections but they are nowhere to be seen in the report that she submitted.

The report talks about the ERP (Software) which was introduced recently in the HR department yet she does not make any mention of this software in her reflections. Similarly, she talks about HRIS (Print Out) where the history of employees’ right from when they are being selected for the job to their interview to their hiring and salary and their performance appraisals are recorded and a printout is taken and attached in the employee files for record maintenance, but she again does not mention this in her reflections. When further probed,
she explained that this discrepancy existed because she did not learn to work on this software, even though she did see employees using them at the hospital. She had to mention the two software because there was a question in the report that said ‘what new have you learnt’. Anyone reading the report may be misguided into thinking that she has learnt to use this software.

Taniya has described three things in her report, recruitment drives, event management and newsletters. Ironically, she has written more in her report than in her reflections. The only way to confirm her report was through the focus group discussion where she described her projects in detail. Taniya's case was different from the other interns as the other interns had written more in their reflections than in their reports. The only confirmation that was available in the reflections was the series of work done by Taniya which could be further tallied by her report. It can be assumed that Taniya did not enjoy writing reflections she was unable to understand the purpose as importance for writing reflections. So she remarked in her interview, “I don’t know how reflections would help me” thinking them unimportant, she never gave reflections their due time.

It can be concluded, that even when interns were writing reflections, they did not necessarily know how to translate those into a report. There was a lot of missing information and a faculty supervisor would have been in a position to guide interns in writing a comprehensive and a detailed report.

4.3.2.4. Reports according to reflections: Almas, Asim and Aqib

Almas' report truly depicted the work that she did in the firm and covered all areas of her work. She has used her reflections to write her report and has elaborated the work she did very well. She was very well able to relate the theories that she had learnt in her classroom with her practical work.

Asim had taken full advantage of his reflections and his report was one of the most comprehensive, detailed and enlightening reports that was produced by the interns understudy. He has written details of his performance at the internship setting and has given the right amount of share of his work to his on-job supervisor. Hence we see sentences such as, "I along with the Director of the company visited different potential clients. It started with the Director taking me to a couple of potential clients so that I may gain knowledge about how he does things and how his process of selling is." I think Asim was
able to fully incorporate his reflections in the report and was able to give a true picture of his internship. As he remarked in his focus group interview, "yeh reflections waghaira kar liye, cross checking kar li, pehle tou mere itnay saaray dost hain apni companies main ya phir doston k saath kar k woh report bani banayi copy paste kar detay hain (Now we can cross check our report with our reflections, I know many of my friends working in various companies, they took a report, copy pasted it and submitted it)."

The report that that Aqib wrote was in accordance with his reflections and he did not write anything beyond or below the scope of his work. He mentioned the two main tasks that he was responsible for, writing the literature review and maintains the sales register. Nevertheless, the report does not have any section that mentions the problem he had with regards to his on-job supervisor. He was able to aptly pinpoint the relevant courses that he found were useful during his internship and the same he mentioned in his focus group interview as well.

Almas, Asim and Aqib not only took reflections very seriously throughout the internships but were also able to translate the same into a report. They understood the importance of reflective writing and how to take their assistance in report writing. Out of 12 interns, seven (Anum, Shoib, Taha, Hina, Almas, Asim and Aqib) said that they had taken help from their reflections in compiling their reports.

4.3.2.5. Intern evaluation form

The intern evaluation form that the on-job supervisors have to fill in order to explain the intern’s progress at the internship has five anchors: Excellent, Good, fair, average and below average for various traits and skills. An analysis of the filled form shows that all supervisors had given an above average grade where they marked the interns between fair and excellent and none of the 12 interns understudy received an average or below average. The 12 interns’ final grades that they had received from the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department are given below in table 8.
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

Table 8
The Relationship of Grades with the Report Written

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Type of report</th>
<th>Grade obtained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shoab</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Original but lacking</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waqar</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Original but lacking</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beena</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Not Original</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mana</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Not Original</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taniya</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Original and detailed</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hina</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Original but lacking</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taha</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Original but lacking</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aqib</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Original and detailed</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asim</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Original and detailed</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almas</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Original and detailed</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anum</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Original and detailed but</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Not original</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It can be concluded that the interns’ reports and the intern evaluation forms were not enough to gauge their internship experience and to grade them. If a faculty is not a part of the internship program and does not know what the intern has been doing during the internship, there’s a high possibility that the intern will not be graded according to the work that he/she had done at the internship. We thus see most of the grades to be Bs regardless of whether the report was original or not; regardless of what duties did the interns perform and regardless of how challenging were the tasks given to them. The main reason for this anomaly is that the faculty is unaware of what actually was done at the internship. The only case of an A grade is that of Aqib. Even though Aqib wrote a very complete report and was able to give details of all the work that he did at the internship, there are two points to be noted. First, Aqib’s internship was not a very dynamic one and he was only responsible to search the relevant literature for the medicines to be sold and second, his internship was not a well-structured one and could be divided into three parts, first part with the first on-job supervisor, second part with no on-job supervisor and the third part with the second on-job supervisor. Both his on-job supervisors were self-appointed and his second on-job supervisor was not interested in meeting with me therefore gave a telephonic interview, where he just told me that Aqib was a good intern. There were also times when Aqib had no work to do whatsoever and according to him, he pretended that he was busy.
On the other hand, Taha who got a C was at times overloaded with work. He told in the focus group interview that even though he was appointed for a project, he was given work which was beyond his scope of work. He was well rewarded by his host organization, and was given a job offer right after the completion of his internship.

Without a faculty supervisor and reflective writing, it is difficult to grade the interns. As an experiential learning project, the progress of the interns should be monitored continuously and throughout the internship.

### 4.3.3. Sub Question Three: First Main Question

The third sub question of the first main question was, “How does constant student mentoring in the internship program setting impact the overall program effectiveness?”

In an internship setting, the interns need continuous help and support from their job supervisors in order to understand the processes and working of the company and then to involve in that working. The supervision that the interns received could be divided into five types: Direct supervision, democratic supervision, bureaucratic supervision, autocratic supervision and there was an instance where no on-job supervisor was allotted to the intern. Table 9 shows the type of supervision that each intern was a part of.

**Table 9**

*Interns and the Type of Supervision and Internships*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names of Interns</th>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Type of supervision</th>
<th>Types of internships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anum</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Direct supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoaib</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Direct supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waqar</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Direct supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almas</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Democratic supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asim</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Democratic supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Democratic supervision</td>
<td>Task based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taniya</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Democratic supervision</td>
<td>Project based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beena</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Bureaucratic supervision</td>
<td>Rotation based internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mana</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Bureaucratic supervision</td>
<td>Project based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taha</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Bureaucratic supervision</td>
<td>Project based internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hina</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Autocratic supervision</td>
<td>Rotation based internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aqib</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>No supervisor allotment</td>
<td>Unplanned internship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.3.1. Direct supervision

This type of supervision was seen in smaller organizations where the on-job supervisor was always present to guide interns. The following statement of Shoaib’s supervisor makes it clearer, “we are a small organization, I myself am running the show. I need it people, so I hire people and I wanted them to work because I needed them.” It also had a lot to do with the nature of the internship, where the finance interns, Waqar (at a large organization) and Shoaib (at a small organization), were looking after very critical information and there was no chance for a mistake. Then there was Anum (the marketing intern) who was exclusively being trained to join the workforce of the IT firm and needed to learn information about the IT systems and software.

Anum was guided at every step as she explained, “Unho ne bhi mujhe ek ek cheez step by step sikhayi” (they taught me each and everything step by step). She talked about the sales calls and explained how she was taught to make these calls,

“pura pura din mujhe meri supervisor le kar bethti thi and she was like chalo hum test call kartay hain tum mere extension pr milao aur main tum se baat karti hun kese tumhe handle karna hai. Sir beth kar suntay hain unho ne shuru ka mera ek week literally mere saath beth kar suna hai k maine phone pr kese baat karni hai Aur woh mujhe rok kar kehtay thay Han yahan pr apnay aap ko improve karo” (the whole day my supervisor used to sit with me and she used to say, let’s make a test call, you call on my extension and I’ll talk to you, we’ll see how you handle. Sir (CEO) used to listen to us. In the first week he literally sat with me to see how I talk on the phone, and he used to stop me and told me that this is where I needed to improve).

Anum further said that not only her supervisor but also the company CEO monitored her on every step and if she needed any help any time, she could go to him and he would always help her, regardless of his busy schedule. Anum’s on-job supervisor was also of the view that Anum’s training was very extensive and micromanaged because they wanted her to be a part of their organization, “training mein (Anum) ki bahut time laga hai” (Anum’s training has taken a lot of time). She added,

“We inducted her into the marketing department to assist me in the marketing activities so that we can evaluate her behavioral skills and how
she behaves with others and people and how hard working she is so is Sabki (all of it) evaluation is done and after that I will induct her to the sales department.”

It was noted that finance interns involved exclusively in financial calculations were more closely monitored than the other two interns due to the nature of their work, as Waqar and Shoaib explained. According to Waqar, his on-job supervisor’s room was just next to Waqar’s cubicle so he used to come to Waqar every now and then and then to check on what he was doing. Waqar was happy with the way he was supervised and said that he was monitored very closely by his on-job supervisor. He said, “woh check karta rehta tha kya kaam kar raha hai kese kar raha hai aur jab hum lunch karnay bahar jatay thay tab discuss karta tha,” (he kept on checking that if I am working or not and how am I working and when we used to go out for lunch, then also he discussed). He further said that he learnt a lot from his on-job supervisor as he used to read different reports with him and was able to see how audits are handled in practical life. On the other hand, his on-job supervisor did not seem to be much satisfied with his own supervision as he thought that the work Waqar was doing was too menial for a BBA and he wanted Waqar to go beyond data entry and he said, “Mai chah raha tha ke woh Aur Bhi cheezain samajh jata jaise ke analytical work, jo hum kar rahe hote hain, wo kaam main usse nahi karwa saka, (I wanted him to learn more like the analytical work, like the one we are doing, but I could not make him do that work) maybe because of lack of interest, maybe he was fed up that the work here is very boring.”

Shoaib also revealed that he was continuously monitored by his on-job supervisor and was told to ask whatever questions those are necessary to get the work done. His on-job supervisor was extremely cooperative and guided him throughout his internship. He also helped Shoaib learn the concepts that he was not familiar with. For example Shoaib said about Sharia compliance, “Checking the sharia compliance was difficult as it requires in depth analysis of annual report. My supervisor guided me a lot on how to check interest bearing debt using notes to financial statements.” According to Shoaib, these six weeks were immensely valuable for him and he was able to learn new concepts especially in Sharia finance that he was unaware of previously.
4.3.3.2. Democratic supervision

Smaller organizations that did not have very rigid systems in place followed democratic supervision patterns and this type of supervision was mostly common in marketing field. Almas, Asim, Maria and Taniya had democratic supervision styles in their internships; where Almas, Maria and Asim were marketing interns and Taniya was an HR intern. As expressed earlier, the type of supervision style in an organization also depended upon the nature of tasks that were given to the interns. For example Almas was to come up with the social marketing strategies for her firm; Asim and Maria were responsible for bringing in clients for their respective companies and Taniya was responsible to bring in creative ideas for internship drives and the newsletter. Thus, all four needed their own space to work on the tasks given to them which was provided by their on-job supervisors.

Almas liked the working environment at the firm and enjoyed working there, "I really love that place." She not only took help from her on-job supervisor but also from her colleagues, who were very helpful and guided and supported her when needed. Her on-job supervisor was satisfied with her work and praised her by saying, "I think she has done very very well, with what she came if I showed you the initial writings she has done, balkay (also) she has exceeded our expectations I would say. I think she has done very well." In fact at the end of her sixth week into her internship, she was doing all the work assigned to her independently as expressed by her on-job supervisor, "I think that Almas has gotten the basic knowledge how this social media marketing is done because I would say that she is right now independently doing all that because she has no support right now."

Almas explained that her on-job supervisor mentored her by giving her a task and explained how it was done. Then Almas would complete the task in the given time and show it to her. She either approved it or asked Almas to make some changes. Almas was always welcomed to bring in her ideas to the table and discuss it with her on-job supervisor. All Almas’ ideas were appreciated and accepted by her on-job supervisor.

The company where Asim was appointed had a very autocratic environment but since the owner personally knew Asim so he had given him an open field to discuss and implement his ideas. In fact, when I asked Asim, if he did not personally know the owner what he would have done at the organization? Asim replied, "made a facebook page, koi instagram per page bana deta, yehi kartain hain marketing wale internship per aur kiya
Asim was able to bring in business for the company and his supervisor seemed to be satisfied with his performance, "But on the whole his performance was good. His performance was better than what I had expected. I gave him a chance to explore new things from his stay here." Asim explained how he was mentored by his on-job supervisor. According to Asim, his on-job supervisor visited various clients with Asim and asked him to observe how he interacted with these clients and how business negotiations were conducted.

"Uss banday ki baat cheet karnay ka style bohat professional hai. Aur to the point baat karta hai aur banday k hisaab se baat karta hai. For example Punjabi banday se baat kar raha tou full Punjabiyon ki Tarha milay ga, Sindhi se mil raha hoga Tou woh bilkul us hi tareeqay se milay ga" (the way that person speaks is very professional. He talks to the point and according to the person he’s talking to. For example, if he’s talking to a Punjabi, then he will talk like a Punjabi but if he is meeting a Sindhi then he will behave like a Sindhi).

After observing and learning these skills, Asim was asked to meet the clients himself and use his own skills to bring in the business for the company and no restrictions were laid upon him. There was only one objective that Asim had to achieve and that was to make as large a clientele for the company as possible. More or less, the same pattern was followed by Maria’s on-job supervisor as Maria’s on-job supervisor explained, “first of all when she came in here, so I gave her a brief introduction about what kind of nature of work is this, what they're engaged in and how we do work here.” He also showed her the working of various departments in the company, the marketing, the supply chain, and the finance department. Then she was taken to one of the presentations that he gave where she saw him sell his product. She was then told to make a presentation by herself to sell the company product and she reflected, “I found it difficult to create one because we need to look for every single detail. We need to mention every single detail. I am still working on this presentation.... for customer presentation and my supervisor guiding me for this on daily basis. C.E.O and my marketing supervisor, both are very helpful and guiding me for this presentation.”
Like Asim, Maria was personally acquainted with the CEO of the company where she was interning and hence she said, “My CEO here have given me rights to take decisions and actions regardless of my position here, I am allowed to give my opinions and suggestions when it comes to work.” She took advantage of this opportunity and made many changes in the style of making and presenting presentations to the customers. On the whole, her on-job supervisor was happy with her and said,

"She's good, she's confident, confidence regarding the industry its worth having.....Apart from this, she's competent. This is what I've noticed. She's done a few widgets, but you know, professionalism, it comes with time. So she will take time to get professional."

According to her on-job supervisor, she performed all her duties according to the best of her abilities. He felt that she did not lack anywhere as such, but rather believed that she will harness her skills more with the passage of time.

Taniya was an intern at the HR department of a private TV channel. Her new ideas were always welcomed at her organization. As Taniya puts it, “every day is being celebrated, and everyday there were things happening so they needed ideas continuously and every day I was busy with giving new inputs for these events, sometimes these ideas would be accepted other times they were not exercised.”

So there were ideas such as adding a segment to the newsletter and to make an organizational chart for the young recruits that were accepted by her organization and were implemented, whereas, there were ideas such as competency based recruitment corpus that Taniya wanted to make a part of the recruitment selection criteria but was denied because her on-job supervisor said to her that, “Hamari company toh bahut choti hai (our company is very small) so we don't do it like this idea.” Taniya’s on-job supervisor was very satisfied with Taniya’s work; nonetheless, she decided to let Taniya know of her weak points before Taniya left her internship. She told in her interview,

“She was leaving I sat with her for 2 hours, so I told her that whatever I am saying I am saying for her benefit and where ever I am right now I am because my bosses have taught me all this. And I told her that because now you will be going for a permanent position so whatever things I am going to tell you you must take all of that very positively.”
In all four cases, the interns were welcome to bring in their ideas and to share those with their on-job supervisors. It was interesting to note that two interns personally knew the company owners and as revealed by the interns themselves, this personal acquaintance helped to gain trust of the owners and thus they were given more liberty at their internships. The other two interns were at companies that were democratic in their working style and welcomed novel ideas and creativity. All four organizations were Pakistani privately owned businesses.

_Bureaucratic supervision._ Beena, Mana and Taha were a part of bureaucratic supervision. Large companies and organizations usually follow this type of system where all practices are in place and standardized. As Beena’s on-job supervisor explained, “basically our organization has provided us with the guidance; it is a part of our SOP as to how we are supposed to handle interns. ... toh hum usi ko follow kar rahe hote hain (so we are following that).”

Similarly, Mana’s on-job supervisor described the internship practices as, ”hamara tou assignment based hota hai na tou assignment mai hum ussay brief kar detay hain keh kia project hai hamara ..... tou after briefing umm... agar agree hota hai banda tou ussay rukh laytay hain intern (Ous is assignment based and in the assignment we brief him/her that what is our project umm....if he/she agrees, we keep him/her as an intern).

Taha was inducted as an intern for the Youth Advisory Program, where according to his on-job supervisor his task was,

“To find graduating badge in the universities of Karachi which is ready for the job. He had to co-ordinate with them he has to link with them and then explain this program to their placement centers and take time from them so that we can run this program at their campus.”

Interns who were working at banks received bureaucratic supervision as all their machinery was geared towards this type of supervision and in all the three cases, the supervisor gave the interns a task and explained them how it was done and then they took help from their friends and colleagues in the organization. They could go to their on-job supervisor whenever they wanted but due to his/her busy schedule, they took assistance from those who were around them and knew how to do the particular task. Thus, when asked about how they were supervised by their respective on-job supervisors, they explained their supervision in the flowing words.
Beena said that the environment at the bank was friendly and people were willing to help her whenever she needed it, "the staff always used to help me if I needed it", "so whatever information I needed if I needed a report on how to count the money so whatever it was they used to always help me." Also, her on-job supervisor being very busy had asked certain staff members to be with Beena so that she may not have any problem, "I was asked to be with a certain staff member who would help me."

Mana said that during her time at the internship, she was assigned the responsibility to be a part of the batch hiring project. She described the environment at the bank to be very conducive for learning and welcoming,

"The most important thing I like about Batch Hiring Department of the bank is its environment that is friendly as well as professional.......the staff was very supportive due to which I was able to learn each and every process of recruitment.......wahan asal main environment esa tha k woh hamain delegate kartay thay kaam thik hai, tou hamain responsibility bhi feel hoti aur matlab ek tarah se un ka woh nahi tha k yeh karo woh karo, woh bohat supportive environment tha" (Actually, over there, the environment was such that it was very supportive, they used to delegate to us responsibilities that made us feel important and they were not telling us do this, do that, what I mean to say is that the environment was very supportive).

When Taha was asked, how he was mentored, he replied "Mentored? Not much, it was just that they used to outline the basics of each work they gave me when they were calling the candidates for interview they made a few calls in front of me to show me how it was done."

He seemed dissatisfied with the achievement of his career development goal. He wrote in his reflections, "I have learned a lot from here. Just one goal I feel which is not achieved here is to develop my interviewing skills. I did around 5-7 interviews only which I feel is very less." He explained this thought in the focus group interview by saying, "I wanted someone to sit beside me and elaborate that this is how is happens, if this person is not the right choice then why is he not the right choice this could have happened that this is the person and he is the right choice. Or if he is not suitable then the reason for his unsuitability they just
left me “Jao aur ja ker interview Kar Ke aajao” (Go and conduct the interviews).

According to him, he could not attain this goal because he was not properly guided and was not given the opportunity to conduct more interviews. If proper guidance would have been provide, this goal could have been achieved as declared by his on-job supervisor that not all goals could be achieved as, "we were so preoccupied with a lot of stuff that we could not get a lot of things done."

It was noted that all banks followed the bureaucratic supervision, mainly because all their work was done through their devised systems and also because it was easier for on-job supervisors to get the job done in such a large organization by sticking to their Standard Operational Procedures (SOPs). It was also seen that for students it was easy to settle in this type of system as there was a procedure for everything and all they needed to do was to learn the procedure.

4.3.3.3. Autocratic supervision

Hina had the opportunity to do her internship in the HR department of Karachi’s one of the most renowned hospital. Even though the people at the organization were friendly, yet the overall environment of the organization was very authoritarian. She was heard saying the following words over her conversation with me on the phone, in her reflections and her focus group, "bahut zyada strictness thi (there was a lot of strictness)", "there was unnecessary strictness in overall organization, which caused high level of turnover as employees felt too pressured with work and the general environment", "there was too much strictness even mere upar bhi (even on me) I cannot go here or there and I cannot access anything on my computer," "My boss was very strict in terms of everything ."

Hina's supervisor refused to meet with me in person for an individual interview, but agreed to talk to me on the phone. She described Hina as a good hardworking girl and did not answer any other questions except one and said that her evaluation is written in the evaluation form and I could refer to it. Even though her supervisor followed the authoritarian school of thought, Hina was always welcomed to ask whatever she wanted, which the supervisor also expressed in the short telephonic interview and said, "My objective was to prepare her, I gave her work that helped her develop herself.” Hina's
supervisor did not follow open door policy and she had to take an appointment before walking in her supervisor's office. Nevertheless, the other employees at the organization were very helpful and were always ready pitch in to help Hina.

4.3.3.4. No supervisor allotment

There were two interns who were not given anyone to supervise them at the internship. In Aqib’s case, he selected his own supervisor,

“At the start of the internship, I was not officially assigned to any particular manager but I personally acquired acquaintance of our senior product manager because first, he was a senior product manager and in the first sight he seems to be the nice and to be honest an experienced professional.”

Aqib therefore started to work under the supervision of his self-appointed on-job supervisor who gave him some backup literature to read and then asked Aqib to compile literature that can be used by the doctors of various salts. He checked Aqib at every point and guided him on the given task. But soon Aqib found out that his self-appointed on-job supervisor was resigning from his current position. Aqib became worried because even though other managers were also giving him various tasks, yet, the major chunk of his work was supervised by this on-job supervisor. Aqib did not know what to do and therefore wrote in his reflections,

“After hearing the news I got a bit confused because he was the one who was giving me the routine tasks and was keeping the check......Now I’m guessing I have to face a little problems for carrying out researches..... but things like getting a check on my researches whether its relevant or not because not every research in pharma is relevant.”

In fact he wrote in his reflections that for some time, till he found himself a new supervisor, he did not have much to do, “He (his previous on-job supervisor) was present constantly and was keeping a check on me. It will not be hard to say that now I do what I want to.” Aqib soon found a new supervisor who was the product manager also and was able to continue working till the end of his internship under his supervision.

Almas on the other hand decided to quit the internship at a multinational FMCG after non-allocation of a supervisor. She said that she felt unwanted at the organization and it seemed to her that she was wasting her time at the host organization.
Even though all interns had to initially adjust in the new environment, there were a few that faced some problems, mainly because they either did not agree with their supervisors for example in Maria’s case; or there was a communication gap, which was evident in Taniya’s case; there was a difference in the goals of the supervisor and the intern, as with Waqar and Almas’ and Aqib’s cases were most unfortunate where no supervisor was allotted to them.

4.3.3.5. Disagreement with the Supervisor

Maria wanted to give her presentation according to her own understanding but she wrote in her reflections, “The supervisor here was resistant for new ideas.” She was asked to quit the presentation that she made on the eleventh hour and the supervisor decided to present himself to the customers. Maria took the matter to the CEO, whom she personally knew; thus, she wrote in her reflections, “I have conveyed this message to my CEO when I faced this problem on my first day of presentation and my CEO took action and has allowed employees to guide and deal with customers with their own art.” The CEO took action and Maria was from then onwards given all opportunity to sell the product as she felt fit; her supervisor was, nevertheless, always there to guide her.

4.3.3.6. Communication gap

There seemed to be a communication gap between Taniya and her supervisor. Even though Taniya was mentored very well by her supervisor, but there was a friction throughout the internship which may be due to poor communication between the two. According to Taniya, the tasks were not narrowed down for her and she gives an example of training sessions that they were to conduct for the new employees, “It was more of like free range, do anything, like do whatever you feel like...and if I did try something at my end ...... toh usse yeh hota tha ke nai aap ko is tarah se nahi karna chahiye tha, yeh theek nahi tha. Toa aap pehle hi usko narrow down kar de the toh main waise hi karti” (then it was like, no you should have done it like this, this is not right. So if you would have narrowed it down for me in the first place, I would have done it like that). On the other hand, her supervisor complained that Taniya had the habit of asking too many questions and that she did not work independently. Taniya gave another incident of a recruitment drive presentation and said, “She told me isko dekhlena (look at it) and make adjustments.
It was perfect I didn't know what to do with it, so I asked her what exactly she wants me to do with it."

Taniya wrote in her reflections, “I think I see a pattern that (my supervisor) wants me to learn myself as to what I can bring to the table and then she tells me what I should do. The only thing I think is a bit problematic is that, she doesn't communicate it well to me as to what she wants."

Another problem that occurred due to this communication gap was that they could not efficiently handle the work load where Taniya’s supervisor complained, “Taniya cannot prioritize her work,” whereas Taniya was of the view,

“I felt that with my supervisor it was a problem that .....she used to do everything on the 11th hour. Since there was no timeline so she used to work at the very last moment, so I had to stay late with her sometimes till 2 a.m. I think if there would have been some sort of a timeline it would have been better.”

It can be seen that both the supervisor and the intern felt that if they were unable to achieve the targets it was because of the other person.

Almas’ case was very different from the rest. She had joined a multinational as an intern but had no idea what her objectives at the internship were going to be as they were never explained to her. On the second day she was told that she has to go for a market survey and has to find out the price of loose cream basically it was to "quantify the market of loose cream". The problem was that her appointed on-job supervisor was in Lahore and was supposed to guide her through the internship, but according to Almas,"Jab tak mujhay pata he nahi keh agay kerna kiya hai, like maqsad kiya hai mutlab theek hai quantify tou hum ker rahay hain magar kyon kar rahay hain. Mujhay pata he nahi hai tou mai agay kiya karoon? (Until I know what is it that I have to do, like what is the purpose, Ok, we are quantifying, but why are we quantifying. When I don’t know so what should I do?) I don’t know what they are expecting from me." When I asked Almas to call her supervisor and ask, I was told that the supervisor was not picking up the phone.

Even though it was supposedly a very good opportunity for her, yet, due to lack of communication and supervision, she had to quit her internship at the multinational. She stated her, "But to be very honest ma’am, I’m not interested. Like, I can’t do this. I want to quit and I want to discontinue ..........You see I want to discontinue because I’m wasting my
time and they are wasting their time as well.” So Almas resigned from her internship just after 10 days of joining the multinational.

4.3.3.7. Difference in the goals of the supervisor

The problem in Waqar’s internship was due to difference in the goals of the intern and his supervisor as the supervisor expressed in his interview, “”Mai chah raha tha ke woh Aur Bhi cheezain samajh Jata Jaise ke analytical work, jo hum kar rahe hote hain, wo kaam main usse nahi karwa saka,” (I wanted him to learn more like the analytical work, like the one we are doing, but I could not make him do that work).

Waqar’s supervisor felt that he lacked dedication and was not willing to work as hard as he was required to do. He said in his interview,

“Aapka dedication bahut high hona chahiye agar aap time dekh kar kaam kar rahe hai to aap kuch seekh nahi sakte (you should have a high dedication level, if you work according to your watch then you cannot learn anything). I had asked him keh apne driver ko bol do k in particular days mein tum late jaoge but aap un hi dino mein chutti kar lo toh aapka dedication level pata chal jata hai (tell your driver that you will go late in these particular days but you take off in the same days, this tells of your dedication level).”

When Waqar was asked about this complain by his supervisor, he replied,

“He wanted me to join the taxation field for he was passionate about it and also wanted others to do the same. I thought at first it would be interesting, but later I felt I am not fit enough for this. Yes, the money is there, but I crave for more existing and field or policy related job.”

So where Waqar’s supervisor wanted him to join taxation but Waqar was more interested in policy making.

4.3.4. Sub Question Four: First Main Question

The fourth sub question that I sought to answer was, “What internship program structure does the employer use for intern placement?”

The internships that were understudy could be divided into four types: task based, project based, rotation based and unplanned as shown in table 9.
4.3.4.1. Task based internship

Most of the internships were task based where the companies had a pre-planned goal before inducting the interns. All marketing interns were a part of task based internship except Aqib who had to be part of an unplanned internship. All marketing interns were given a company orientation and explained how different departments of the company worked, and then they were given the task of bringing in as many clients as possible to the company. The method of reaching out to and obtaining clients was different for every company. The interns had to first learn this process and then get involved in the sales and marketing of the product of that company. Asim, who was an intern at a privately owned paint company, was assigned the task to create brand awareness among top level management and corporates and make sales to them. Maria did her internship at an oil and lubricants company and was mainly attached with the sales and the marketing, where her main responsibilities included: to market the product and present it to the customers and to deal with the customers and to take customer feedback. Anum worked as an intern at an international IT based company where she was taught to work on the CRM software and one of her major responsibility was to generate sales leads which she did by making around 200 phone calls a day. Almas was an intern at the social marketing department of a professional services firm dealing in immigration to Canada and USA, her responsibilities included blog writing, developing content for digital promotion and maintaining client database but her main job was customer targeting. She targeted her potential customers using linkedin and various company websites to reach to people who meet the required criteria for immigration.

Finance interns Waqar and Shoaib were also a part of task based internship where Waqar was interning at the taxation department of a textile company and was responsible for maintaining the taxation database and to perform transaction in that software properly and match the returns and accounts. According to Waqar’s on-job supervisor,

“We had a long backlog of taxation management, since we have to file so many things for that we need to maintain our database, so we wanted to hire a person who could perform transaction in that software properly and match the returns and accounts.”
Shoaib was interning at an equity research department of a shariah compliance firm and had two major responsibilities the first one was to manage portfolios and the other was to check if the company was sharia compliant or not.

Since the tasks given to these interns were continuous and were not restricted by a time period, therefore, it can be said that these interns learned how to perform the given tasks effectively and gave their input to their companies. About Almas her supervisor said, “I think she has done very very well….. balkay (in fact) she has exceeded our expectations I would say.”

Similarly, Anum’s supervisor said, “main jab bhhi koi cheez bata rahi hoti hoon, toh woh usko bahut hi focus mind ke saath sun rahi hoti hai (whenever I am saying something, so she is listening to it with a very focused mind), and she does not ignore what I say and next time she produces the result jo main chahti hun (as I want).”

On the other hand Maria’s on-job supervisor described her as a confident and competent young lady; whereas, Asim’s on-job supervisor said about Asim, “his performance was good. His performance was better than what I had expected.”

Shoaib’s on-job supervisor was glad that he chose Shoaib amongst the other applicants, “We interviewed a few people and he matched our requirements, so he said that he is going to be the good candidate and Alhamdulillah (all praise to God) he proved to be a very good candidate.”

Waqar’s on-job supervisor praised him by saying, “overall he worked very well he work with dedication and our senior management is very happy with his performance.”

Even though task based internships were found to be fruitful for the interns and they learnt how to achieve their goals; yet, it must be noted that the focus of these internships were not the interns but the host organization.

4.3.4.2. Project based internship

Taha and Taniya were HR interns and even though Mana was a finance intern, she did her internship at a bank’s HR department. All three followed project based internship where all three were involved in hiring and recruitment projects; Taha and Mana for their respective banks and Taniya for a private TV channel. Mana was able to successfully complete her project, whereas, Taha and Taniya both were unable to complete their projects. The main reason for the projects to remain incomplete was because the on-job
supervisors kept giving these interns tasks other than their projects. The positive point that developed from this situation was that the interns learnt beyond their scope of work as they performed other official tasks as well. The negative outcome was that they could not complete the project. So, even when they were hired for certain projects, they were assisting their on-job supervisors in all the tasks that their on-job supervisors were getting. As Taha’s on-job supervisor said,

“I would say that I could not achieve my goals hundred percent but I can say that Taha was a very good intern for us.... I wouldn't say entirely it was his fault, but it was our fault as well because we were so preoccupied with a lot of stuff that we could not get a lot of things done.”

Which was further explained by Taha,

“The supervisor also does what the head tells him or her to do. The supervisors themselves don’t know what are they going to get in the next hour it used to happen with me, ok I am calling the candidates and then the HOD came and then he starts asking for the interview and now we have to leave our work and start give him the interview sheets....... even the supervisors are running around even they don’t know what they will get next.”

Task based and project based internships were mostly organization oriented where the need of the organization was kept in mind before offering an internship. These internships accept that of Maria’s were advertised and reached the interns through the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department or through social media and online advertising sites.

At times interns acted as assistants of the on-job supervisors and were many a times asked to leave the work that they were doing and help their on-job supervisors with other tasks.

4.3.4.3. Rotation based internships

Hina and Beena were a part of rotation based internship. Both these internships were not advertised as Beena’s supervisor explained, “Actually, the criterion is that we choose intern on the student request. .... Beena's request came to us directly through the HR. Beena approached HR and they directed her to us.”
Similarly, Hina approached her internship organization and requested for an internship opportunity. It was observed that in these types of internship, since the focus was not the organization, the focus was on student learning and the interns were given an experience of all the departments. Beena’s supervisor explained that their purpose is to teach the intern, “Hum logo ki koshish hoti hai jo bhi intern hamare paas aa raha hai woh kuch na kuch seekh kar jaye” (We try that an intern who comes to us must learn something). A similar remark was given by Hina’s supervisor who said, “My objective was to prepare her, I gave her work that helped her develop herself.”

These internships were very helpful for the interns and they were able to understand the working of the organization through these internships but they were not given any authority or responsibility. They were treated as interns and not employees as the focus was upon giving interns a glimpse of all departments to the interns.

4.3.4.4. Unplanned internship

Aqib found an internship in a pharmaceutical company through his father’s reference. He was not officially appointed any supervisor, rather he; himself approached a manager in the firm and asked him to give him some work. He was then given a task to conduct research on various salts and write literature for doctors’ use. Even though there was no internship structure that the company was following, Aqib was able to gain insight of the pharma industry. Nevertheless there were gaps in his internship, especially after Aqib’s self-appointed on-job supervisor left the company and no other on-job supervisor was allotted to him, so he had to go to the marketing head to ask for work. But Aqib felt that there was a communication barrier between himself and his on-job supervisor, “He was the head of marketing tou wahan pe communication barrier aa raha tha (so there was a communication barrier).” He also says about the work given to him, “you've to dig by yourself (for work) this was a challenge.”

The driving source of this type of internship was the intern himself as Aqib was able to maneuver his way through and make use of his internship opportunity as much as he could. Even though there were instances when he had no work to do, yet he tried his best to learn from his internship as much as he could. But not all interns have this ability; as in case of Almas where she decided to resign from her internship which was unplanned and unstructured.
4.3.4.5. Internship period

On-job supervisors of all task based internship and project based internships thought that the internship period was not enough for the interns. So we have statements such as the following from the on-job supervisors when asked if they felt six weeks were enough for the internship:

“I think not... I would say it takes them four weeks to learn... when they get into the full swing the internship ends,” (Almas’ on-job supervisor)

“Main training de rahi hoon and ye bahut kam time hai (I am giving her training and it is very less time) so I have extended to 2 months,” (Anum’s on-job supervisor).

“He could only do 50% of the task as the time period was very less. How much can you work in 6 weeks? What can you teach and learn in 6 weeks?” (Asim’s on-job supervisor).

“4th year mein aik lambi internship honi chahiye. at least 8 weeks ki. Jab student ke upar kaam ka burden aega ..... jab wo pass out ho raha hoga tou wo mentally prepared hoga ke industry mein mera kaam hoga kia,” (in 4th year the internship should be long at least of 8 weeks, only then will the student be mentally prepared to enter the industry after he passes out of the university) (Maria’s on-job supervisor).

Shoaib’s and Waqar’s on-job supervisors thought that six weeks’ time period was very less for internship, in fact Waqar’s on-job supervisor proposed three month internship.

It was surprising to note that all the marketing interns in task based internship were of the same view as their supervisor but the finance interns, Shoaib and Waqar thought that six weeks internship was more than enough as Shoaib said, “I guess six weeks was enough because when you go for an internship you are not working at a very high post so the work that they give you is not so diversified so I think for entry level 6 weeks is enough,” and Waqar consented and said, “Six weeks is enough to learn the basic concept.”

There was a visible difference between how marketing interns thought and how the finance interns looked at this issue.

Mana, Taha and Taniya were a part of project based internship setting. Mana and Taniya both along with their on-job supervisors were of the view that six weeks is not enough to capture the internship experience fully.
So where Mana was of the view that, “Han jab tuk aap us pr set hotay hain aap ki internship khatam hi jati hai (by the time you settle down, the internship is over); her on-job supervisor opined, “Six weeks thora kum hai kyunki project ko samajhna aur phir uss per apna umm... then result dena”... (six weeks is very less time because first, to understand the project and then to give result on it). And similar was the case with Taniya and her supervisor but there was a contrast in Taha’s and his supervisor’s opinion.

According to Taha, “Six weeks was enough to understand the recruitment and selection process, I had learnt everything that have to do with recruitment and selection,” whereas his on-job supervisor said, “This whole process takes at least two months, six weeks of internship is very less.” It seems here that where Taha was talking about going through the whole process, his supervisor was implying actually going through the whole process.

These internships were tailor made for six weeks and neither the interns and nor the supervisors felt that this time period was either more or less as the internships were formulated keeping in mind the six weeks duration. Hina and Beena were both a part of this type of internship and their satisfaction can be gauged by the following remarks made by Beena and her supervisor:

According to Beena,

“It was effective very much I can now even work in a bank, I don't need the type of supervision that I needed in this... in this internship. It was very effective I used to work from 9 to 5 continuously. It was a complete practice it was like working on a job,” whereas, her supervisor remarked, “I think it depends upon the scope of the internship so if you are talking about my branch, I think that six weeks were enough to get the basic knowledge that how a bank works. Hamare mind mein intern ke liye yeh hota hai ke hum usko basic knowledge de bank ki working kay baray main (In our mind, for interns we know we have to give them basic knowledge of the working of the bank)”.

Aqib, even though had to be a part of unplanned internship, was able to successfully work for the organization. His supervisor and Aqib, both had different point of views regarding the internship time period. Aqib’s on-job supervisor as mentioned previously was not interested in the interview and said that the time period was “fine,” on the other hand, Aqib said that one cannot understand anything in just six weeks as two weeks are spent in just understanding the work and then four weeks pass by very quickly.
On the whole, the six weeks were not enough for the internships as most of the
inters and their on-job supervisors thought that there was much more to be learnt which
could not be learnt due to the short time period. It was mostly advised that the internship
period should be between two to three months in order to be more effective.

4.3.5. The First Main Question

The answers of the four sub questions helped us understand the fundamentals to
answer the first main question. Where the sub questions focused on essentials of an
experiential learning project, the first main question directly asks, “How can Kolb’s
experiential learning model be applied in an internship setting in Pakistan?”

The most important and foremost thing in Kolb’s experiential learning model is the
design of an experiential learning activity. This experiential learning activity is supposed
to be designed in such a way that it is able to fulfil the learners’ predefined goals. Then this
experiential learning activity should be continuously monitored and supervised keeping the
goals in mind. The toughest part of the experiential learning is its assessment as in
experiential learning; it is not the end result but rather understanding of the learning process
that one is graded upon. To combat the problem of grading the internships, Kolb had
proposed reflection writing where the learners continuously assess their learning. This
research began with interns chalking down their
goals with the help of their on-
job supervisors.

It was very important that the interns’ goals must also be shared with the on-job
supervisors as they are in the right position to tell if the goals chalked down by the intern
are achievable or not. It was seen in Phase I of the research that most interns had either
superfluous goals or goals that were not aligned with the internship experience. The main
reason for this mismatch was the interns had set these goals in their mind and had not
discussed it with their on-job supervisors which lead to discrepancy between their self-
made goals and their internship experience.

It was seen that all of the internships except one were pre-planned by the host
organizations as either the task based or project based or the rotation based internships,
such that the host organizations had a fair idea about what the interns will be working upon
during their internship period. It was an important observation to note that even in Phase I
of this project, the interns seem to be all performing some work at their internships but
eight out of ten said that their internships were not pre-planned; whereas, 11 interns in Phase II of this research said that their internship was planned. The reason for this change in the result may be that in Phase II of the research, the interns sat down with their on-job supervisors to discuss their goals. In the process, they were told what they will be doing at the internship and why certain goals are achievable, while others are not. Also, it seems that the on-job supervisors felt more responsibility towards thoroughly explaining the internship process to the interns so that there is no confusion in their mind. This gave interns a clear idea about the direction of their internship. On the other hand, in Phase I of the research, the interns were very superficially explained their duties and were told that they had to just do the work that comes their way and ask the supervisor for assistance where they feel trapped. This led to unclear picture of the internships in the interns’ mind and they assumed that their internships were not planned.

The interns were then monitored and supervised throughout their internships. The supervision may have been direct, democratic, bureaucratic or authoritarian; nonetheless, they were supervised by their on-job supervisors. It needs to be mentioned here that no faculty supervision was provided to the interns which the interns felt that they required. As Beena said, “I think it totally depends upon the company, if they don’t give students to work then they are wasting students time. I think.....this time wastage can be stopped completely if the faculty meets the supervisor before the beginning of the internship so that everyone shows seriousness.” Also in Aqib’s case where he was not given an on-job supervisor, a faculty supervisor could have intervened and helped him through the internship. Also, in Almas’ case where she was not in touch with her on-job supervisor as her on-job supervisor was in another city, Almas had to resign from the internship after 10 days.

It was noted though that the interns in Phase I of the study felt more need for a faculty supervisor as compared to those in the Phase II of the internship, and the reason for this may lay in the fact that interns were recording their own progress throughout the internship through their reflections and could assess their learning. On the other hand, the interns in Phase I could not gauge their own learning and felt that a faculty supervisor could have helped them to learn more at the internship setting. It is worth mentioning that interns in Phase II were of the opinion that the faculty supervisor should have some experience of working at the industry, as Shoaib remarked,
“If I ask the person whose actually in an organization, he is working there so he knows but jo mere teachers hai unko organisations leave 10 to 12 years ho gaye hain aur woh bas teaching mai hi full time hai (but it has been 10-12 years since my teachers left organizations and now they are only teaching).......teachers who are connected with the industry I would have come to them and I would have but I felt that coming to teachers over here was useless.”

On the other hand, the marketing interns were of the view that since they all are catering to different industries, so they should have a choice to choose faculty supervisors according to their own needs.

The need for a faculty supervisor does not end here, but it is the duty of a faculty supervisor to receive continuous reflections and then to assess and grade the report submitted at the end of the internship. There were many discrepancies between intern reflections and their written reports; this was because there was no one to supervise them in their report writing. Also, 10 out of 12 interns were given B grade whereas one intern was given a C and one an A grade. The faculty members were grading the interns on the reports that they received from the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department which resulted in faculty grading the end product and not the process. What made matters worse was the inability of faculty members to track down forged reports.

In Pakistan, Kolb’s experiential learning model can be applied by making a few adjustments to the current internship practices. First, the results point towards the need to appoint faculty supervisors. Second, the results show that the goals need to be set with the help of on-job supervisor and shared with the faculty supervisor. Third, it was revealed that without continuous supervision of the intern by the on-job supervisor and continuous provision of reflections; the intern may be lost and unable to understand his/her learning. The intern may seek help from the faculty supervisor if anything unpleasant happens at the internship. Lastly, the assessment process was not transparent and there was a need for it to be triangulated through the intern report, the reflective writing and the intern evaluation report. All the three should be submitted to the faculty supervisor, who would grade them after taking into consideration the work that the interns did at the internship.
4.3.6. Sub Question One: Second Main Question

The first sub question of the second main question was, “What is the understanding of the institution’s internship department regarding the success of an internship program?”

An interview was conducted with the program head, a very experienced person and had both the teaching and the industry experience. He was very much aware of the strong points and the weaknesses of the program and also the limitations of the institute. He started off by explaining that the importance of the internship program is immense as most of the courses conducted in business institutes across Pakistan are very theoretical in nature,

“This is not only our decision but also the decision of HEC that you don’t provide them a degree unless you have provided them a meaningful, a useful, practical training in the corporate world for 6 weeks so this is what the internship is and this is the purpose of the internship. This is basically to provide an insight to the students of how things work in the world outside or the corporate world. Whatever theoretically they learn here, they should be able to correlate and relate to the real life where they are going to spend rest of their professional life.”

He stressed on the term meaningful as he remarked that the purpose of internships is not to just send the intern at any organization but to make sure that the internship if purposeful, meaningful and the internship goals of fruitful learning are met with. He elaborated,

“It should be meaningful means that aik sahi adaray main chay huftay, structured exposure aur training ho (in a proper organization, there should be structured exposure and training)..... so we have a list of companies that we have visited and that we know who have consented to accept our students for internships. Unn main say requirements bhi aati hain (these companies send their requirements) and we prefer that the students should apply in these companies.”

He said that the objectives of the internship are realized through the formal reports that the interns submit and the supervisor feedback. The interns were provided a format for the report prior to their internship so that they have the format in mind when they went for the internship. According to him the purpose of the report was twofold, first to evaluate what the intern had done at his internship and second the format of the report is such that,
"We want them to focus upon how they can relate their classroom learning with the practical work at the company." He continued to say that other the report, "We also give supervisors a form in a formal format in which they have to report the performance of the internee. What did he learn, what was his behavior, how was the punctuality. It is a two page confidential report that directly comes to me."

Nevertheless, he said that it was not possible to visit all internships to see what the interns are doing there as there are around 450 companies and many students.

When asked about what he thought of the internship duration of six weeks, he said that even though in other countries and especially in more advanced countries, the amount of practical work that the students do is equivalent to the amount of their theoretical studies but same is not possible in our current setting. Mainly, because we have structured our program in such a way that more stress is given to teaching through books and secondly, the institute does not have the relevant staff that could teach courses in more practical way. He described, "Now if you make your whole learning practical then you should have teachers who would have that type of practical exposure.....They don’t know the difference between head office and factory, they only teach through books."

He said that the university can decide to give internships the weightage of a course but it will be a strategic decision that the management will have to take. Even though he gave an example of the capstone projects which were according to him were a major step towards practical learning. He gave example of the United States and said that their teaching and learning is practical based and that was the reason, he said that their students after a bit of work orientation go straight on-job. But in Pakistan, the companies have to train the graduates before they can start work, "but with us, we teach around 40-50 courses here and 90% of what is taught is never used and those that are used, too are used in a very different manner."

He was of the view that such a change is not impossible and that, "This is a very very major strategic decision that we have to make.... But such a decision will take major training of faculty. This is not something that can happen overnight, you have to change the entire structure."

It can be concluded that the Head, Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department knew very well about the importance and delivery of the internship program. He also was well aware of his limitations and was trying to deliver the best to the students.
Even the job supervisors noted that the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department of the institute was one of the best. Here is an example of what Anum’s supervisor said, “Placement department ki jahan hum baat karte hain bahut accha hai (when we talk about the placement department, it’s very good). ….They have a very good and proper graduate directory I was surprised to see such a proper graduate directory.”

She further added that this institute is the first one to send their graduate directory. Similarly, the on-job supervisors who had contacted this department for internships were satisfied with their response and said that this institute had one of the most efficient placement departments.

### 4.3.7 Sub Question Two: Second Main Question

The second sub question of the second main question was, “What roles do internships play in gaining employment for the interns and potential employees for companies?” It was revealed that out of the 12 interns under study 08 were offered a job at the company where they were interning. Table 10 gives details of the job offered to the interns.

**Table 10**

*Jobs Offered to the Interns*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interns</th>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Internship offered</th>
<th>Job offered</th>
<th>Job acceptance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Almas</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anum</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Through acquaintance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asim</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Through social media/acquaintance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aqib</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Through acquaintance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mana</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beena</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Through acquaintance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoaib</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waqar</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hina</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Through acquaintance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taniya</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taha</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Institute’s Internship office</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was noted that the interns who got their internship through an acquaintance were not offered a job but those that got the internship through the institution’s internship department were latter offered jobs. It was also interesting to know that all internships that
came through the internship department or through social media were seeking to fill a position at their company for which they had hired an intern. It can be concluded that in Pakistan, too like elsewhere in the world, companies are using internships to look for the best candidates for their companies. Out of the eight interns who were offered a job, only three accepted the offer. The rest of the five interns wanted to look for better prospects as in the case of Almas, Shoaib, and Taniya; whereas, Waqar was not interested in taxation and Mana wanted to join the supply chain department and not the HR department.

The Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department also played its part in making sure that the interns who go for internships are able to find themselves a position at the host organizations. The Head explained, that before going for the internships the interns are briefed about how they should conduct themselves at the internship, how they should behave and that they are representing their institute. They are also given a particular format according to which they are to make their CVs. They are also told that if they performed well at the internship, there are 80% chances that they will land themselves a job in that organization. They are also told, “When you go to the internship it should be structured, asks your supervisor to make a plan for you or you can be rotated in different so there should be a plan; so if there’s a problem then they can inform us and we can help them and intervene.”

Even though the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department does not contact individual supervisors to ask about the tasks that would be given to the interns, they believe that the internship will be focused if the interns go to the internships offered by the Alumni, Placement & International Cooperation department. The reason given by the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department was that the companies that offer internships through the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department of the institute have been scrutinized by them and are told to place interns in a hands-on learning environment.

4.3.8 Sub Question Three: Second Main Question

The third sub question to the second main question was, “To what extent are the needs of the industry aligned with the courses delivered at the institution?”

Even though all supervisors were of the view that the interns from the understudy institutions were confident, creative and hardworking; yet, there was a difference in what
they had studied at the institute and what they faced in the market. The answer to this question varies from discipline to discipline.

4.3.8.1 HR Interns

The HR interns (Hina, Taniya, Taha and Mana, who was a finance intern but interned in HR department of a bank) were of the opinion that the courses that they attended at their business institute were very relevant and the theories and HR practices that they studied were very much practically applied in the internship setting. Hence Hina was of an opinion,

“I have been reviewing work processes for two weeks now and I can recall most of the knowledge taught in our courses regarding staffing...... I also enjoyed it, a lot of learning, there were many theories that were applicable and I got to observe how they were applied (in practice), we only used to read them as theory in courses but now I have seen how they are used in practice.”

According to Taniya, “There are a number of policies such as recruitment policy, training policy, negotiation policy, transfer policy, credit policy, leaves policy, attendance policy that are the same as we studied in our HR course.” She further explained the interviewing process at a job fair which was according to her studied courses,

“At the job fair we took on spot interviews of the students who were dropping their CVs. In my elective, recruitment and selection, we learnt that for the initial screening interview, we ask a specific set of questions from all the applicants. At the job fairs, we did a similar format. I was supposed to ask for their program, major, previous experience (if any). During this screening, I was to assess whether or not the applicant would be able to adjust in our organization.”

Taniya did explain that there were sometimes limitations due to which some of the theories or processes could not be followed. She gave an example of a computer related training, “According to theory, all computer related trainings have the herringbone layout as it is the ideal design to hold technical trainings as the trainer can easily move and help everyone around.” But she added that they had a boardroom where the training had to be conducted and the facility for herringbone layout was not available.
Taha wrote in his reflections about the policies and functioning of the bank where he was working, “They are pretty much aligned with what I have studied in human resource course.” Similarly Mana who was a finance intern interning at the HR department of a bank said that the hiring and recruitment process of her organization was the same as that she had studied in the books and found no difference.

Since their education and their work were at par with one another, therefore, the on-job supervisors seemed to be highly satisfied with these interns. Following are the statements from their supervisors:

Hina’s on-job supervisor: “She is a keen learner and the work she performed here will benefit the company.”

Taniya’s on-job supervisor: “Well in the career drive I think she did best because when you are there, there are so many students that come to you so I could not hear each and every word that she was saying but whatever questions she asked from students were very relevant.....jo newsletter tha uska pura content develop karke diya tha. Usme woh achi thi uske paas bahut creative ideas tha aur usne mujhe apne ideas bhi diye” (she developed the full content of the newsletter. She was good in that and she gave her ideas in that as well).

Mana’s supervisor: “She performed very well... aur (and) aa... according to our predictions.”

Taha supervisor: “When I put him on board, what made me make this decision was the spark in him to do something and to do things on his own that was just the selling point and I really got him on board and I don’t regretted you know even for one day.”

The results of this case study show that the HR courses were in alignment with the industry and the students did not face any problem in applying in the industry the knowledge learnt in the classroom. Nevertheless, it must be kept in mind, that the HR interns worked in big organizations and no in smaller ones. The results may have been different in smaller organizations.

4.3.8.2 Finance Interns

The finance interns were of the view that what they experienced at their internship was quite different from what they had studied in their institution. Because they had not been in touch with industry, they had no idea how the concepts learnt were actually applied
in the real world setting. Waqar does acknowledge that he knew the basics of and concepts behind the actual processes that were taking place in the company and was able to understand what was going on in the company. But according to him, there was a gap between theory and practical work. For Waqar, the scenario was very different, according to him, in industry; there is a whole new world,

“Withholding ki duniya alag hai, aap ko refund mil raha hai government aap ko pese de rahi hai... bara khel khelna Hota Hai logo k saath government bhi notices de rahi hoti hai k matlab aap matlab woh kehtay hain na apnay pese bachanay k liye tou in Ko Kis taraf handle karna hai. Audit Kis taraf karna hai us ka tou woh Sab bhi seekha Maine,” (the world of withholding is totally different, you are getting a refund, the government is giving you money....you have to play a big game with people, government is also giving notices, means as they say, to save your money how to handle them. And how to do audit, I learnt all that).

Waqar’s supervisor validated Waqar by saying, “let me just tell you that there is a difference whatever we study in the institute, ...... practically it is very different,” he continued to say that, “ taxation sales return is a huge broad thing, woh cheez hai hum nahi parte,” (we don’t study those things). He explained his point of view by saying that only book content is taught at the universities and the students do not have any practical experience; so when that student goes into the market, he knows quite a bit but cannot do anything, he gave an example,

“If I ask him to login a site and to enter an entry of taxation or sales he will not be able to do because he doesn’t know. When you have done your BBA you should know the practical things the student should get at least 25000 per month even on an internship but he doesn’t get that amount because he is unable to do practical thing.”

He continued to say that he does not know how to file returns, how to open returns, how to look at returns and then the students end up starting from a very low level. He gave an example of Chartered Accountancy (CA) where students during their studies are involved in article ship where they are in constant contact with the industry.

Similar views were given by Shoaib, who said, “As far as financial analysis and analytical problem solving is concerned, I’ve only solved only bookish structured problems
He also added that the Sharia finance was a new concept for him and he had to learn these concepts from his supervisor. The same was endorsed by his supervisor, who said, “Islamic finance was something new to him and I think this is what is lacking in the university ..... the real growth is coming in Islamic Finance in terms of finance, all the bands all the brokerage houses all the finance investment companies are going towards Islamic Finance so all the universities should make Islamic finance a compulsory course. Even if you are not working in a financial institution but it is compulsory that you understand Islamic finance now.”

He also said that he did not expect Shoaib to know everything as the bookish knowledge is very different from the real life experiences and he explained the limitations of university education by saying, “Universities in Pakistan are teaching the same books that were taught 30 years ago. The teachers are not innovative they are not doing any new research.” Nevertheless, he said that, “he (Shoaib) did know a lot of things and he was above my expectations.”

Shoaib also said that during his four year stay at the academic institute, whenever they were asked to make a report, they never visited industry for it; they just took the available public data and made a report out of it. This created a gap in their learning. Similar view were heard from Beena, who said, “Students should be taught the basic difference between general and chain banking, the whole procedure of clearance of cheques, it was so new to me. Students should be taught in more practical manner.” She said that there was a missing link in form of practical knowledge, “I think we need more practical learning because the banking sector is very different from what we learn in the books.”

The finance interns knew the basic knowledge, but the specialized knowledge was missing. For them, the industry was a new domain and they felt it to be difficult and problematic to connect their academic knowledge with industry.

4.3.8.3 Marketing Interns

With marketing interns, the problem was not that they lacked knowledge or practical experience; rather, it had more to do with adaptability. Since the marketing interns went to various organizations, dealing in various products with very different setups, therefore they needed to be more versatile and adopters and adapters. According them,
their courses were being applied in the practical setting, but not as a whole, rather they had to extract the learnt knowledge according to their requirement. As Maria said, “*Word to word theories tou kahin bhi apply nahi hotien theek hai (are not anywhere applied, right)? Jitni detail main hum parhtay hain utni detail main kuch bhi apply ni hota,*” (*the amount of detail that we study, that detail is not applied anywhere*). She continued to say that the courses studies were applied in a very round about manner. Asim added to her statement and said, “*By default laga rahe hain kyun k woh kuch basic si cheezain hain woh lag rahai hain,*” (*the theories are being applied by default, there are a few basic things that are being applied*). Anum continued to explain, “*Theories apply nahi hotien but wohi baat hai k jo theories aap ne parhi hain na us hi main se aap ko woh concepts nikahnay hotay hain when you're working, tou it's up to you k aap kis tarah se in theories ko analyse kartay hain,*” (*the theories don’t apply as they are but in fact you have to take out the concepts from those theories when you are working, then it’s up to you how you are analyzing theories*).

They also gave reasons as to why most theories and processes were not being applied. The biggest reason that they gave was that usually the businesses in Pakistan are family businesses or also known in Pakistan as seth businesses which are highly autocratic in nature. Thus Asim explained that because the whole company culture where he was interning was a seth culture, therefore, it was not based on a theory or a concept, “*When you’re actually working and actually talking to people then it’s completely different. There are so many things that are not linking the way they should link.*”

Aqib was aptly able to explain the seth culture as, “*Seth k nazro se har cheez guzray gi. Ab ek theory jo k waqai main sahi hai lekin seth ki nazar main woh sahi nahi hai na! Bekaar!*” (*Everything has to go through the seth (the owner), if there is a theory which is very apt but is considered worthless by the seth, then its worthless! Worthless!*). Further to this, he explained that in his company, which was a family run business, the employers were scared to speak and just followed what they were told. It was further discussed, that if the seth was unhappy with anyone, he would simply call that person and take the car keys from him and ask him to leave the job. Thus, Aqib stressed that no HR policies were followed. The same thing was mentioned by Asim, that in the seth company where he was working, there was no departments as such. The seth was the head and he was looking after everything and he made whatever policies he wanted to make.
The benefit of this culture for the interns was that they were working directly under the company head (the seth himself) and as such were taking full benefit of his experiences. All five of the interns had their worked checked by the company CEO and they were kept on watch by the CEO himself. Even though Anum was in a multinational organization, but since her organization was a small one, the CEO was well aware of how and what was being done.

They were of the view that when they go in the practical life, it comes as a surprise that how different the working of the companies is and that this gap should be reduced by giving students more practical work during their four year stay at the institute. When asked about the industry visits that they are asked to do in various courses and write a report on the same, they said that usually students submit a fake report as there is no way for teachers to verify the authenticity of the submitted report. So Maria suggested that, “Tou woh khud un ko topics assign karain, woh khud un ko companies k links dain k mere reference k through aap yahan pr jayen k un ko proper information milay woh us ko utilise kar sakain,” (the faculty should give them topics, should give them company links, that go here through my reference, so that the faculty should have proper information, so the students can properly utilize it). Almas added to this suggestion by saying that the teachers do not provide any reference point for the student and leave it upon the students to go to any company and bring the information that they require. The students, according to Almas, then bring a visiting card to the teachers saying that we have met this person in the organization and submit a fictitious report.

The on-job supervisors of all the marketing interns were happy with their work as Almas’ supervisor said, “So our idea was to take up somebody who has a marketing background which obviously she has studied …. and then secondly, she can write well so wo hamare (our) both criteria were fulfilled in Almas…… actually she has done very well.”

Anum’s supervisor was of the view that, “Agar aap hundred strategies par rahe hain tu kisi industry mein 10 lag rahi hai kisi may 20 (if you have studied a hundred strategies, so some industry will be using 10, some 20) and they are all entirely different.” She elaborated that through the internship; Anum now has learnt to apply those theories and strategies where they are required. On the other hand, Maria’s supervisor elaborated the needs of his company by saying that they require confident individuals who can present in front of CEO’s and directors. He said that Maria was, “Good, she’s confident, confidence
Regarding the industry its worth having.....Apart from that, she is competent.” Similarly, Asim’s supervisor seemed to be satisfied by his performance and said, “But on the whole his performance was good. His performance was better than what I had expected. I gave him a chance to explore new things from his stay here.”

Four out of five marketing interns got internships at Seth organizations. The difference between Phase I and Phase II interns was that Phase I interns were unable to relate their on-job assignments with classroom knowledge; whereas, in Phase II the establishment of this relationship was clear due to reflections.

4.3.8.4 Improvement in the Internships

Even though the interns and their on-job supervisors were of the view that the interns got maximum out of their internships; nevertheless, it was a common belief that not all interns were as lucky. Almas and Anum shared their previous experiences of internships,

Almas: “I get to know k mujhe dukaano pr phirna hai doodh cream wali (that I have to go to shops of milk and cream) ...... Aur woh bhi communicate kab kiya do haftay baad (and that too they communicated after two weeks) I was so disappointed seriously.”

Anum: “This is huge bundle of files in which I had to sort out and file..... during this sorting main hamain chipkali bhi bhi mili wahan pr hamain cockroach bhi (we found a lizard and we found cockroaches).”

Asim shared his observation, “Mere itnay saaray dost hain apni companies main ya phir doston k saath kar k woh report bani banayi copy paste kar detay hain (I have so many friends in companies, they just copy paste the already made report)”

On the other hand, some of the unwanted internship experiences were shared by the supervisors, where Almas’ on-job supervisor shared her experience and said that, “I just entered data in six weeks of my internship....I learnt nothing.” Maria’s supervisor explained that where he interned, there were no timings and he would leave late at night; similarly Taniya’s supervisor recalled her internship and told that her experience at her internship was not a good one.

These experiences tell us that not all internships are fruitful and that there is always room for improvements, and also there is no way for the institutions to know whether or not the reports submitted are original or fictitious or copied. Both the interns and their on-
job supervisors were asked how the internships could be bettered. Most of the interns endorsed reflection writing practices as Shoaib said, “I think reflection is one of the good initiative because usse aapko Idea hota hai aap nai kya kiya hai, aap uski wajah se initiative lete hain (you get an idea of what you have done and then you take initiative). I think that is a good idea.”

It was also noted that a continuous link between the educational institute and the internship organization was proposed by the interns and on-job supervisors such that the both groups were of the idea that the interning organizations should give their goals or plans to the institute before asking for the intern. Thus Almas after quoting her bad experience with the multi-national said,

“Before sending the interns to any organization any industry there should be a set of objectives like already planned design should be there ……Koi marketing ka hai koi finance ka hai (some are from marketing, some are from finance) so already the task should be assigned designed ….and you know coordination honi chahye aap ki university walo ki aur supervisor ki” (should be there between the university and the supervisor).

Taha’s on-job supervisor suggested that since most organizations take interns for photocopying and for carrying around papers so if you need interns to work for them in the real sense then they must be told beforehand because they might not be conducting internships as per the demand of the institute. She added that it was better to explain the institutes’ objectives to the interning organization before getting the interns placed and the institute should take various organizations on board to send their interns for a purposeful internship. Almas’ supervisor also verified the claims made by Taha’s supervisor and said that,

“Hamare Pakistan mein jali kaam bhi bohot hota hai, tou probably kisi intern ke saath ye ho raha ho k wo baith k staple kar raha ho papers and aap usko usi basis pay kay kaam kiya hai aur company ka naam hai aur aap usko aik degree allot kar doa,” (In our Pakistan, there is a lot of fraud, so probably an intern may be just stapling the papers and you might think that he/she has really worked in the company and the company might even have a good name).
She proposed that a continuous co-ordination and feedback from the company is a must, she added, “I believe there should be a check on the internships also, which is missing generally in the internships.”

Another problem that was highlighted in the internships was their timings. The interns and their on-job supervisors mostly were of the opinion that the internships should be placed before the last semester. The reasons given were mainly that (a) it will help students choose their majors and (b) it will help students relate what they study in the class with the real world. Thus Waqar’s on-job supervisor who called this a major flaw in the system explained it in the following words,

“I think the main flaw in your system is that you need to first identify what the students really want to be it is not only accounts, it is what you want to do, you need to first find out who has interest in which field.”

He further explained that this could be achieved by asking students to be a part of a 15 day internship during his/her studies in a particular major and then in another 15 day internship in another major. He explained that the 15 days internship should be an ongoing feature during students’ bachelor program and the last and final internship should be of three months which the student should get in after experiencing all the major fields. Similar suggestion was given by Maria’s on-job supervisor who said that he had seen many students change their majors after doing their BBA and he felt that this was because they had very little knowledge about the practical implications of that particular subject. He elaborated that every year the students should be asked to do a small period of internship in a particular major so that, “Wo HR ka bhi kaam kar lengay, finance mein bhi kar lengay wo marketing mein bhi kar lengay; tou they will get exposure, aur unka interest develop ho jayega aur inko pata chal jayega k kaisay kaaam hota hai,” (they will have worked in HR, in finance, in marketing so they will get exposure and their interest will be developed and they will know how work is done).

Beena believed that internships during the four year education period will help students immensely, “If the students do their internship during education it will help them to understand things more accurately….. Basically, internships, they remove a lot of misconceptions.”

Shoaib also was of the view that internships during study period would have helped him, he wanted the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department of his
institute to help students get the required internships as he shared his opinion that he wanted to get an internship in the third year of his bachelor but he could not because he had no connections in the industry.

The conclusion drawn from the above results may be that in terms of the three majors in which the sample group was divided, it seemed that the HR theories and principals in the internship setting were compatible with the theories and principles that the interns had studied in the four year of their undergrad studies. Nevertheless, it must be kept in mind that even when these interns were a part of Pakistani organizations, these organizations were considered big organizations according to the Pakistani standards. Hence, these organizations were following most norms of HR. On the other hand, the finance interns and their on-job supervisors felt that even though the interns had the basic working knowledge and concepts of finance, yet, they lacked real world experience and this experience must be provided by their alma mater. The marketing interns found it challenging to be a part of an organization which they had not studied about and had no previous knowledge about but they were able to link their learned knowledge with their working knowledge.

There was a demand to make the courses taught at the institutes more aligned with the industry needs.

4.3.9 The Second Main Question

The second main was, “To what extent are the internships adding to Pakistan’s human capital development?” The answer to this question was sought by examining how well the understanding of the internship department is regarding the planning and conducting of internships; whether or not these internships providing human capital to the industry in form of trained personnel in the field of business and how much are the courses aligned with the needs of the industry. In short, the three sub questions lead us to the second main question.

It can be very well said that the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department was very well aware of the needs of the internship program, yet he was bound by his limitations. He knew what the weaknesses that existed in the program were but the only way to overcome those weaknesses would mean to re-vamp the whole program and make policy adjustments that would need some major decision making from
the management. The current responsibilities of internship department were being catered to and though there was room for improvement, yet, these were very well being managed according to their scope as most of the interns were able to get job offers from the companies where they had interned. It must be kept in mind that all of these job offers except one was made by the companies that came through the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department.

The course alignment needs to be improved and the needs of the industry need to be focused upon. It was repeatedly brought to notice by the interns, their on-job supervisors as well as the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department that the courses need to be more experiential in nature. It was explained by the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department that the current faculty of the institute was not trained enough to teach the courses in a more interactive manner where there is a continuous interaction of the students with the industry. Various opinions were given by the interns and the on-job supervisors to reduce this gap whereas the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department was of the view that to change the teaching methodology at the institute and to make it more practical is a policy matter that needs major decisions to be made by the management. The institute is currently catering to the needs of the industry but there still seems to be a gap between industry demands and classroom knowledge given to business students.

It can be deduced that the internships even in their current state are adding to the human capital of the country even though there is ample of room for improvement. The pay scale of the fresh graduates can be raised substantially if improvements in the undergrad programs at the institution could be made, making them more compatible with the needs of the industry

4.3.10 Summary

In this section the results of the study were presented, such that all research questions were answered. The sub questions of each main question were answered first and then the main questions were responded to. It can be safely said that according to the results achieved the internships in Pakistan can be conducted according to the experiential learning model and can generate more efficient human capital than they are currently generating. There are many areas with reference to the internship program that needs improvement.
The results of the research helped to highlight all such areas. Improvement in internship will lead to closing the gap between theory and practice which will be responsible for generating human capital for the industry.
5. CHAPTER FIVE: Discussion

5.1 Introduction

Through this study, the internship pedagogy as a form of experiential learning was in depth looked into. Goal setting and reflective writing were added to comprehend what effects they had on the quality of internships and whether or not it contributed towards a successful internship project as much as it was claimed by various researchers. Research in this field in Pakistan needs to be conducted in order to assess how the internship programs can be made more productive for interns. Thus, this research looked into two main research questions and four sub research questions for the first main question and three sub questions for the second main question as given below:

1. How can Kolb’s experiential learning model be applied in an internship setting in Pakistan?
   
   i. How is goal setting useful in an internship setting in order to fully understand a concrete experience?
   
   ii. How can reflections be used as a tool for continuous assessment in an internship setting?
   
   iii. How does constant intern supervision in the internship program setting impact the overall program effectiveness?
   
   iv. What internship program structure does the employer use for intern placement?

2. To what extent are the internships adding to Pakistan’s human capital development?
   
   i. What is the understanding of the institution’s internship department regarding the success of an internship program?
   
   ii. What roles do internships play in gaining employment for the interns and potential employees for companies?
   
   iii. To what extent are the needs of the industry aligned with the courses delivered at the institution?

   In this section, the results of the study were compared and contrasted with researches conducted in other parts of the world. The format of this section is in alignment with the format of the previous section, such that in this section, the results of each sub question will be discussed first and then the results of the main question will be discussed.
5.2 Sub Question One: First Main Question

The first sub question of the first main question was “How is goal setting useful in an internship setting in order to fully understand a concrete experience?”

It was evident from the results that the goal setting helped interns get a more concrete sense of their experience. They were more assured of their learning and were able to report where they were lacking and to what extent were they successful. There was a difference between how interns in Phase I who did not formulate any goals prior to their internship reported their learning verses how interns in Phase II, who had formulated their goals, reported their learning. The interns in Phase II were more confident and assured about their learning as compared to interns in Phase I. This was because as Ross (2016) explains that an idea becomes concrete when it is fully understood and an idea can be abstract in one person’s mind due to the lack of understanding it; whereas, the same idea can be concrete in another person’s mind due to their comprehensive understanding of that particular idea. Similar was the case in this study, how well was the internship experience understood by interns varied considerably in interns in Phase I to interns in Phase II.

In Phase I, it was observed that the interns gave statements where it was evident that their internship experience was very different from their expectations. Thus the internship experiences were abstract in their minds and even though there are many reasons as to why the interns’ abstract conceptualization about the internship could not take shape of concrete experience, but one very obvious reason was that there was that they had unclear goals set for themselves. It is important that goals in an internship setting are individualized and also aligned with the internship responsibilities (Bandow, 2015; Boyatzis, 2002). For example, if an intern is told that he/she will help the company in launching its new product, it does not mean that the intern will be making TV ads for the company as deduced by an intern in Phase I. This misalignment of interns’ goals with their internship was one of the most important reasons why interns in Phase I of the internship could not explain their learning and also was a cause of frustration for them.

To remove this misalignment of the interns’ goals with the internship tasks, the interns in Phase II of the internship were asked to formulate their goals with the help of their on-job supervisors so that the on-job supervisors could let interns know beforehand which goals were attainable and which were beyond the scope of their internships. It is important to understand that each person has different goals to achieve and that most
teaching pedagogies fail because individual needs are not kept in mind, but experiential learning allows learners to learn according to their own goals and pace (Manola, 1997). Bandow (2015) explains that even when interns have clear goals in their minds regarding what they want to achieve through their internships, their interning organizations may have some other goals intended for the interns. It is therefore vital to match interns’ goals with those of their interning organization. It becomes crucial that interns’ goals must be addressed by the on-job supervisors prior to beginning the internship as misalignment in the goals causes frustration in the interns (Bandow, 2015) which was very much evident in the interns of Phase I. Another reason why on-job supervisors must also help interns formulate their goals is that because the students may be aware of the product goals which focus on the outcome of a task but may very well be unaware of the process goals, the strategies that need to be planned to reach the desired outcome (Garrels, 2017). The on-job supervisors help interns chalk down the process that would help them reach their desired goals or outcomes.

Tobin, Brown and Carney (2013) explain that in order to move in the right direction and towards one’s goals, it is important that the interns should write their goals down instead of just having an idea about their goals. Since the interns in Phase I did not have any written down goals for themselves that would help them form an abstract idea in the right direction, therefore, they could not understand their experiences effectively. Once the goals are written, they can be re-shaped, re-defined and re-visited to make their alignment with the internship tasks. But in Phase I, the internship goals were not written and the interns had a vague idea of what they wanted to achieve through their internships; this created a total mismatch and misalignment of their goals with the internship tasks. Hence it is important to formulate and have written such goals that are attainable and the attainability of goals can only be reviewed if they are written down and pondered upon (Tobin, Brown, and Carney, 2013). In Phase II of the research when interns had their goals written, it was easier for them to have an abstract conceptualization in the direction of these goals and then work to attain them, in such a way that their abstract conceptualization becomes concrete experience through reflection and experimentation.

Frustration and dissatisfaction grows if one is unable to reach the desired goal whereas when one achieves the desired goal there is a sense of reward, satisfaction and fulfillment, (Locke & Latham, 2002) as was seen in the interns of Phase II of this study.
Because they were able to reach their goals, therefore there was a sense of satisfaction in them and their on-job supervisors also seemed to be satisfied with the performance of the interns. Locke and Latham (2002) explain that goal setting prior to an activity enhances performance through four mechanisms. First, the goals help to direct activities towards the goals; second, goals energize activities as higher the goals, greater the efforts; third, goals make one persistent and lastly, to achieve goals already achieved knowledge must be used. They further explain that more committed the people are to their goals, more enhanced is their performance, which could be seen in the Phase II interns.

When setting their goals, it was evident that most interns wanted to use their classroom knowledge in the field or in real life setting. Hoyle and Goffnett (2013) are also of the view that an internship program can only be called effective, if it gives interns the opportunities to relate classroom knowledge with their work in industry; whereas, (KatulaandThrenhauser, 1999) says that this usage of classroom knowledge in industry is the concrete experience that interns are looking for at their internships. The concepts given to the students through books are abstract and it is only through the internship experience that these ideas became more concrete in nature. Internships is one of the best ways to fulfil this goal of making connection between classroom and real life and in fact it is important that participants that become a part of an experiential learning activity must have sufficient working knowledge that will help them through the program and achieve their desired goal (Experiential education: Internships and Work-Based Learning - A Handbook for Practitioners & Administrators, 2017).

Goal formation had given interns in Phase II a sense of direction and once they had these goals written down, they often re-visited them to see how much improvement had they made towards their goals. Goal setting has been a fruitful technique for gaining concrete learning at all levels including in business graduates and not only academic but also personal goals can be achieved through experiential learning (Boyatzis, 2002). It was clear that from research conducted by Boyatzis (2002) that when MBA students set behavior goals for themselves, they were able to work towards these goals and were able to learn the desired behaviors in an experiential learning setting. Most of the interns in Phase II wanted to improve their confidence and interpersonal skills; therefore, they deliberately found situations where they could interact with people in order to improve these traits in them. Their results were no different from Boyatzis’, according to whom:
“The person practices the new behaviors in actual settings within which they wish to use them, such as at work or at home. During this part of the process, self-directed change and learning begins to look like a "continuous improvement" process. To develop or learn new behavior, the person must find ways to learn more from current, or on-going experiences” (p.21).

The interns in the internship setting were using the opportunity to reform their behaviors, but not all interns seemed to be satisfied with the outcomes. There were interns who felt that they could not build their confidence and interpersonal skills as much as they wanted, mainly because their nature of work did not call for much interaction with those around them or their interning organization was small and there were not many people around to interact with. Behavior changing goals are long term goals and cannot be achieved in the limited time period of six weeks; this fact was recognized by the interns themselves as well.

All the interns in Phase II of the internship seemed to enjoy their internships as compared to interns in Phase I. The reason lay in the goal formation and goal achievement as this goal achievement is responsible of changing that attitude of students positively, such that, they complained less, started their tasks with zeal and seemed to enjoy their work as compared to students who did not set their goals prior to an activity (Lawlor & Hornyak, 2012).

Thus experiential learning is highly effective at workplace as it leads to concrete learning (Manola, 1997) it is cyclic in nature where ideas move from abstract to concrete. As explained earlier in the literature review that even when Kolb’s experiential learning cycle begins with concrete experience and moves on to reflective observation, then to abstract conceptualization and lastly to active experimentation; nevertheless, this cycle can begin from another point (Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, & Sharma, 2014). As in this case study, the experiential learning cycle began with the abstract conceptualization in form of classroom knowledge and then moved on to active experimentation, which was using that abstract conceptualization (classroom knowledge) at the internship setting, then deducing concrete experience from the experience learnt and lastly reflecting on the concrete experience. Goal setting to achieve concrete experience will be impossible to attain without proper goal formation. Goal formation is the beginning of learning in an experiential setting that gives direction and meaning to the experience. As seen in Phase I of the research that
even when the interns were a part of the internship for six weeks, they could not give meaning to their learning. They knew that learning happened but what exactly was this learning, this was difficult for them to understand and then explain.

5.3 Sub Question Two: First Main Question

The second sub question of the first main question was, “How can reflections be used as a tool for continuous assessment in an internship setting?”

An important and fundamental part of an internship is reflection writing as it is through reflections that simple experiences can be changed into learning experiences. It was apparent from the results that the current assessment system of report writing and intern evaluation form were not enough to grade interns justifiably. In fact, it was revealed that absence of a faculty supervisor led interns to copy reports from one another and present the same to the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department which were then graded by the faculty members who were unaware of the internship activities of the intern during the internship. Also, it was interesting to note, that none of the on-job supervisors gave a below average grade to any of the interns. This led most of the interns, regardless of their performance at the internships to avail a B grade and the only intern that received an A grade was the one who had gone through an unstructured internship and did not have a supervisor to guide him for more than two weeks. On the other hand, the one interns who got a C grade was not only offered a job at the bank where he interned but also was able to work on the project which he was given using his maximum potential.

Grading is one of the major problems that comes with internships because of the uniqueness that each internship carries with it and also because faculty supervisors are not with interns to observe their progress (Calvoa & D’Amato, 2015; Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). This is the reason that there are internship programs that do not give a letter grade to their interns but only give a pass or a fail (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). Even though such a strategy is easier to implement, the downside of this grading strategy is that it negatively affects the effort of interns that they put in their internships and in making of their final report (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). On the other hand, the downside of a letter grade may be that all interns may not be getting the same level of internships whereof some would be involved in difficult tasks whereas others would be a part of much easier job (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). There is also a great
danger that institutes might indulge in grade inflation as in case of Loyola college interns where a pattern of grade inflation in internships was seen and the students were usually getting an A grade in their internships (Ciofalo, 1988). The universities can do away with this shortcoming by giving more weightage to assignments (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008) such as reflection writing that are continuous rather than the supervisor evaluation and by making sure that the faculty supervisor is constantly in touch with the interns throughout their internship.

One reason why business schools face a problem in grading internships is that the number of students has immensely grown but also it seems that some business schools have ventured into internships without fully understanding experiential learning (Ciofalo, 1988). Beck and French (2016) revealed that the process of internship that the College of Business, University of Colorado ran a decade of successful internship program following the five requirements: (a) the interns had to meet periodically with the faculty supervisor, (b) the interns had to maintain their reflective journal, (c) they had to twice a week submit their reflections to their faculty supervisors, (d) they needed to submit a final report at the end of the internship and (e) they were to submit an evaluation of the program. They stress that the key to grading at this internship program are the reflections written by the interns where they share their thoughts, expectations, assumptions, observations and reactions. In Pakistan, most of the business institutes are fulfilling only 50% of the requirements of a good internship program. They are neither appointing faculty supervisors nor are they using reflections as an assessment tool even though when there is ample of evidence of effectiveness of reflective writing in an experiential learning and is a part of experiential cycle.

It is clear from the results of this study that the current methods of internship assessment are not reliable and need to be more effective. Assessments are conducted to identify, gather and interpret information about student learning and should be a continuous process (Galindo, n.d.). The latest perspective on assessment is not about judging students’ performance, but rather, to evaluate how well student has understood the concepts taught to him/her; thus, good assessment is process based, open-ended (it welcomes creativity), contextualized, promotes autonomy and involves personalized feedback (Galindo, n.d.). There are many techniques such as blogs, vlogs, e-portfolios, and written reflections that fulfill the criterions lay above of good assessments (Galindo, n.d.). Keeping into mind, the
constituents of good assessment given by Galindo, it can be safely suggested that reflections fulfills all the given criteria. Reflections are not only process based where the student reflects upon how he/she was able to learn something, but they are also open-ended and contextualized. Reflections help learners to become autonomous as the learners are able to see through their mistakes and make rectifications and in the process become lifelong learners. Such an assessment technique also requires individualized feedback as every person’s experiences and thoughts are different. It is important that the faculty supervisor stays in touch with the interns when they are at their internships so that the faculty supervisor is well aware of the intern’s progress (Ali & Smith, 2015). It is suggested that the best way to solidify student learning and to continuously keep in touch with the interns is through reflection writing (Ali & Smith, 2015). Reflective writing triggers transformative learning (Allan & Driscoll, 2014; Mezirow, 1990 as cited in Ali & Smith, 2015) and gives interns a chance for self-assessment.

The usual way through exams and projects is not applicable to internships as internships are an activity out of university (Calvoa & D'Amato, 2015). Learning from experience arises in two ways: first through developing technical skills and second learning through practice (Calvoa & D'Amato, 2015). Through reflections the gap between thought and action is filled and students become aware of their learning, they evaluate their challenges and recognize their successes which otherwise they would lack to understand; therefore, benefits of reflections are three folds: (a) it helps to enhance assessment, (b) it promotes student learning and (c) helps teachers to improve their teaching (Allan & Driscoll, 2014). During their study of a writing program, Allan and Driscoll (2014) revealed that faculty development to teach reflective writing was required when reflections as a form of assessment were integrated in the curriculum. They elaborated that it was necessary that the students are taught to reflect upon as the results may not be very fruitful if they are not taught to reflect in the right direction. Reflective writing is valuable and develops metacognitive awareness of the students when reflections are focused and detailed. They further stress that simply asking students to reflect is not enough for reflections to really be profitable because there are aspects of the learning processes which cannot be answered without gaining insight into students’ thinking. Reflections need to be practiced to gain maximum amount of benefit from them (Sen, 2010). Reflective writing has many positive outcomes such as self-development, enhanced academic learning,
capability to critically self-review, awareness of one’s own mental functions and understanding one’s own decision making but in order to take full advantage of reflective practices, they need to be learnt, practiced and harnessed (Sen, 2010). The results of the present research are also in agreement with Allan and Driscoll and Sen. Since this was the first time ever that students were being engaged in reflective writing, therefore, it seemed that they were confused as to what actually is required of them. Even though each student was given 2-3 hours’ time prior to the start of their internship where they were taught goal formation and reflective writing write reflections, but it seems that it was not enough. There were students like Taniya and Beena who only wrote series of events that had taken place at their internship and were unable to go beyond that. The interns were unable to open up in their reflective writing and it was felt that they were not sure which events to emphasize upon and which were not of much importance.

The problem of low quality reflections can be solved by first, by introducing reflective writing to students early in their studies so that the students get used to of reflective writing and are positively motivated towards it, as research revealed that students who were introduced to this practice earlier were more comfortable with it than the ones that were introduced to it later (McCarthy, 2011). Second, it is also important to talk to students and explain them the importance and the potential benefits of reflective writing as a valuable strategy to make students lifelong learners so that they are convinced of its long-term significance (Allan & Driscoll, 2014; McCarthy, 2011). If students do not value the importance of this strategy then they see it as a complete waste of their time and take them as a burden rather than something that would build their career and life (McCarthy, 2011). Same was the case with Waqar and Taniya who said that they had no idea why they had to write reflections and what their importance was. Even though the importance of reflection was explained to them before the commencement of their internship, but they could not find any use of this activity. Third, Allan and Driscoll (2014) also point out that more in-depth reflections are gained if the reflections are graded upon and are used for assessment purposes. This may be one reason that the interns did not produce high quality reflections. They knew that they were not being graded upon this work and it was only an experimental phase, so they unconsciously did not put in more effort into reflection writing activity. Lastly, it is important that reflective writing should be embedded throughout the higher education programs so that the future needs of building reflective practitioners who are
lifelong learners can be achieved; (Allan & Driscoll, 2014; McCarthy, 2011) making reflective writing strategies part of teacher’s handbook (Allan & Driscoll, 2014).

Even though Allan and Driscoll (2014) and Sen (2010) are of the view that if the reflections are not of high quality then they are not of much use. The results of this research differ from their results as in this research; it was revealed that even when the reflection writing was new to the interns and even when not produce high quality reflections could, still, this exercise was helpful for them in multiple ways. First, there were interns who used these reflections to write down their end of the project report; second, the reflective helped them understand how much of their goal had been achieved and third, it energized their internship as they were always looking to do something different so that they could write the same in their reflections and fourth they became conscious of their learning and were able to articulate exactly what they had learnt at their internships. Even though their reflective learning was not a comprehensive one as was expected from the DEAL model (Ash & Clayton, 2009) it nevertheless did help them to articulate their learning. It takes time to harness a reflective writing skill which was next to impossible in six week time. The DEAL model helped them to understand what reflective writing was and how was it composed even when it stands true that the academic reflection writing is very different from daily dairy writing which is merely a series of activities may not have such components as testing a hypothesis, analyzing the consequences of a decision or of an action taken and weighing the results against previous experiences, (Experiential education: Internships and Work-Based Learning - A Handbook for Practitioners & Administrators, 2017) but in even in their crudest form they help students in multiple ways.

Although this research primarily focused upon the importance of reflective writing in an internship experience, it does not in any way mean that the current modes of assessment that is end of the project report and intern evaluation form are of no use. In fact, it is advised that the best way of assessing students is by using various assessment techniques (Teachng matters, n.d). The only way to find the effectiveness of an internship experience is through using multiple methods. Therefore, it is advised that the institute along with reports and intern evaluation forms must also use reflections to assess interns. It must also make sure that there is a faculty supervisor assigned to all interns so that they can be monitored and helped throughout the internship.
5.4 Sub Question Three: First Main Question

The third sub question of the first main question was, “How does constant intern supervision in the internship program setting impact the overall program effectiveness?”

The results of this research show that all except one intern were supervised at their interning organization. It was revealed that democratic supervision was the mostly used where four interns, three from marketing and one from HR was a part of this type of supervision. In this type of supervision more autonomy was given to the interns and they were welcomed to express their opinions and new ideas to the supervisors. The on-job supervisors were open to any new input from them, in fact, the on-job supervisors in their interviews said that they wanted the interns to bring in some fresh ideas to the industry. Such attitude from the on-job supervisors led to a positive attitude in the interns because,

“A democratic style of leadership and a supportive supervisor may help boost an employee’s positive image by giving feedback and making the work more interesting to perform when the subordinates are involve in the decision making process by creating an atmosphere where the employees can be heard” (Benjamin, 2015, p. 119).

Such an atmosphere helps students to relate all their knowledge learnt at the university in the internship setting in order to get the desired results. These interns were found to be not only satisfied but also motivated during their internship and even when they showed signs of being challenged or overworked, they never once showed any sign of being depressed or thinking of quitting, because those under democratic supervision are more motivated and show lower intentions to quit leading to lower turnover rate (Adebayo & Ogunsina, 2011). All interns in the democratic internships enjoyed the freedom they received from their supervisor and tried to put in maximum effort in their work.

Another type of supervision which was seen at the internships was direct supervision where the interns were directly working under and continuously being guided by their on-job supervisors. This type of supervision was seen with two finance interns who were working on financial data and with one marketing intern who was learning to work in an IT company and on particular software. It can be said that such internship positions that are more technical or skill oriented in nature require direct supervision. Direct on-job supervision has been identified by the interns as one of the most important component of a successful internship (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009). It is important that the students are
able to gain hands-on experience especially when it comes to technical and skill training (Collins, 2002; Mosley, 2013). Direct supervision helps interns receive continuous feedback and direct interns in their tasks at hand (Mosley, 2013). Same was the case with the three interns Shoaib and Waqar, the finance interns and Anum the marketing intern, where they were receiving continuous feedback on the work that they were doing. This continuous feedback helped interns to learn new skills that they were not taught at their institute by the end of the internship, they were using the newly learnt skills independently.

Even though the research of Mitchell, Smyser and Weed (1975) suggest that external employees such as interns were more satisfied with direct supervision rather than internal permanent employees who were happier with democratic supervision. Our results showed that this was not the case; the interns in both the cases were satisfied with their supervision. It can be said that the type of supervision depends upon the type of work that the interns were doing. In this research, the three interns that were a part of the democratic supervision were from marketing department with sole object of selling the company’s product; whereas, Taniya was interning at a TV channel that needed more innovative and creative ideas. On the other hand, all three interns involved in direct supervision were given more skill oriented and technical work which could not have done without direct supervision. Even though there are researches that favor direct supervision over any other type of supervision (Alpert, Heaney & Kuhn, 2009; Collins, 2002; Keller, 2012; Mitchell, Smyser, & Weed, 1975; Yoo & Morris, 2015) yet, it would not be wrong to suggest that any type of supervision may be fruitful as long as it is in accordance with the internship responsibilities given to the interns. The same case could be applied to bureaucratic supervision. The interns involved in bureaucratic supervision seemed to be as satisfied with their supervision as those involved in democratic and direct supervision.

All three interns who were a part of bureaucratic supervision were interning in banks. This type of supervision is visible in bureaucratic structures where the organizations are tall and best practices are followed to encourage smooth flow of work (Ingram, n.d.). Such organizations are efficient and procedure oriented where the focus is on completing the work which is usually routine work and not much creative input is needed in these organizations as all systems are already in place (Ingram, n.d.). It was noted that bureaucratic on-job supervisors focused on interns to learn the system of the interning organization. Their focus was upon how well the interns were able to gel themselves
according to the culture of the organization, whereas the focus of on-job supervisors who were using direct supervision was on how well the interns able to grasp the new skill and the democratic on-job supervisors were focused upon how much the interns bringing new ideas to the table.

Even though autocratic supervision is considered to be the worst type of supervision where there is more turn over and less employee satisfaction (Adebayo & Ogunsina, 2011); yet in this case, it was seen that the one HR intern who had an autocratic on-job supervisor seemed satisfied with her internship experience. Even though she did not want to ever be a part of that organization as a full time employee, and she did write in her reflections that there was a high turnover rate in her interninng organization; nevertheless, she seemed satisfied with her six week internship period mainly because she felt that she was able to achieve her internship goals during this period and also because her co-workers were very helpful and accommodating and such accommodating gestures are welcomed and appreciated by the interns (Keller, 2012).

It was interesting to note that the interns received direct and democratic supervisions in smaller setups. Democratic supervision is suitable for smaller businesses as the management in such businesses focuses on fast returns and is flexible and have lose structures where relationship between management and the subordinates is informal (Degravel, 2011). Direct supervision in small businesses is possible as there is a close link and communication between the supervisor and the intern (Degravel, 2011). The bigger organizations have rigid structures in place and want people to immerse in the environment and the only impact that people make is to complete the given work efficiently, within the given time.

It was surprising to note that Aqib who did not get much supervision was satisfied with his internship, the reason he says is that he learnt a lot at his internship. Even though Collins (2002) concluded that lack of work and supervision may result in demotivation of interns but the results of this study have opened new possibilities. Even though Collins results are aligned with Almas’ case who resigned from her first internship after 10 days of no supervisor and a lack of communication but Aqib proved to be self-motivated and found a way to appoint an on-job supervisor for himself. He not only started to work for his self-appointed on-job supervisor, but he also worked with other managers around him. Keeping in view his internship limitations, he made goals that were realistic and
achievable. Since he was able achieve his goals and the task of composing literature for him was new that he was able to learn at his internship, and was also able to pinpoint some of the mistakes that the sales persons were making; thus he felt useful and was appreciated. Motivation in interns increases when their self-worth is boosted (Collins, 2002; Duncan, Birdsong, Fuhrman, & Borron, 2017).

There were problems that interns faced with regards to their supervisors, for example there was a communication gap between Taniya and her on-job supervisor. Even though Taniya was mentored very well by her on-job supervisor, but there was a friction throughout the internship which was due to poor communication between the two. It is important that on-job supervisors lay down the tasks very clearly for the interns to follow (Bandow, 2015; Keller, 2012), yet this was not the case with Taniya. Even under democratic supervision that Taniya was a part of, it must be noted that clear instructions and constant feedback even in such supervision is necessary (Keller, 2012). In fact, Collins (2002) points out that lack of communications leads to demotivation in the interns. In this case, frustration was noted in both the intern and the on-job supervisor, where both thought that the other was unable to understand what was required or what the instructions were. Here it is important to make clear that more responsibility of a smooth internship is with the on-job supervisor and not so much with the intern (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009), as the intern is still in the learning stage and new to the organization.

The problem in Waqar’s internship was due to difference in the goals of the intern and his on-job supervisor. Waqar mentions in his goals that he wanted to learn more about taxation, whereas his on-job supervisor wanted him to join the taxation field. This is a common problem in internships that sometimes the intern’s goals are not what the supervisor’s goals are and it creates challenges for both the on-job supervisor and the supervisee (Spence & HyamsSsekasi, 2015). It is important that the supervisor should respect the interns’ goals and treat him as an individual (Yoo & Morris, 2015). This dichotomy between the intern’s and the on-job supervisor’s goals could be removed by working more prior to the start of the internship program, “to ensure that students understand what is expected of them,” (Spence & HyamsSsekasi, 2015, p. 12).

Maria had a disagreement with her on-job supervisor as she wanted to give her presentation according to her own understanding but her supervisor wanted her to prepare it according to the format that he had given her. This issue was easily resolved when she
went to the CEO/owner of the company who let her present according to her own will because in small businesses the business decisions are overall dominated by the owner’s decision and he has the last say in all matters (Degravel, 2011). Nonetheless, it would not be wrong to say that the interns should have had a faculty supervisor to solve these issues because the internship experience may become meaningless due to lack of guidance and support from their institute (Alpert, Heaney and Kuhn, 2009).

The supervision in the internships understudy was very helpful for the interns and not only aided their learning but also enhanced it. The supervisors were seriously aiming to supervise interns so that their internship experience is useful for them. The interns and the supervisors seemed happy with the outcome, yet the need for faculty supervisor was felt as there were issues that the interns could have solved more easily if they had the support of the faculty supervisor.

5.5 Sub Question Four: First Main Question

The fourth and the last sub question of the first main question that needs to be discussed was, “What internship program structure does the employer use for intern placement?”

All internships except one were following some sort of structure as per their company policy or their requirement. Most of the interns were a part of task based internships which comes in domain of problem based learning. Task based learning meant that during the six weeks of internship, students were required to focus their attention towards only one task and all their work was geared towards performing that particular task. All marketing interns except one were given the task to sell the company’s product. Hence all their planning, preparation and understanding went towards obtaining the goal of increased sales. Also, finance interns who were dealing with financial data were given the task of handling that data. Hmelo-Silver (2004) points out that in order for a learner to complete a task, one must be aware of ‘what they do and do not know’ about the given task and then learn the knowledge that they need to perform the task. All marketing interns who were a part of task based internship were unaware of the details of the product that they were to sell; therefore, all interns’ first step was to gain knowledge regarding the product that they were to sell.
In case of finance interns, they needed background information about sharia compliance in Shoab’s case and taxation in Waqar’s case. Next, according to Hmelo-Silver (2004) they must plan their action and set goals to be able perform the given task. Here, it is important to note, that interns who were under direct supervision (Anum, Shoib and Waqar) were taught by their supervisors how to carry out the required tasks, but those who were a part of democratic supervision (Almas, Maria and Asim) planned their own modus operandi. Then lastly, the learners should be able to monitor their learning and see to extent to which they were able to achieve goals (Hmelo-Silver, 2004). All interns were able to monitor their learning through reflection writing. Such learning is intrinsically motivational for the learners because they are able to gain a sense of satisfaction by achieving their goals through controlling their activities and are able to find the learning meaningful (Hmelo-Silver, 2004). In this study also, the interns were able to achieve their goals and felt that their new learning was important for them.

Another type of internship was project based internship in which three interns (Taha, Mana and Taniya) were involved. In this type of internship, an intern becomes a part of a project that he carries through from the beginning to end. Project based learning is also a part of problem based learning which stem from learner centered paradigm (Johari & Bradshaw, 2008) and has been recently more popular than any other type of internship (Hurts & Good, 2009). Like task based learning, project based learning is also enhances learners motivation through assigning reachable goals in a project (Johari & Bradshaw, 2008). In this type of internship, the on-job supervisors play a dynamic role as they have to make sure that the project is completed within the given time (Johari & Bradshaw, 2008). It was seen in the present case study, that the interns in this type of internships were continuously monitored and supervised by their on-job supervisors even in case Taniya who even though had a democratic supervisor, yet was monitored throughout the six week period.

It is important to note that the interns who were a part of this case study and in project based internships were unable to complete their projects in six weeks. Mana was able to complete her project but that too in eight weeks’ time period. This problem mainly arose because the internships were not planned very efficiently and to cater for a six week time period. Bandow (2015) stresses that it is the responsibility of the host organizations to have a well-structured internship program ready for the interns where interns should be
provided with clear responsibilities and a proper schedule to follow. The interns in this case were of the view that host organizations could never formulate such structured programs for the interns because the on-job supervisors continuously get different tasks from their heads and the project is put to rest while the interns get busy in doing tasks that the on-job supervisors delegate to them. The problem here seems to be that the hosting organizations are keeping in mind their own benefit. Their internship program is not intern centered, rather it is host organization centered where the needs of the organization are kept more in view than the needs of the intern. Even though literature tells us that all tasks at the internship should be intern centered (Bandow, 2015; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Hmelo-Silver, 2004; Johari & Bradshaw, 2008) but the purpose of interns in task based and project based internship programs was more towards helping their on-job supervisors shed some work load. The non-completion of the project also adversely affects the self-efficacy and self esteem of the interns (Johari & Bradshaw, 2008). It was seen in the interviews that the interns were not satisfied with their own performance as they were unable to complete the given projects.

The rotation based internships were exclusively devised for interns to learn the system of a company and catered to the six week internship program. The students who went through the rotation based internships were satisfied with their experience. These results coincide with the results of Cheong, Yahya, Shen and Yen (2014) who reported that the interns in rotation based internship were satisfied by their experience. These internships were held in large organizations and the internship structure was in place. These organizations were not in need of interns rather they accommodated interns on receiving application from them. The downside of rotation internships seemed to be that since there was not much requirement of the intern, they were not supervised very efficiently by their on-job supervisors and did not always were given a feedback, even though continuous and timely feedback is not only appreciated but also needed by interns in an internship (Bandow, 2015).

There was one student who was a part of unstructured internship where neither was he appointed an on-job supervisor nor was he told about his internship responsibilities. The intern was able to achieve this internship through his family connections. Same results were established by Bilsland and Nagy (2015) in a research conducted in Vietnam, that when interns get internships through their connections, the internships are not always according
to higher education structures. Bilsland and Nagy are of the view that when universities are not fully engaged with the host organizations and when their processes are not in place then unstructured internships are a result. It is important that such processes are implemented where there is an agreement between the university and the host organization where the interns will be interning and a university faculty member is appointed to deal with any inconsistencies and problems at the internship (Beck and Halim, 2008).

Interns at the undergraduate level are involved in explorative learning where they are getting to know about new skills, processes and their alternatives but firms can get competitive edge by understanding how learning takes place and by moving from explorative to exploitive learning, which involves creativity and innovation (Bhatti, Larimo, and Coudounaris, 2016). It is important for the hosting organizations to note that the interns will need training from them and if their internship program is not well structured then neither them nor the interns will be able to fully benefit from these programs (Bandow, 2015). It is also fundamental for host organizations to understand that the purpose of an internship is not only to give a result oriented task to the interns or to help them handle complex projects but rather to get a deeper understanding of ‘how to work’ (Bilsland and Nagy, 2015).

It is important to understand here that no matter what the structure of an internship is, as long as it is following some structure, it is fruitful and beneficial for all the stakeholders and especially for the interns and the host organization.

5.6 First Main Question

The first main question of the study will sum up the results and discussion of the four sub questions already discussed. The first main question was, “How can Kolb’s experiential learning model be applied in an internship setting in Pakistan?”

The most important and foremost thing in Kolb’s experiential learning model is the design of an experiential learning activity. The results show that there was a difference between the responses given by the interns in Phase I and Phase II of the research because the internship activity was more structured in Phase II of the research as compared to Phase I. The interns in Phase II, therefore, exactly knew what they had done throughout the internship.
Eyler (2009) has given guidelines to create a high quality experiential education programs. Eyler exerts that an experiential learning project should clearly relate to the academic goals of the program and provide a well-developed assessment that delivers evidence of the achievement of the already chalked down academic goals. She further states that the on-job supervisor should understand student’s goals and discuss the planned activities with the faculty supervisor. Then the program should provide opportunities to students to be involved in meaningful tasks which are continuously monitored by both the on-job supervisor and the faculty supervisor and lastly, the students should continuously reflect upon their learning. It is also important that the students are able to recognize the impact that the new learning has on them and should be able to identify their progress and accomplishments which is achieved through reflection and report writing (NSEE, 2013). Thus the whole purpose of an experiential learning project is to understand one’s learning and the process of learning.

Even though the faculty supervisor was a missing ingredient in the internships conducted in Phase II, the on-job supervisors were given the internship manual which had in it written down six responsibilities of the on-job supervisor that included: (i) helping interns in setting achievable goals (ii) monitoring interns’ progress towards the goals (iii) planning meaningful tasks for the interns (iv) providing background knowledge of the company/product for the intern (v) providing a work space and other materials for interns and (vi) filling out the internship evaluation form for the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department. These six responsibilities helped on-job supervisors to better understand their responsibilities and to see what the academic institution expects from them. The responsibilities of the on-job supervisors must be clearly conveyed to them for an effective internship experience to take place (Bandow, 2015; Experiential education: Internships and Work-Based Learning - A Handbook for Practitioners and Administrators, 2017; Eyler, 2009).

Keeping in mind the the best practices of an effective internship laid down by Eyler (2009) the first and the foremost step that the interns took was to understand what their duties and work will be at the internship and formulated their internship goals with the help of the on-job supervisor. The primary responsibility of making the internship experience valuable for the interns lies with the on-job supervisor because the faculty supervisor does not have the expertise of that particular work environment and the responsibility of
evaluating the intern is considered the foremost responsibility of the faculty supervisor (Blaylock & McDaniel, 2009). Thus, the importance of both on-job supervisors and faculty supervisors are immense as the on-job supervisors help interns to develop on-job skills, the faculty supervisors help them achieve a better grade and understand their learning (Beenen, 2014). Since the faculty supervision was missing, therefore, problems that arose during and after internships could not be properly handled. These problems included:

- Almas’ first internship that had neither a supervisor nor any work space for her
- Aqib’s problem of unstructured and unsupervised internship
- Taniyas’ communication gap with her supervisor
- Marias’ disagreement with her on-job supervisor regarding her presentation
- The discrepancies in their final report and their reflections
- The copying of final report of one intern from another
- The mismatch of grades with the work done at the internship

There was felt a need for faculty supervisor due to the above reasons and also because, “Connecting and communicating with faculty who are responsible for coordinating internships is important to students so they do not feel lost in the process and will persist in the program,” (Hoyle & Goffnett, 2013, p. 10). It must be noted that in order for a faculty supervisor to be in place, the whole internship structure currently being used at the internship setting will need to be revamped to accommodate this new addition as was clarified by the The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department. Not only did he explain that the faculty will need to be trained in order to engage students effectively in internships but also this need was recognized by Blaylock and McDaniel, (2009). According to them, the faculty members will need new skills to successfully implement the internship which is more aligned with the coaching model rather than the stand and deliver instructional approach that they more often use in their classrooms. Nevertheless, the on-job supervisors immersed the interns in meaningful activities as advised by Eyler (2009).

The host organizations made sure that some sort of internship structure was being followed throughout the internship and that the interns are a part of meaningful activities because it is important that host organizations provide such meaningful experiences that would enhance student’s classroom learning (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008).
Bandow (2015) explains that often the interns are involved in such simple tasks that do not enhance their learning experience and these tasks are not related to their received education at all, in such cases, interns have problem understanding their internship contribution and are not satisfied with their experience. It was seen in Phase I of the research that interns were not satisfied with their experience as they could not relate it to their study. Another reason why they could not relate their experience was that there was no tool to measure the experience. In Phase II reflective writing helped interns understand their learning more.

The use of reflections is important part of a profitable experiential learning project as stressed by Eyler (2009). The reflections were written to assess student learning where the interns were continuously reflecting upon their learning through reflection writing which was made mandatory part of their internship. Reflection writing helped interns to identify their success and places of difficulty (Allan & Driscoll, 2014). It would be in fact correct to say that if a student is asked to enter an activity without reflecting upon the output of that activity then the output may seem meaningless to the students and the activity may cause confusion in the students’ mind (Finlayson, 2015; Keller, 2012). The same was the case with the interns in Phase I, they seemed confused and there was a lack of understanding of their learning which was definitely not the case with students in Phase II who reflected on their learning.

By recording thoughts and feelings about their internship experiences, students realize what they gained from the experience and how it relates to what they may want to do in the future. Students appreciate a structured learning opportunity for sharing their internship experiences (Keller, 2012). Kolb’s experiential learning cycle is incomplete without reflection on the experience. It is important that the interns reflect on their experience because according to Bell and Federman (2010) reflections are such strategies that help learners evaluate their learning and help them make better choices in learner controlled environments such as at the internships. They are of the view that more research needs to be conducted to understand how reflections work in learner controlled environments where emphasis is upon skill building. This research was conducted in learner control environments and the results came out positive and in favour of reflective writing.

The answer to how Kolb’s experiential learning cycle be implemented in the internship setting in Pakistan is not a very complex one. Currently, the interns are going for their internship and are engaging in learning. The problem occurs when the they do not
have in their minds the clear goals and direction that their learning should take. It is important that they sit with their on-job supervisors and formulate their internship goals. The on-job supervisor must understand that his/her responsibility is to make sure that the interns achieve those goals through meaningful well structured activities. It is very important for HEIs to train their faculty so that continuous monitoring of interns can be assessed and the interns are not left alone to deal with problems that may occur at their internships.

The results of this study show that internships in Pakistan are not only possible but also will be more fruitful if conducted as per Kolb’s experiential learning.

5.7 Sub Question One: Second Main Question

The first sub question of the second main question was, “What is the understanding of the institution’s internship department regarding the success of an internship program?”

An interview was conducted from the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department to understand how the internships are viewed by the institute. It was revealed that he was very much aware of the strong points and the weaknesses of the program and also the limitations of the institute. He started off by explaining that the importance of the internship program is immense as most of the courses conducted in business institutes across Pakistan are very theoretical in nature. He stressed on the term meaningful as he remarked that the purpose of internships is not to just send the intern at any organization but to make sure that the internship if purposeful, meaningful and the internship goals of fruitful learning are met with. Yoo and Morris (2015) explain that the responsibility of a placement office is not only to place interns at an internship but it is also to make sure that they are provided with an appropriate on-job supervisor and mentored properly throughout the internship so that a bridge between interns’ professional career and academic learning is effectively created. McCarthy and McCarthy (2006) note that even when interns at large universities where the placement office is unable to provide internships to all its students arrange their own internships, it is the responsibility of the placement office to make sure that the internship experience is an effective one for the interns. It was seen in this study as well that there were interns who made arrangements for their internships themselves. But the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department was unable to monitor these internships because according to the him, it was
not possible to visit all internships to see what tasks are the interns engaged in due to the large number of interns that interned every year. Therefore, a continuous check and monitoring by the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department was missing.

Maelah, Mohamed, Ramli, and Aman (2014) discussed the accounting internships and highlighted that these internships play two functions; they provide know-how of the accounting task and help interns plan their future field. The universities should make arrangements to scrutinize the host organization according to the policy chalked down by the internship placement office prior to sending students for accounting internships (Maelah, Mohamed, Ramli, and Aman, 2014). Even though only accounting internships are taken into consideration here; nevertheless, such protocol needs to be implemented by all departments so that effectiveness of the internship program could be maintained. They also argue that it is more beneficial to send interns to large audit firms as such organizations have their systems in place which efficiently manage all operations; this was not the case in the current study and the accounts internship was very well conducted and the students got good experience out of them even at small firms.

The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department said that the objectives of the internship are realized through the formal reports that the interns submit at the end of their internship and the on-job supervisor feedback which is submitted by the on-job supervisor through the intern evaluation form. The interns were provided a format for the report prior to their internship so that they know what aspects they have to present in their report and keep those aspects in mind. Beck and French (2016) state that provision of a report at the end of the internship is very important and provides an insight into the activities of an intern during the internship; nevertheless, it is not the only thing to be relied upon for intern evaluation. In fact, they stress, that the interns must be supervised and monitored throughout the internship program and the integrity, accountability and professional standards of an internship program is maintained if all activities written in the final report can be tracked down by the universities. Hence, solely relying on the final report and upon intern evaluation form does not satisfy the need of the internship to be monitored throughout the program.

When asked about what the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department thought of the internship duration of six weeks, he said that even
though in other countries and especially in more advanced countries, the amount of practical work that the students do is equivalent to the amount of their theoretical studies but same is not possible in our current setting. Mainly, because the institute has structured its program in such a way that more stress is given to teaching through books and secondly, the institute does not have the relevant staff that could teach courses in more practical way because not any faculty can guide and monitor students in an experiential learning project (Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, & Sharma, 2014). The notion that an experiential learning educator should be non-directive who shuns lectures, evaluations and advice is not what experiential learning demands; rather he/she should be competent in expert knowledge input, coaching on learning strategies and evaluation of an experiential project (Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, & Sharma, 2014). Therefore, the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department is not wrong in saying that special training sessions will be required for faculty to be a part of any experiential learning project.

The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department also said that currently the institute follows a six week internship made compulsory by the HEC but if the university decides to give internships the weightage of a course then it will be a strategic decision that the management will have to take. Divine, Miller, Wilson and Linrud (2008) suggest that there is no one universal model for internships and that departments, institutes or organizations can decide upon the type of internship that suits them keeping in mind their goals to offer an internship program. “In considering the issues involved in developing an internship program a long run perspective should be kept in mind. It takes time to develop and refine the processes involved and to nurture the business contacts that are necessary for success,” (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008, p. 7). He made it very clear that currently he was working under the domain provided to him by the institute.

It can be concluded that the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department knew very well about the importance and delivery of the internship program. The responsibilities of a placement department are immense and an internship experience fails if the participants selected for the internship task is not appropriate, or proper planning is not done by the placement department or continuous supervision is not provided to the interns (Beck & French, 2016; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015). He also was well aware of his limitations and was trying to deliver the best to the students. Even the on-job supervisors noted that the Alumni, Placement and International
Cooperation department of the institute was one of the best. Similarly, the on-job supervisors who had contacted this department for interns were satisfied with their response and said that this institute had one of the most efficient placement departments; however, one of the major jobs of a placement department is to make sure that it is involved in effective advertisement of the university programs so that more and more internship positions are acquired by it and the internship program is supported by various organizations (Alpert, Heaney, & Kuhn, 2009; Silva, et al., 2016). The interns showed their dissatisfaction in this regard and wanted the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department to conduct an annual job fair, where recruiters from various firms and organizations can assemble and on-spot recruit interns.

5.8 Sub Question Two: Second Main Question

The second sub question of the second main question was, “What roles do internships play in gaining employment for the interns and potential employees for companies?”

Internships create a win-win situation for all stakeholders; the students, the host organizations and the universities. Internships are very beneficial for the host organizations as they can test their potential candidates’ technical competency and attitudes while they are working at the host organization (Beck & Halim, 2008) resulting in the cut down of the recruitment and training costs for the employers (Silva, et al., 2016).

It was revealed that out of the 12 interns under study 08 were offered a job at the company where they were interning. Table 10 gives details of the job offered to the interns. It was also interesting to note that all internships that came through the internship department or through social media were seeking to fill a position at their company for which they had hired an intern. Internships are a satisfying experience for both the employers and the interns. Employers are satisfied with interning students if the intern performance is of high level and their attitude is positive towards their work (Vélez & Giner, 2015) and interns view internships negatively if they are not offered a job at their host organization (Vélez & Giner, 2015). It can be concluded that in Pakistan, too like elsewhere in the world, companies are using internships to look for the best candidates for their companies and internships has become a hiring tool for companies.
HEI’s are constantly striving to insert their graduates into the professional arena through various programs (Silva, et al., 2016). One of the most effective programs to achieve this aim is the internship program and if properly implemented the HEI’s can boost its employment effect through these programs (Silva, et al., 2016). Internships are now considered a must by the accreditation bodies, such as AACSB and HEC Pakistan, placement offices as well as the interns to find a suitable job; nevertheless, the employers are well aware of the cost and dedication it takes to design an internship program that would meaningful experience to the intern (Cook, Stokes, & Parker, 2015). The Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department also played its part in making sure that the interns who go for internships are able to find themselves a position at the host organizations. The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department explained that before going for the internships the interns are briefed about how they should conduct themselves at the on-job setting and they are made aware that they are the ambassadors of their institute and that they are representing their institute. They are also given a particular format according to which they are to make their CVs. They are also told that if they performed well at the internship, there are 80% chances that they will land themselves a job in that organization; it was surprising to see how the figure of 80% that was given by the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department coincided with Granitz and Harich, (2013) according to whom, employers offered a job to the 80% of the interns who came to them for internships.

It was noted that the interns who got their internship through an acquaintance were not offered a job. Bilsland and Nagy (2015) narrated the case of Vietnam that in some instances where interns use their own contacts to get internships, the experience is not a very successful one as the host organizations are not in need of interns; whereas, the interns are only interested in gaining the experience certificate. The results of this case study were different from Bilsland and Nagy, as it was observed that interns’ intention in this research was not only to get a certificate but also they tried to gain the best learning experience from the internship, and the organizations also except one (Aqib’s) provided interns with a well-planned internship program where the interns’ tasks were well defined. It can be concluded that internships in Pakistan are being more effectively used as compared to some of the other developing countries.
Out of the eight interns who were offered a job, only three accepted the offer. Companies when looking to induct fresh graduates, prefer employees who have been a part of an internship as compared to those who have no such experience (Maelah, Mohamed, Ramli, & Aman, 2014), keeping this fact in mind, the three interns (Almas, Shoaib and Taniya) wanted to try their luck in search of better prospects. Whereas, Waqar was not interested in taxation and Mana wanted to join the supply chain department and not the HR department. One other function of internships is that they help students to evaluate what field they want to take in future and what department/field is suitable for them in terms of career building; (Maelah, Mohamed, Ramli, & Aman, 2014) hence, it was after the internship experience that both Waqar and Mana decided to switch their field.

On the whole, experiential learning activities such as internships are highly recommended by employers as these have demonstrated positive outcomes such as promotion of self-directed learning skills, problem-solving skills and critical thinking skills in experiential learners; (Griffis, 2014) therefore, it would not be incorrect to say that internships in Pakistan are recruitment and hiring instrument for the companies.

5.9 Sub Question Three: Second Main Question

The third sub question to the second main question was, “To what extent are the needs of the industry aligned with the courses delivered at the institution?”

Even though researches worldwide highlighted the lack of soft skills such as interpersonal skills, confidence and mannerism (Andrews & Higson, 2008; Duncan, Birdsong, Fuhrman, & Borron, 2017; Farias, 2016; Hodges & Burchell, 2003; Schmidt & Gibson, 2010), this was not the case in the present research where all supervisors were of the view that the interns from the understudy institutions were confident, creative, respectful, hardworking and had good interpersonal skills; yet, there was a difference in what they had studied at the institute and what they faced in the industry. There was a demand to make the courses taught at the educational institutes more aligned with the industry needs. Cook, Stokes and Parker (2015) noted in their 20-year examination of the perceptions of business school interns that in the first ten years, 66% of the interns perceived there to be a connection between work experience and their academic learning. But in the next 10 years this perception dropped from 66% to 61% showing a wider gap between on-job experience and interns’ academic learning. They mentioned it to be
surprising that even when the computer technology is so up-to-date where latest techniques and researches can be reached instantly, the gap between the industry and the academics seemed to be widening. Business schools need to address the fact that they have outgrown their foundations and are now working under a more complex world; their faculty is teaching in isolation and needs to connect with the business world so that their teaching is more effective (Mitroff, Alpaslan, & O'Connor, 2015). It can be concluded that this was because the business school curriculum has not made the necessary changes to meet the market needs and market dynamics.

5.9.1 HR Interns

The HR interns (Hina, Taniya, Taha and Mana, who was a finance intern but interned in HR department of a bank) were of the opinion that the courses that they attended at their business institute were very relevant and the theories and HR practices that they studied were very much practically applied in the internship setting. Ahmad and Allen (2015) surveyed 261 companies, having minimum of 20 employees, in major Pakistani cities of Lahore, Islamabad and Karachi and concluded that 80% of the companies had high-performance HR practices in place such as fair and good recruitment practices, job guarantees, continuous on-job trainings, and opportunities of career development. Same results were achieved through this study; the courses pertaining to HRM that were taught at the business school were efficiently practices by the corporate sector in Pakistan. It is interesting to note here, that all the four interns were a part of middle tier to large organizations; how would the results be different if they worked in smaller family run firms?

5.9.2 Finance Interns

The finance interns were of the view that what they experienced at their internship was quite different from what they had studied in their institution. Because they had not been in touch with industry, they had no idea how the concepts learnt were actually applied in the real world setting.

Waqar does acknowledge that he knew the basics of and concepts behind the actual processes that were taking place in the company and was able to understand what was going on in the company. Basic skills are learnt at the university, for example the students
learn the basics of computer software applications but the internship gives students a more contextual, novel and timely exposure to new and specific software (Gault, Redington, & Schlager, 2000).

Many accounting interns felt that they needed to change their field after their internship experience because they felt that the university had not prepared them for the pressures that came with the field of accounting because there seemed to be mismatch between their capabilities, ambitions, skills and the opportunities that were offered by the accounting profession (Beck & Halim, 2008). Waqar by the end of the internship decided not to be a part of taxation field and Beena who after the internship decided to do her MBA in marketing.

Dyllick (2015) noted a persistent gap between knowing and doing in business schools. He states that students in business schools have to acquire knowledge with very little scope for them to practice what they have learnt. Instead of practicing what they should be practicing upon, he argues that students practice on the substitutes of these skills. The same was the case in this study where Shoaib said that he had only practiced on the available data or from the problems given in the books; whereas the same information was given by Waqar’s and Shoaib’s on-job supervisor, who explained that only book content is taught at the universities and the students did not have any practical experience. When students go into the market, they know quite a bit but cannot do anything practically because they have not practiced on the actual data. Shoaib also said that whenever they were asked to make a report, they never visited industry for it; they just took the available public data and made a report from it. This created a gap in student learning, but it must be kept in mind, that even when interns and alumni complain about business schools not teaching skills in depth but what they do not realize is that specifics become obsolete whereas if the basics are strong, one can build on it any skill (Gault, Redington, & Schlager, 2000). The business schools thus teach the basics all fields, or it can be said that the foundations of skills is laid down at the business schools for the industry and the individual student to build upon.

5.9.3 Marketing Interns

With marketing interns, the problem was not that they lacked knowledge or practical experience; rather, it had more to do with adaptability. Since the marketing interns
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

went to various organizations, dealing in various products with very different setups, therefore they needed to be more versatile and adopters and adapters. Companies nowadays want to recruit individuals who have the ability to work in diverse environments and are able to adapt to the rapidly changing dynamics of the business world (Gardiner & Lacy, 2005).

Even though Somers, Passerini, Parhankangas and Casal, (2014) proved through their research on mind mapping that the courses offered in business schools were superficial in nature, and that undergraduate and MBA students have a problem integrating various concepts across disciplines, our research shows dissimilar conclusion. According to the interns in this study, their courses were being applied in the practical setting, but not as a whole, rather they had to extract the learnt knowledge according to the requirement. This very well proves that the interns were able to extract the desired knowledge and apply it in their internship setting.

The interns also gave reasons as to why most theories and processes were not being applied. The biggest reason that they gave was that usually the businesses in Pakistan are family businesses or also known in Pakistan as seth businesses which are highly autocratic in nature. Thus Asim explained that because the company culture where he was interning was a seth culture, therefore, it was not based on a theory or a concept. Further to this, he explained that in his host organization, which was a family run business, the employers were scared to speak and just followed what they were told. It was understood by all marketing interns that a seth company does not necessarily have the required departments to function as the seth usually looked after everything and he made whatever policies he wanted to make. “Commonly, the seth is the owner of the small to medium businesses and possesses the Do-As-I-Say leadership style predominantly. He deems his wisdom and logic to be most rational and above all, most viable,” (Mehmud, 2017, para. 3).

On the other hand, business school curriculum is based upon the best practices of a few big powerful American and European companies and majority of small companies and entrepreneur ventures are discredited, which results in undermining a large number global population (Dyllick, 2015). At small seth organizations there was not much that was aligned with the best practices studies at the university because the seth undermines ethical practices and maneuvers the poorly formulated policies according to his own whims and wishes (Mehmud, 2017). Even though the seth culture is known to be a natural resistor of
creativity and innovation, this was not the case in this study, because most of the interns personally knew the seth therefore they were allowed to use their own creativity and novelty to the extent the seth allowed them to do and as long as it was benefiting the business. Not everything about the seth culture is repelling and un-wanting, in fact whenever big, rapid and financial decisions are the need of the hour, that is where the seth comes handy (Nizami, Tirmizi, & Baloch, 2017). Seth control allows a smooth running of the company through timely decision making (Nizami, Tirmizi, & Baloch, 2017) and makes sure that he is well aware of day-to-day business in his company and keeps a close check on his employees (Mehmud, 2017). In such an atmosphere, the benefit of this culture for the interns was immense. The interns were working directly under the company head and as such were taking full benefit of their experiences. All five of the interns had their worked checked by the company CEO and they were kept on watch by the CEO himself. Even though Anum was in a multinational organization, but since her organization was a small one, the CEO was well aware of how and what was being done.

Other than the courses studied at the institute, it was revealed that working in various student bodies and organizations on campus also helped students in building their business concepts. Campus organizations are one of the best ways to utilize the knowledge learnt in classroom and improve skills that the employers demand such as networking skills, interviewing skills, communication skills other than the critical thinking skills (Munoza, Millera, & Poole, 2016). It becomes important for business schools to provide students with such opportunities where they can build their skills by taking part in the student bodies and organizations.

The marketing interns like the finance interns were of the view that when they go in the practical life, it comes as a surprise that how different the working of the companies is and that this gap should be reduced by giving students more practical work during their four years stays at the institute. McCarthy and McCarthy (2006) quoted Mintzberg (2004) and revealed that when MBA graduates enter open market, they have an inflated view of themselves, even though their professors essentially ignore the art of management laying emphasis upon the science of management. They added that there needs to be a major shift in how business courses are taught and the management courses need to be skill oriented where students should be able to attain industry experience prior to their graduation. The marketing interns found it challenging to be a part of an organization which they had not
studied about and had no previous knowledge about but they were able to link their learned knowledge with their working knowledge. In Pakistan, the employers want business graduates to be equipped with knowledge, attitude and skills which the business schools can fulfil using practical learning, Pakistani case studies and curriculum as per the demand of the industry (Ume-Amen, 2014).

It was a common knowledge that marketing students are often given assignments that require a market or industrial visit and then a submission of report; hence when asked about the same, they said that usually students submit a fake report as there is no way for teachers to verify the authenticity of the submitted report. Almas added that the teachers do not provide any reference point for the students and leave it upon them to go to any company and bring the information that they require. The students, according to Almas, then bring a visiting card to the teachers saying that we have met this person in the organization and submit a fictitious report. Baim (2010) explained how marketing courses should be taught and states that a marketing course focuses upon consumer needs and wants where the instructor is to make sure that students should be able to step outside of themselves and exclusively focus on customer needs which can be achieved through critical thinking and experiential learning. The students should be able to extract more information from the customers to exactly understand their needs and they should be able to fill in the gaps without their personal biases; to do so, topics such as talking to customers and demographics of customers should be taught in the class (Baim, 2010). Before going on to a rigorous hands-on project, the students should practice listening to the customers without inserting their own opinions; this can be done through a round table discussion (Baim, 2010). Hence, starting the course with an experiential learning project without first laying its foundation may not help students understand the importance of the project and the direction the project should take.

All 12 interns and their on-job supervisors recommended that there should be a constant interaction between the business schools and the industry in order for business studies to be more fruitful. The on-job supervisors believed that they had to work very hard with the interns and had to guide them at every step during the internship as they had ventured into the business world for the first time; on the other hand, the interns complained that their on-job supervisors did not realize that this was their first experience and thought that they should know everything regarding the working of their company. There was seen
frustration in both the on-job supervisors and the interns regarding the internship experience, but this issue exists globally as many high profile reports such as the report ‘A New Partnership for the Modernisation of Universities’, by the European Commission highlights the importance of university business cooperation in business schools’ curriculum design as this will lead to more prepared students joining the workforce and will ultimately result in aligning the curriculum with the needs of the labour market and enrich student learning (Plewa, Gala´n-Muros, & Davey, 2015 ). There are many ways through which HEIs can link themselves with the industry; which includes, alumni networks, promotion of university business cooperation by appointing people from the industry on university curriculum boards (Plewa, Gala´n-Muros, & Davey, 2015 ). “HEIs should put a particular focus on engaging business in the design of relevant curricula, which not only drives business’ engagement in delivery activities but also has a direct impact on achieving an alignment of the curriculum with business needs,” (Plewa, Gala´n-Muros, & Davey, 2015 , p. 49).

It is recommended that to keep pace with the ever changing business environment, the HEIs must create and maintain partnerships with industry so that the goal of preparing efficient employees must be fulfilled (Farias, 2016). The main reason for disconnect between employers needs and higher education is the difference in their perception regarding the dimensions of student development such that where employers felt that interpersonal skills are most important in an employee, the HEIs perceived knowledge to be the most important skill needed (Abraham & Karns, 2009; Farias, 2016). Silva, et al (2016) are of the view that internships are great opportunities for institutes to re-vamp their educational programs according to the industrial needs because through internships HEIs get an access into the expectations of the industry and the skills required by them. They stress that this is an opportunity for HEIs to align their courses with the industrial demands. It will not be possible for HEIs to offer multiple internships of smaller duration as such internships are less rewarding and more time and effort consuming (Silva, et al., 2016). It is important that business institutes should align their courses according to the needs of the industry. There are various ways to do so, such as putting business personnel on the study boards, by giving small industry relate well-structured project to the students, by surveying the industry needs and by using internships as a survey tool to build this gap.
A problem that was highlighted in the internships was their timings. The interns and their on-job supervisors mostly were of the opinion that the internships should be placed before the last semester. The reasons given were mainly that (a) it will help students choose their majors and (b) it will help students relate what they study in the class with the real world. Thus, Waqar’s on-job supervisor explained that this could be achieved by asking students to be a part of a 15 day internship during his/her studies in a particular major and then in another 15 day internship in another major. He explained that the 15 days internship should be an ongoing feature during students’ bachelor program and the last and final internship should be of three months which the student should get in after experiencing all the major fields. Similar suggestion was given by Maria’s on-job supervisor who said that he had seen many students change their majors after doing their BBA and he felt that this was because they had very little knowledge about the practical implications of that particular subject. He elaborated that every year the students should be asked to do a small period of internship in a particular major. It seemed that when asking for more frequent internships, the supervisors and the interns were not keeping in their mind, the logistics that such a venture would take. It is not easy for companies to design an internship that would bring meaningful experience to the interns as such an internship program has its financial and time costs attached to it (Cook, Stokes, & Parker, 2015). It will be difficult for the business schools and the host organizations to offer so many internship programs, instead, small scale experiential projects should be embedded in the four year undergraduate program which will be easy for the faculty, industry and the students to manage and will make students more aware of the business environment.

5.10 The Second Main Question

The second main was, “To what extent are the internships adding to Pakistan’s human capital development?” The answer to this question was sought by examining how well the understanding of the internship department is regarding the planning and conducting of internships; whether or not these internships are providing human capital to the industry in form of trained personnel in the field of business and how much are the courses aligned with the needs of the industry.

In this time and age of global economic competition, the governments are building on human capital by ensuring that long term job creation, increased living standards and
people’s productivity by changing from industrial economy to knowledge societies and through streamlining the cooperation of the government, the businesses and the universities (Plewa, Galan-Muros, & Davey, 2015). HEC Pakistan is also trying to fill this gap by making internships mandatory at higher education level. There are multiple ways of human capital generation and internship programs offered by the universities are one of those ways (Weible, 2010). Through internship programs inspiring students, roughly one in three, is encouraged to open their own businesses whereas around two-thirds of students who were interning in small businesses were able to land a job there (Weible, 2010). In this study the internships helped students to find the right field for themselves and one out of 12 interns was interested in becoming an entrepreneur.

There can develop a strong connection between the business schools and the businesses through internships (Weible, 2010) as not only the corporate partner may receive important solutions through research on their business problems; but also, students during their internships develop skills and competencies needed by businesses (Deeter-Schmelz, 2015). The value of an employee rises as ones skills, education and productivity raises (Farias, 2016). Therefore, to gain human capital successfully from internships it is important the universities should understand its importance and function. In this case study, an interview with the understudy institute’s Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department revealed that he was aware of the needs of the internship program and knew what weaknesses existed in the current internship program. He explained that overcoming those weaknesses would mean to re-vamp the whole program and make policy adjustments that would need some major decision making from the management. It must be kept in mind that all of these job offers except one was made by the companies that came through the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department. Thus the institutes’ corporate partners got an insight into strong points and weaknesses of the potential candidates in form of interns and decided whether a job should or should not be offered to them (Deeter-Schmelz, 2015). The positive economic impact of internships can also be measured through calculating the hours that the interns put in interning and save companies money that they would otherwise spend in hiring employees (Austin & Rust, 2015).

It is incumbent for the varsities to play their part in building human capital through paying close attention to the labour market needs (Farias, 2016). Proper planning is crucial
in order for an internship to be productive and the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department knew very well about the importance and delivery of the internship program. The responsibilities of Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department are immense and an internship experience fails if the participants selected for the internship task is not appropriate, or proper planning is not done by the placement department or continuous supervision is not provided to the interns (Beck & French, 2016; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015). It was repeatedly brought to notice by the interns, their on-job supervisors as well as the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department that the courses need to be more experiential in nature.

It was explained by the Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department that the current faculty of the institute was not trained enough to teach the courses in a more interactive manner where there is a continuous interaction of the students with the industry. Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli and Sharma (2014) stress, that there needs to be specialized faculty to teach experiential courses that should be trained in the field of experiential learning. The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department was of the view that to change the teaching methodology at the institute and to make it more practical is a policy matter that needs major decisions to be made by the management. The institute can decide upon the model of internship program that they want to follow as there is no one universal model for internships (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008). “Whichever model organization choses, it should keep in mind its long term effectiveness,” (Divine, Miller, Wilson, & Linrud, 2008, p. 7), such as constant provision of human capital. One thing that the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department of the institute can do is to use the internship program to understand the needs of the industry (Silva, et al., 2016) and help the institute in re-vamping its curriculum so that it is aligned with the industrial needs because the course alignment needs to be improved and the needs of the industry need to be focused upon. Universities must get closer to the industry in order to build close network and relationship with them in order to continuously re-evaluate their curriculum according to the needs of the industry (Farias, 2016).

All 12 interns and their on-job supervisors recommended that there should be a constant interaction between the business schools and the industry in order for business studies to be more fruitful which can be achieved through the proposed through the
systematic internship cycle. There was seen frustration in both the on-job supervisors and the interns regarding the internship experience. Even though one of the most important mission of a business school is to prepare its students for employment in the business world, yet research needs to be conducted to understand why there are discrepancies between the students’ skill set and the demand of the industry (Abraham & Karns, 2009). One reason may be the difference between the focus of the business schools and the businesses, where the business schools focus more on the technical skills and the businesses focus upon the competencies that ensure success in businesses (Abraham & Karns, 2009). Also, business schools must see what can be realistically included in business school curriculum (Abraham & Karns, 2009) and what faculty does it have to cater to the proposed curriculum. Thus, business schools have their own restraints that they need to keep in mind while planning curriculum for their students.

Even though researches have recommended that to keep pace with the ever changing business environment, the HEIs must create and maintain partnerships with industry so that the goal of preparing efficient employees must be fulfilled; (Abraham & Karns, 2009; Farias, 2016; Silva, et al, 2016) yet, this goals is seldom realized and there is an ever growing disconnect between the business school curriculum and the required on-job skills (Cook, Stokes, & Parker, 2015). Nevertheless, even in their current state, internships are adding to the human capital of the country. With improvement in the internship and alignment of business courses with the industrial need, the overall human capital of the country will increase such that the entry level employees will get better remuneration for their skills. Because human capital is gained through investments made in human skills, knowledge and education in order to increase their productivity which not only gives rise to one’s personal income but also to the economic growth of a country on the whole (Farias, 2016). The pay scale of the fresh graduates can be raised substantially if improvements in the undergrad programs at the institution could be made, making them more compatible with the needs of the industry (Silva, et al., 2016). It must also be kept in mind that the overall human capital index of Pakistan is very low where Pakistan has been ranked almost at the bottom (125) of a list of 130 countries (The global human capital report, 2017, 2017) therefore the industry has to rely upon and be satisfied with the low quality of human capital that comes their way.
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

Thus, the answer to the second main question of this research is that internships are definitely adding to Pakistan’s human capital generation. But it must also be kept in mind that there is room for improvement. The institute can use the experience and the expertise of the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department in order to re-evaluate its curriculum using internship as expressed by Silva, et al., (2016) so that fits industry requirements and generating more apt human capital for the industry.

5.11 Summary

It can be said that the internships using the RFGHCI model are possible in Pakistan where the internships are conducted using the experiential learning cycle. It was observed that when internships were conducted as per the theory using goal setting and reflection writing as an important factor of experiential learning then students are better able to understand the direction that their learning is taking. Even though the students are not fully prepared by their academic institutions to be a part of the industry, it was revealed that they are very much accepted by the industry; considering the low level of human capital available, the industry seems to have brought down its expectation. Nevertheless, the results of this study are very encouraging and point towards applicability of the experiential learning model in the Pakistani context which in turn will be able to upgrade the quality of the human capital generated to work in Pakistani industry.
6 CHAPTER SIX: Conclusion and Recommendations

6.1 Introduction

This case study was conducted at one of the renowned business school of Pakistan keeping in mind two objectives: First to understand what experiences did interns go through at their internships and why were the internships being considered useless by the interns and the industry and second, to seek the possibility of aligning the internships program at the institute with the requirements laid down by AACSB. Keeping the AACSB recommended model of experiential learning for human capital generation through internships, there were three main purposes of this research: (a) to understand how Kolb’s learning model came into play in an internship setting in Pakistan; (b) to recognize how internships were adding to the human capital in Pakistan; and (c) to give recommendation to improve business internships in Pakistan. To achieve this purpose a model of Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships (RFGHCI) was constructed and the internships were carried out according to the model.

The first two purposes have been already fulfilled in the previous sections and the present section will focus on the third and final purpose of the study.

6.2 Concluding Remarks

To answer the questions of the research the internships were conducted at the institute using the Reflective Framework for Generating Human Capital through Internships (RFGHCI). Internships are a way to connect classroom theoretical learning with actual job experience; therefore, it is stated in the preamble of the Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business's Eligibility procedures and accreditation standards for business accreditation (2013) "In today’s increasingly dynamic environment, business schools must respond to the business world’s changing needs by providing relevant knowledge and skills to the communities they serve. They must innovate and invest in intellectual capital; they must develop new programs, curricula, and courses,” (p. 2). AACSB has given much importance to conducting internships as an experiential learning project where the projects should be well documented and provide students opportunities to engage with business leaders. Griffis (2014) is of the view that experiential learning is a new trend in business education which the business schools are adopting.
because of the importance that is given to it by the accrediting agencies and employers. If internships are conducted using experiential learning, the results gained are favourable, and it allows students to (a) integrate academic learning and real-life experiences, (b) decide about the potential careers, (c) develop mentoring relationship, (d) linkage with future colleagues, and (e) gain self-confidence in their own knowledge and skill sets (Cornell, Johnson, & Schwartz, 2013).

This case study was conducted using the RFGHCI model where reflective writing was at the heart of experiential learning activity and the outcome was human capital generation, which showed that internships according to the demands of AACSB are possible. It can also be established that the internships at the understudy institution have the capacity to provide the much needed human capital.

The study also showed that currently, the experiential learning cycle that the AACSB so much emphasis upon is not being followed as per the instructions. The institute’s internship practices can be compared with those of Vietnam given by Bisland and Nagy (2015). They have explained through figures 9a and 9b that how the internships in Vietnam different from the rest of the world In figure 8a there is an intersection of all three stakeholders, that is, the employer, the student and the university; whereas in figure 8b there is no intersection between the three where the student interacts with the on-job supervisor separately and with the faculty supervisor separately. The Vietnamese interns complained that no real work was given to them and that they did not think that their learning at the internship was of much use. The same results were obtained from Phase I of this research where interns did not really understand what they learnt and how they learnt at the internships and either underestimated their learning or inflated it which were very different from Phase II of the research which was carried out using the RFGHCI model and where faculty supervisor to some extent was involved. It is an established fact that, “The lack of university involvement in the work placement establishment or process leads to unsystematic, unstructured internships. The learning experience of the intern is fortuitous rather than targeted and planned,” (Bilsland & Nagy, 2015, p. 188).
An experiential learning model emphasizes upon the process of learning rather than the product of learning but in the current internship setup it was observed that the product was being emphasized upon where the interns had to submit the final report and the intern evaluation form was submitted by the on-job supervisor at the end of the internship. These submitted reports were marked by an expert faculty member but a major shortcoming of this process was that the faculty member who had to grade the internship based on the submitted report had no way to double check the facts written in the submitted reports. This led to plagiarized reports being submitted by the interns to the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation department. There is a need for more robust assessment using reflections as an assessment tool.

Gentry (1990) explained that intern evaluation must be conducted by the faculty supervisor who is in charge of the student learning throughout the internship. The intern should also be provided with continuous feedback from pre-experience introduction to the final debriefing of the internship so that the intern is able to focus on his/her learning. Reflection writing is an active component of experiential learning which cannot be ignored in an experiential learning project and is also the center of the RFGHCI model. Our case study has showed reflection as a means of assessment opened new vistas for student learning. When students were asked to reflect on their learning they were encouraged to understand the goals of the internship, to transfer classroom learning to on-job location and to contemplate upon their strong and weak points.
The host organizations on the other hand were following some sort of internship program structure to offer internships to the undergraduate students and were in all case except one was effective. The supervision provided by the host organizations was also satisfactory. Nevertheless, the internships were structured keeping in mind the needs of the host organizations and not the intern; even though, the internships should be structured around the needs and demands of the intern and should be intern-centered (Bandow, 2015; Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Hmelo-Silver, 2004; Johari & Bradshaw, 2008). Also it was seen that the work given to the interns was not always focused; rather, it varied day to day and depended upon how much workload was given to the on-job supervisor, which was further delegated to the interns which at times created frustration in interns. It must be kept in mind, that conveying the expectations of the interns to the employer is the job of the faculty supervisor (Farias, 2016), who in this case was absent. The interns were seen as a helper for the on-job supervisor and they were asked to do work at times that was not in their work scope.

The employers were generally happy with the interns’ knowledge, commitment and work ethics but they complained about the university courses being too much theoretical and a need to have more courses or projects that are experiential in nature and there was seen a call for more interaction between the universities and the corporate world. The Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department was well aware of this demand from the industry but he was of the view that the faculty will need to be trained in teaching experiential courses in order to for them to fulfil this demand from the corporate sector as also explained by Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli and Sharma (2014) that specialized faculty is needed to teach experiential courses.

Even with all their weaknesses, the internships were seen to be adding to the human capital as is the net result of the RFGHCI model, such that most of the interns found themselves jobs with the host organizations. It was also seen that these organizations were using internships for selection of most suitable candidate for an entry level position at their organization. Farias (2016) is of the view that the responsibility of student employability is shared amongst the employer, the educator and the student themselves and there must be collaboration between the three in order to implement the suitable curriculum according to the needs of the industry.
6.3 Recommendations

To make internships more productive and fruitful such that they provide the industry with the much needed human capital, I would like to give the following recommendations to the institute. For experiential learning programs to be fully implemented, it is important that the organizations have committed administrators who understand the importance and effectiveness of an experiential learning program (Austin & Rust, 2015).

6.3.1 Appointment of Faculty Supervisor

There is an urgent need for the institute to train and appoint faculty supervisors for the interns. Even though I was not engaged as a faculty supervisor due to my limited role, my presence as a researcher for the interns made a positive difference and they called me whenever they felt stressed, over worked, happy or unhappy with their work. Even though I could not provide them the academic support, to some extent I provide them with emotional support. A faculty supervisor is therefore essential for the academic and emotional support of the interns.

- The most important missing element from the current internship in Phase I was the absence of faculty supervisor. This created a link among the students, the industry and the academic institute resulting in an unstructured internship as shown in Figure 9b. Kolb and Kolb (2005) observe, “One can develop a state of the art learning-focused curriculum that is doomed to failure if faculty members are not on board with it philosophically and technically……..a coordinated institutional approach can provide the synergy necessary for dramatic organizational change” (p. 209). Hence, if an institute wants its internship program to be an effective one then it must take its faculty on board which will provide the much needed synergy for the required organizational change towards a more hands-on learning.

- In order for the institute to re-vamp its internship program in accordance with the AACSB and make sure that each student has a faculty supervisor; the institute will have to bear the cost of a faculty supervisor. A faculty member in an internship setting will be unable to instruct 40 students at a time which is the usual class size of a business school (Blaylock & McDaniel, 2009). This will not only increase
salary cost of an individual faculty member, but might also require induction of more faculty in order to fill the gap that may be created by giving faculty internships to conduct which the institute must support (Austin & Rust, 2015; Blaylock & McDaniel, 2009).

- A typical business faculty will need new skills to teach an experiential learning course (Blaylock & McDaniel, 2009; Kolb, Kolb, Passarelli, & Sharma, 2014); therefore, the institute will have to bear the cost of training the faculty (Blaylock & McDaniel, 2009)

- Faculty supervisors act as mentors who help students understand their learning; therefore, appropriate time should be given by the faculty supervisors to understand the interns’ needs, demands and their desires (Austin and Rust, 2015).

- The faculty supervisors must be part of planning and organization of the internship program and hence must monitor an internship from the beginning to end (Weible, 2010).

### 6.3.2 Structured Programs

There are three groups that benefit the most from internships: students, employers and educational institutions (Bilsland & Nagy, 2015; Weible, 2010). Internship programs at the business schools need to be developed in such a way that maximum benefit can be taken from them; (Weible, 2010) therefore, the internship programs have to be well structured. The institute needs to see that all internships provided to the students are well structured so that the learners and the employers do not lose their focus.

- It is advised that when the institute structures an internship program, a considerable time is taken up in planning it. To do so, results from the research on evaluation of experiential learning should be used as a stepping stone for an effective experiential learning program to be implemented; this strategy has been used by universities across the United States (Austin & Rust, 2015).

- The curriculum of the university should be aligned with the needs of the industry (Austin & Rust, 2015). Through internships the academics can access the expectations of the companies with regards to the skills they require (Farias, 2016;
Silva, et al., 2016) and re-evaluate their curriculum according to the needs of the industry. This will help generate effective human capital for the country.

- There is a need for continuous assessment of internships that do not only focus on the end product, but on the process of learning (Eligibility procedures and accreditation standards for business accreditation, 2013). A well-structured program will have a well-structured assessment design; the assessment should not only be continuous but also where faculty and students can evaluate the progress being made. The current assessment techniques are inefficient and unreliable that only focuses upon the product and the process of learning whereas understanding ones process of learning is central to experiential learning which is currently missing.

- It is also the responsibility of the host organizations to provide well-structured program for the interns. To begin with, the host organizations must provide a job description to the universities and to the interns; then an on-job supervisor should be appointed to look after the intern’s work (Bandow, 2015). Companies must restructure their internship programs by defining what an intern means to them and how an intern can be an asset for the company (Mosley, 2013). Further to this, the host organization should provide orientation to the interns, a clear set of expectations that they have from the intern and a list of opportunities should be communicated in detail to the intern (Bandow, 2015; Mosley, 2013). The faculty supervisor must oversee that all requirements are being fulfilled by the host organization.

- It is important for the universities and the host organizations to have a formal process of gathering intern feedback about the work and about his/her overall internship experience (Bandow, 2015). This feedback should be taken seriously and the matters that are a hindrance in intern learning and a smooth flow of events in an internship should be considered.

- It is recommended that some compensation should be given to the interns for their work (Mosley, 2013) to motivate them.
6.3.3 Connection with the Industry

The goal of a business school is to provide human capital for the industry which is also an important part of the RFGHCI model, therefore the business schools must very well understand the needs of the industry that they are catering to as well. Internships are one of the major ways of connecting with the industry which can be done using the systematic internship cycle.

- The university can use the internship data collected from the interns regarding their internship experiences to re-vamp its curriculum according to the needs of the industry (Degravel, 2011; Silva, et al., 2016). This will help raise the quality of the human capital generated by a business school.

- Internships can also be used to connect faculty with the industry, which should lead to new research opportunities for the faculty and on the whole boost research outcome of the university (Degravel, 2011). This connection of faculty with the industry will guide faculty to give a direction to their teaching and will help them to come up with more innovative techniques of merging their teaching with the industry (Degravel, 2011). It was also realized in the research that students rely on the faculty members for advice about their on-job problems who have been affiliated with the industry. This will help the institute get the faculty who are essentially academics and have no industrial experience, connect with the industry.

- If handled properly, internships can provide a strong alliance between the industry and the academia. The academia can help industry solve its problems through research using its students as an effective resource, and provide the industry with the concept tools and methodologies for solving problems (BeckandFrench, 2016).

- One important way for HEIs to improve the employability of their graduates is through engaging the actively industry in the design and structure of their curriculum as prescribed in the systematic internship cycle. This can be done via improving their strategic relationship with the industry by putting the senior management on the curriculum design boards (Plewa, Galań-Muros, & Davey, 2015 ). In this way the industry will own university curriculum and any deficiency in the curriculum will not only be the academic institution’s fault but also the fault of the industry.
6.3.4 Reflections

Reflections are central to any experiential learning project and therefore it is the central aspect of the RFGHCI model. Reflections play multiple roles in an internship. It helps students gauge their learning, understand their strong points and weaknesses, plan the next step and it helps the educational institutes in verifying student reports and assess the direction of their learning.

- Instructors who take part in experiential learning projects can have problems in designing a course that links experience with student courses, for which they need support from their institutions (Eyler, 2009). Institutes should provide support in giving training to the faculty and facilitate them through internship seminars (Eyler, 2009).

- It is important to promote reflective writing throughout the curriculum (Allan & Driscoll, 2014) to develop metacognition skills of students so that they become lifelong learners and it is important that the reflections are more than mere description of events (Allan & Driscoll, 2014). In order to teach students the art of reflective writing, the faculty must be well versed with the technique and this can only be achieved through specialized reflective writing workshops and seminars (Allan & Driscoll, 2014; Eyler, 2009).

- Reflections are not easy to teach and need full time faculty commitment and student support, but with time these skills can be developed and can be used to their maximum benefit (Sen, 2010). There is commonly a lack of enthusiasm for reflection writing for two reasons: First, the benefits of reflective writing may not be very clear to the faulty, especially the students and second due to the congested curriculum at the university level (Sen, 2010). The faculty and students both should recognize and understand the importance of reflective writing and the institute should make adjustments in the curriculum.
6.4 Summary

One of the major benefits of experiential learning is that it can help students shift smoothly from their university to work, but most importantly it makes them reflective learners that enhance their problem solving and critical thinking. The challenge for the academic institutions and their faculty is to incorporate experiential learning into the curriculum and then assess the learning experiences outcomes. Without the much needed support from the institution, experiential learning will only exist at educational periphery and its promise of augmented learning will not be realized. The RFGHCI model has provided successful results in this research and should be part of internship manual. This model showed how experiential learning, the university curriculum with the industry and the generation of human capital were interrelated and how a successful experiential learning activity leads to human capital generation.

6.5 Limitations of the Study

This research like any other research had several limitations.

First of all as a researcher, I had a limited role and I could not intervene in the working of the Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department. I could not grade the reports that were received by this department and neither could I take any other faculty to play the role of a faculty supervisor as the faculty was already committed. I could not fully play the role of a faculty supervisor and my role was restricted.

Second, since I was not officially appointed as a faculty supervisor; therefore, the on-job supervisors were in no way committed to give me an interview. Out of 12 interviews from the on-job supervisors, two were reluctant to share the information resulting in lack of data of two interns.

Third, the interns had no idea what reflective writing was and they felt burdened by the extra work and effort that they had to put in. Even though a three hour tutorial was given to them on reflective writing but it seemed insufficient. Reflective writing is a skill which is best learnt through practice, not enough time was provided to the interns to practice this skill.

Fourth, since there was no grade allocation or any other incentive tied to this research and was fully self-initiative based, therefore at times it became difficult to collect reflections and reports on time. Had there been some incentives and rewards attached to it,
the students would have put in more effort in not only composing the reflections but also in timely submission of reflection writing.
LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS

References


LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS


LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS


LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS


LEARNING BEYOND CLASSROOMS


Appendix A

Semi-Structured Individual Interviews: Phase I of the Research

Q1. What goals did you have in mind when you went for the internship?
Q2. How were you mentored by your organization?
Q3. Do you think the internships are effective?
Q4. Was there a pre-planned project for you when you went for your internship?
Q5. Do you think a faculty supervisor should be assigned for the interns?
Q6. How useful were the courses taught to you at your institute in the internship setting?
Q7. How can the internships be improved?
Appendix B

Semi-Structured Individual Interview Questions: On-Job Supervisors

(Phase II of The Research)

Q1. What goals do you have in mind when you were inducting an intern?
Q2. What were these criteria for intern selection?
Q3. To what extend were you able to achieve the goals that you had in mind for the intern?
Q4. What responsibilities did you exactly give him?
Q5. How well was your organization able to mentor him/her?
Q6. Was he/she well prepared for the internship?
Q7. How can the internships be improved?
Semi-Structured Individual Interview Questions: Head, Alumni, Placement and International Cooperation Department  
(Phase II of the Research)

Q1. What are the responsibilities of your department?  
Q2. How do you assess an intern’s progress?  
Q3. How do you make sure that an internship experience is a fruitful one?  
Q4. Should internships be considered a course?
Semi-Structured Focus Group Interview Questions
(Phase II of the Research)

Q1. What goals did you have in mind when you went for the internship?
Q2. To what extent did you achieve your goals?
Q3. How did goal setting help you achieve your goals?
Q4. What role did the reflection writing play in your internship experience?
Q5. How were you mentored by your interning organization?
Q6. Was there a pre-planned project for you when you went for your internship?
Q7. Do you think a faculty supervisor should be assigned for the interns?
Q8. How useful were the courses taught to you at your institute in the internship setting?
Q9. How useful was the internship for you?
Q10. How can the internships be improved?
INTRODUCTION

This Student Internship Manual provides instructions and guidelines that are required for the successful completion of your internship. Make sure to read this manual carefully prior to the beginning of your internship experience so that if there are any queries and concerns, they may be looked into before you begin your internship experience.

This manual will help you go through the rich experience of the internship through motivation and self-learning techniques; thus following this manual will instill lifelong learning in you. The assignments you get during the internship period will augment your academic experience through first-hand experience. It will also help you to realize your readiness to step into the real world through observing and coming in contact with real life problems and with different behaviors, yet in a supervised setting.

Such experience is of vital importance to students in two main areas:

1. Gain Valuable Work Experience in the Chosen Field of Interest

An internship is a great way to gain hands on work experience, develop specific skills and knowledge as well as to network with people from the students’ chosen field. Moreover, employers assess the skills and abilities of prospective employees by evaluating their previous experience. Students pursue career-related opportunities prior to graduation, thereby, obtaining an edge over other candidates in the competitive job market.

2. Decide on Right Careers Prior to Graduation

An internship provides a more accurate picture of what individuals do in certain professions. After experiencing a particular job environment and observing what it entails, students may decide if this is the right career for them. The internship is compulsory for all MBA, BBA, and BS final year students, and has a minimum duration of six consecutive weeks. Executive students are exempted from the internship program.
THE INTERNSHIP COMMITMENT
Once you have registered for the internship program via IoBM Corporate office, you are now committed to actively take part in the internship.

The university as well as your sponsors have entrusted your abilities to work the internship sponsors, to be able to meet their requirements and work diligently using all your capacity. Your internship sponsor has sponsored you believing that you have the professional potential that is required for the tasks that they have allotted to you; therefore, it becomes fundamental for you to honor the commitment and responsibility that comes with the internship.

Your first responsibility is towards yourself, to continuously work towards developing your skills and behaviors in a manner suitable to the job market.

Second, you are responsible to show high level of commitment and motivation to the sponsor company and to professionally complete all tasks assigned to you. It should be kept in mind that turning in assignments late or incomplete affects the organizational productivity and proficiency negatively.

Third, you have an obligation towards the IoBM corporate office and IoBM to represent them in best manners through your best of abilities and by engaging in ethically approved behaviors. Finally, while your internship sponsor and the IoBM Corporate Office are working hard to help you to achieve your educational goals and objectives; yet, you must remember that your internship will only be successful through your personal initiative, effort and commitment.
GUIDELINES FOR FACULTY SUPERVISORS

A faculty coordinator’s job is to provide a link between the university and the internee’s workplace. Not only are you helping the internees get through the on-job hurdles, but you are also adding to your own knowledge by observing how companies work and thus your feedback will be valuable for your institution as well.

The role

It is a student’s job to look for an internship, nevertheless, as a faculty coordinator you can give him/her your suggestions and also use your contact to get him/her a position in a company as an intern. It is the responsibility of the faculty coordinator to help students in formulating their goals and objectives as per. A faculty coordinator helps the student formulate learning objectives using the rubrics in appendix 2 and serves as a support to the intern during the internship experience. At the end, the faculty supervisor provides formal evaluation of the reflections of the students and the report written by the student using appendixes D and F respectively.

Assistance with the learning contract

It is very important for the faculty supervisor to make sure that all the activities taking place at the internship are according to the goals and objectives of the internee. On the other hand, the activities that are not according to the student objectives such as reading or researching may also add to student knowledge and that must be highlighted to the students so that they may not rate these activities as useless.

Faculty members should ask interns to keep a journal or a log in which an intern is able to reflect on the activities in a precise manner using his/her critical approach. This journal should be submitted regularly to the faculty supervisor.

Contact with on-job supervisor

The faculty coordinator should make contact with the on-job supervisor at the beginning of the internship to understand the duties given to the intern and then one call after 2 weeks to check the intern’s progress. The faculty supervisor should give a random visit to see how the internee is coping with the work assigned to him/her.
GUIDELINES FOR THE ON-JOB SUPERVISORS

The on-job supervisor for an IoBM intern is responsible for the intern’s work activity and schedule. The on-job supervisor will facilitate the transition between academic studies and the workplace responsibilities.

The students of IoBM have the capacity to provide the organization where they intern, with assistance and fresh perspective through their creative ideas if their talents are used in the right direction. The on-job supervisor will take full benefit of their potential by taking them beyond their classroom learning. Some of the responsibilities are given below:

1. The on-job supervisor should help students develop a learning contract which is an outline of what the intern aims to learn during the internship and how will be these achieved through the work allotted to him/her.

2. The on-job supervisor will see to it that the learning goals established by the students are realistic and achievable.

3. Since the interns are with the organization for a small period of time, therefore literature regarding the organization and function of the company should be shared with them beforehand. This will help the internees find their place in the big picture.

4. Appropriate physical arrangements should be made beforehand regarding the work space and equipment, and provide other appropriate materials.

5. The faculty coordinator and the on-job supervisor should remain in contact to monitor the internee’s progress.

6. The on-job supervisor should fill in the evaluation form provided by IoBM and promptly return it to the faculty supervisor.
Appendix I

Reflective Writing Guiding Questions

(a) What did I learn?
(b) How, specifically, did I learn it?
(c) Why does this learning matter, or why is it significant?
(d) In what ways will I use this learning; or what goals shall I set in accordance with what I have learned in order to improve myself, the quality of my learning, or the quality of my future experiences or service?
(e) What goals could not be achieved?
(f) How do I plan to achieve this goal?
Appendix J

Reflective Writing Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>completely lacking (1)</th>
<th>under-developed (2)</th>
<th>good (3)</th>
<th>excellent (4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy</td>
<td>Consistently makes inaccurate statements and/or fails to provide supporting evidence for claims</td>
<td>Makes several inaccurate statements and/or supports few statements with evidence</td>
<td>Usually but not always makes statements that are accurate and well supported with evidence</td>
<td>Consistently makes statements that are accurate and well supported with evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarity</td>
<td>Consistently fails to provide examples, to illustrate points, to define terms, and/or to express ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Only occasionally provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Usually but not always provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
<td>Consistently provides examples, illustrates points, defines terms, and/or expresses ideas in other ways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>Fails to address salient questions that arise from statements being made; consistently oversimplifies when making connections; fails to consider any of the complexities of the issue</td>
<td>Addresses few of the salient questions that arise from statements being made; often oversimplifies when making connections; considers little of the complexity of the issue</td>
<td>Addresses some but not all of the salient questions that arise from statements being made; rarely oversimplifies when making connections; considers some but not all of the full complexity of the issue</td>
<td>Thoroughly addresses salient questions that arise from statements being made; avoids oversimplifying when making connections; considers the full complexity of the issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breadth</td>
<td>Ignores or superficially considers alternative points of view and/or interpretations</td>
<td>Gives minimal consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes very limited use of them in shaping the learning being articulated</td>
<td>Gives some consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes some use of them in shaping the learning being articulated</td>
<td>Gives meaningful consideration to alternative points of view and/or interpretations and makes very good use of them in shaping the learning being articulated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairness</td>
<td>Consistently represents others’ perspectives in a biased or distorted way</td>
<td>Occasionally represents others’ perspectives in a biased or distorted way</td>
<td>Often but not always represents others’ perspectives with integrity</td>
<td>Consistently represents others’ perspectives with integrity (without bias or distortion)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>